Ontario Energy Board

P.O. Box 2319 27th Floor 2300 Yonge Street Toronto ON M4P 1E4 Telephone: 416- 481-1967 Facsimile: 416- 440-7656

Toll free: 1-888-632-6273

Commission de l'énergie de l'Ontario

C.P. 2319 27e étage 2300, rue Yonge Toronto ON M4P 1E4 Téléphone: 416- 481-1967

Télécopieur: 416- 440-7656 Numéro sans frais: 1-888-632-6273



#### BY E-MAIL AND WEB POSTING

October 15, 2015

To: All Licensed Electricity Distributors and Transmitters

All Gas Distributors

Ontario Power Generation Inc.

All Registered Intervenors in 2016 Cost of Service and Custom Incentive Rate-

setting Applications

### Re: Cost of Capital Parameter Updates for 2016 Applications

The Ontario Energy Board (OEB) has determined the values for the Return on Equity (ROE) and the deemed Long-Term (LT) and Short-Term (ST) debt rates for use in the 2016 applications. The ROE and the LT and ST debt rates are collectively referred to as the Cost of Capital parameters. The updated Cost of Capital parameters are calculated based on the formulaic methodologies documented in the *Report of the Board on the Cost of Capital for Ontario's Regulated Utilities* (the Cost of Capital Report), issued December 11, 2009.

#### **Cost of Capital Parameters for 2016 Rates**

For rates with effective dates in 2016, the OEB has updated the Cost of Capital parameters based on: (i) the September 2015 survey from Canadian banks for the spread over the Bankers' Acceptance rate of 3-month short-term loans for R1-low or A:-(A-stable) commercial customers, for the ST debt rate; and (ii) data three months prior to January 1, 2016 from the Bank of Canada, *Consensus Forecasts*, and Bloomberg LP, for all other Cost of Capital parameters.

The OEB has determined that the updated Cost of Capital parameters for rate applications for rates effective in 2016 are:

| Cost of Capital Parameter | Value for Applications for rate changes in 2016 |
|---------------------------|---|
| ROE                       | 9.19%   |
| Deemed LT Debt rate       | 4.54%   |
| Deemed ST Debt rate       | 1.65%   |

Detailed calculations of the Cost of Capital parameters are attached.

The OEB considers the Cost of Capital parameter values shown in the above table, and the relationships between them, to be reasonable and representative of market conditions at this time.

As documented in the Report of the Board on Rate Setting Parameters and Benchmarking under the Renewed Regulatory Framework for Ontario's Electricity Distributors (EB-2010-0379) issued November 21, 2013, the OEB now updates Cost of Capital parameters for setting rates once per year. For this reason, the Cost of Capital parameters above will be applicable for all cost of service and custom IR applications (as applicable) with rates effective in the 2016 calendar year.

The OEB monitors macroeconomic conditions and may issue updated parameters if economic conditions materially change. An applicant or intervenors can also file evidence in individual rate hearings in support of different Cost of Capital parameters due to the specific circumstances, but must provide strong rationale and supporting evidence for deviating from the OEB's policy.

All queries on the Cost of Capital parameters should be directed to the OEB's Industry Relations hotline, at 416 440 7604 or industryrelations@ontarioenergyboard.ca.

Yours truly,

Original Signed By

Kirsten Walli Board Secretary

Attachment

# Ontario Energy Board Commission de l'Énergie de l'Ontario

# **Attachment: Cost of Capital Parameter Calculations**

(For rate changes effective in 2016)

