

**Table 3: 2018 TRC-Plus and PAC Analysis and Ratios**

| Multi-Year TRC & PACT Scenarios              | 2018 Total Resource Acquisition & Low Income |                      |                         |                      |                    | TRC + 15% Societal Benefits |                     |                      | PACT + 15% Societal Benefits |                     |                      |             |
|--|--|----------------------|-------------------------|----------------------|--------------------|-----------------------------|---------------------|----------------------|------------------------------|---------------------|----------------------|-------------|
|  | Participants or Units Installed              | Total NPV Benefits   | Total Incremental Costs | Total Variable Costs | Total Fixed Costs  | Total Administrative Costs  | TRC Total Costs     | TRC Net Benefit      | TRC Ratio                    | PACT Total Cost     | PACT Net Benefit     | PACT Ratio  |
| <b>Resource Acquisition &amp; Low Income</b> | <b>48,555</b>                                | <b>\$251,201,450</b> | <b>\$66,489,040</b>     | <b>\$36,353,379</b>  | <b>\$8,414,927</b> | <b>\$10,334,976</b>         | <b>\$85,238,943</b> | <b>\$165,962,507</b> | <b>2.95</b>                  | <b>\$55,103,282</b> | <b>\$196,098,168</b> | <b>4.56</b> |
| Resource Acquisition                         | 45,988                                       | \$231,543,744        | \$57,102,463            | \$28,142,333         | \$6,385,477        | \$7,985,813                 | \$71,473,753        | \$160,069,991        | 3.24                         | \$42,513,623        | \$189,030,121        | 5.45        |
| Low Income                                   | 2,567  | \$19,657,706         | \$9,386,577             | \$8,211,046          | \$2,029,450        | \$2,349,163                 | \$13,765,190        | \$5,892,516          | 1.43                         | \$12,589,659        | \$7,068,047          | 1.56        |
| <b>2018 Resource Acquisition</b>             |  |                      |                         |                      |                    |                             |                     |                      |                              |                     |                      |             |
| Resource Acquisition TRC Scenarios           | Participants or Units Installed              | Total NPV Benefits   | Total Incremental Costs | Total Variable Costs | Total Fixed Costs  | Total Administrative Costs  | TRC Total Costs     | TRC Net Benefit      | TRC Ratio                    | PACT Total Cost     | PACT Net Benefit     | PACT Ratio  |
| <b>Large Customers</b>                       |  |                      |                         |                      |                    |                             |                     |                      |                              |                     |                      |             |
| Large Custom                                 | 739  | \$120,544,190        | \$34,066,705            | \$5,262,555          | \$1,287,579        | \$0                         | \$35,354,284        | \$85,189,905         | 3.41                         | \$6,550,134         | \$113,994,056        | 18.40       |
| Large Prescriptive                           | 4,234  | \$14,154,141         | \$634,864               | \$728,630            | \$574,046          | \$0                         | \$1,208,910         | \$12,945,231         | 11.71                        | \$1,302,676         | \$12,851,465         | 10.87       |
| <b>Small Customers</b>                       |  |                      |                         |                      |                    |                             |                     |                      |                              |                     |                      |             |
| Small Custom                                 | 106  | \$6,872,172          | \$4,904,950             | \$425,317            | \$386,111          | \$0                         | \$5,291,060         | \$1,581,112          | 1.30                         | \$811,427           | \$6,060,745          | 8.47        |
| Small Prescriptive                           | 1,867  | \$14,832,141         | \$280,012               | \$737,035            | \$193,194          | \$0                         | \$473,206           | \$14,358,935         | 31.34                        | \$930,229           | \$13,901,912         | 15.94       |
| Small DI                                     | 1,600  | \$12,713,263         | \$240,010               | \$3,502,583          | \$1,255,761        | \$0                         | \$1,495,771         | \$11,217,492         | 8.50                         | \$4,758,344         | \$7,954,920          | 2.67        |
| <b>Residential Adaptive Thermostats</b>      |  |                      |                         |                      |                    |                             |                     |                      |                              |                     |                      |             |
| Residential CER                              | 27,000                                       | \$16,094,082         | \$1,836,000             | \$2,025,000          | \$150,000          | \$0                         | \$1,986,000         | \$14,108,082         | 8.10                         | \$2,175,000         | \$13,919,082         | 7.40        |
| RA Overall TRC                               | 45,988                                       | \$231,543,744        | \$57,102,463            | \$28,142,333         | \$6,385,477        | \$7,985,813                 | \$71,473,753        | \$160,069,991        | 3.24                         | \$42,513,623        | \$189,030,121        | 5.45        |
| <b>2018 Low Income</b>                       |  |                      |                         |                      |                    |                             |                     |                      |                              |                     |                      |             |
| Low Income TRC Scenarios                     | Participants or Units Installed              | Total NPV Benefits   | Total Incremental Costs | Total Variable Costs | Total Fixed Costs  | Total Administrative Costs  | TRC Total Costs     | TRC Net Benefit      | TRC Ratio                    | PACT Total Cost     | PACT Net Benefit     | PACT Ratio  |
| Multi-Family Homes - Part 3                  | 257  | \$12,945,630         | \$5,282,740             | \$2,821,839          | \$991,457          | \$0                         | \$6,274,197         | \$6,671,434          | 2.06                         | \$3,813,296         | \$9,132,334          | 3.39        |
| Single Family Homes - Part 9                 | 2,310  | \$6,712,076          | \$4,103,837             | \$5,389,207          | \$1,037,993        | \$0                         | \$5,141,830         | \$1,570,246          | 1.31                         | \$6,427,200         | \$284,876            | 1.04        |
| LI Overall TRC                               | 2,567  | \$19,657,706         | \$9,386,577             | \$8,211,046          | \$2,029,450        | \$2,349,163                 | \$13,765,190        | \$5,892,516          | 1.43                         | \$12,589,659        | \$7,068,047          | 1.56        |

Witnesses: R. Idenouye  
 S. Moffat  
 F. Oliver Glasford  
 B. Ott  
 R. Sigurdson