**Cost of Capital Parameter Calculations** Return on Equity and Deemed Long-term Debt Rate

Step 1: Analysis of Business Day Information in the Month

| Month:  | Sonton    |              | ,     |                   |            |            |
|---|-----------|--------------|-------|-------------------|------------|------------|
| Month: September 2015  Bond Yields (%) Bond Yield Spreads (%) |           |              |       | inreads (%)       |            |            |
|   |           | Governn      |       | A-rated           | 30-yr Govt | 30-yr Util |
|   |           | Cana         |       | Utility           | over 10-yr | over 30-yr |
|   | Day       | 10-yr        | 30-yr | 30-yr             | Govt       | Govt       |
| 1   | 1-Sep-15  | 1.43         | 2.18  | 4.06              | 0.75       | 1.88       |
| 2   | 2-Sep-15  | 1.45         | 2.21  | 4.08              | 0.76       | 1.87       |
| 3   | 3-Sep-15  | 1.46         | 2.22  | 4.09              | 0.76       | 1.87       |
| 4   | 4-Sep-15  | 1.44         | 2.20  | 4.07              | 0.76       | 1.87       |
| 5   | 5-Sep-15  |              |       |                   |            | 1          |
| 6   | 6-Sep-15  |              |       |                   |            | 1 1        |
| 7   | 7-Sep-15  |              |       |                   |            |            |
| 8   | 8-Sep-15  | 1.48         | 2.24  | 4.09              | 0.76       | 1.85       |
| 9   | 9-Sep-15  | 1.49         | 2.26  | 4.09              | 0.77       | 1.83       |
| 10  | 10-Sep-15 | 1.49         | 2.26  | 4.09              | 0.77       | 1.83       |
| 11  | 11-Sep-15 | 1.47         | 2.23  | 4.05              | 0.76       | 1.82       |
| 12  | 12-Sep-15 |              |       |                   |            |            |
| 13  | 13-Sep-15 |              |       |                   |            |            |
| 14  | 14-Sep-15 | 1.45         | 2.21  | 4.03              | 0.76       | 1.82       |
| 15  | 15-Sep-15 | 1.56         | 2.31  | 4.12              | 0.75       | 1.81       |
| 16  | 16-Sep-15 | 1.59         | 2.33  | 4.13              | 0.74       | 1.80       |
| 17  | 17-Sep-15 | 1.53         | 2.29  | 4.08              | 0.76       | 1.79       |
| 18  | 18-Sep-15 | 1.46         | 2.22  | 4.02              | 0.76       | 1.80       |
| 19  | 19-Sep-15 |              |       |                   |            | 1 1        |
| 20  | 20-Sep-15 |              |       |                   |            | 1 1        |
| 21  | 21-Sep-15 | 1.54         | 2.29  | 4.09              | 0.75       | 1.80       |
| 22  | 22-Sep-15 | 1.48         | 2.23  | 4.03              | 0.75       | 1.80       |
| 23  | 23-Sep-15 | 1.48         | 2.24  | 4.04              | 0.76       | 1.80       |
| 24  | 24-Sep-15 | 1.46         | 2.22  | 4.03              | 0.76       | 1.81       |
| 25  | 25-Sep-15 | 1.53         | 2.27  | 4.11              | 0.74       | 1.84       |
| 26  | 26-Sep-15 |              |       |                   |            |            |
| 27  | 27-Sep-15 |              |       |                   |            |            |
| 28  | 28-Sep-15 | 1.44         | 2.19  | 4.03              | 0.75       | 1.84       |
| 29  | 29-Sep-15 | 1.43         | 2.18  | 4.03              | 0.75       | 1.85       |
| 30  | 30-Sep-15 | 1.45         | 2.21  | 4.06              | 0.76       | 1.85       |
| 31  |           |              |       |                   |            |            |
|   |           | 1.48         | 2.24  | 4.07              | 0.756      | 1.831      |
|   | Sources:  | Bank of Ca   |       | Bloomberg L.P.    | 0.750      | 2          |
|   | Courous.  | 23/11/ 0/ 00 |       | 2.00///DOIG E./ . |            |            |

| eu Long   | term Debt Nate         |                         |                     |                 |  |  |
|---|------------------------|-------------------------|---------------------|-----------------|--|--|
| Step 2:   | 10-Year Governme       | nt of Canada Bond Yield | Forecast            |                 |  |  |
| Source:   | Consensus<br>Forecasts | Survey Date:            | September           | -07-15          |  |  |
| Septe   | mber 2015              | 3-month<br>1.700        | 12-month<br>2.200 € | Average 1.950 % |  |  |
| Step 3:   |                        |                         |                     |                 |  |  |
| 10 Yea<br>Step 2)   |                        | nada Concensus Foreca   | st (from 3          | 1.950 %         |  |  |
| Actual Spread of 30-year over 10-year Government of Canada 0 0.756 % Bond Yield (from Step 1)   |                        |                         |                     |                 |  |  |
| Long C  | anada Bond Foreca      | st (LCBF)               | 4                   | 2.706 %         |  |  |
| Step 4:   | Return on Equity (R    | OE) forecast            |                     |                 |  |  |
| Initial R   | OE                     |                         |                     | 9.75 %          |  |  |
| Change in Long Canada Bond Yield Forecast from September 2009  LCBF (September 2015) (from Step 3)  |                        |                         |                     |                 |  |  |
| Change in A-rated Utility Bond Yield Spread from September 2009 A-rated Utility Bond Yield Spread  © 1.831 % (September 2015) (from Step 1) Base A-rated Utility Bond Yield Spread  1.415 % |                        |                         |                     |                 |  |  |
| Differ  | rence<br>0.5 X Di      | fference                | 0.416 %             | 0.208 %         |  |  |
| Return on Equity based on September 2015 data 9.19 %  |                        |                         |                     |                 |  |  |
| Step 5: Deemed Long-term Debt Rate Forecast   |                        |                         |                     |                 |  |  |
| Long C<br>3)  | anada Bond Foreca      | st for September 2015 ( | from Step 《         | 2.706 %         |  |  |
| A-rated Utility Bond Yield Spread September 2015 (from Step 2 1.831 %   |                        |                         |                     |                 |  |  |

Deemed Long-term Debt Rate based on September 2015 data

4.54 %

# Ontario Energy Board Commission de l'Énergie de l'Ontario

# **Attachment: Cost of Capital Parameter Calculations**

(For rate changes effective in 2016)
Cost of Capital Parameter Calculations

Cost of Capital Parameter Calculations Deemed Short-term Debt Rate

Step 1: Average Annual Spread over Bankers
Acceptance

Once a year, in September, Board staff contacts prime Canadian banks to get estimates for the spread of short-term (typically 90-day) debt issuances over Bankers' Acceptance rates. Up to six estimates are provided.

| A. |        | Average Spread | Date of input |
|----|--------|----------------|---------------|
|    |        | over 90-day    |               |
|    |        | Bankers        |               |
|    |        | Acceptance     |               |
|    | Bank 1 | 100.0 bps      | Sept., 2015   |
|    | Bank 2 | 100.0 bps      | Sept., 2015   |
|    | Bank 3 | 82.5 bps       | Sept., 2015   |
|    | Bank 4 | 100.0 bps      | Sept., 2015   |
|    | Bank 5 | 80.0 bps       | Sept., 2015   |
|    | Bank 6 |                |               |

| В. | Discard high and low estimates If less than 4 estimates, take average without discarding high and low. |              |  |
|----|--|--------------|--|
|    | Number of estimates  | 5            |  |
|    | High estimate  | 100.0 bps    |  |
|    | Low estimate   | 80.0 bps     |  |
|    |  |              |  |
| C. | Average annual   | 94.167 bps • |  |

Step 3: Deemed Short-Term Debt Rate Calculation

Spread

Calculate Deemed Short-term debt rate as sum of average annual spread (Step 1) and average 3-month Bankers' Acceptance Rate (Step 2)

| Average Annual<br>Spread            | 0.942 % | • |
|-------------------------------------|---------|---|
| Average Bankers'<br>Acceptance Rate | 0.712 % | 2 |
| Deemed Short<br>Term Debt Rate      | 1.65 %  |   |

**Step 2:** Average 3-month Bankers' Acceptance Rate

Calculation of Average 3-month Bankers' Acceptance Rate during month of September 2015

| Month  | :  | September 2015                                      |  |
|--|--|---|--|
| 1 2  | <b>Day</b><br>1-Sep-15<br>2-Sep-15   | Bankers' Acceptance Rate (%) 3-month  0.68 % 0.68 % |  |
| 3<br>4<br>5<br>6<br>7                                      | 3-Sep-15<br>4-Sep-15<br>5-Sep-15<br>6-Sep-15<br>7-Sep-15                   | 0.68 %<br>0.68 %                                    |  |
| 8<br>9<br>10<br>11<br>12                                   | 8-Sep-15<br>9-Sep-15<br>10-Sep-15<br>11-Sep-15<br>12-Sep-15                | 0.68 %<br>0.68 %<br>0.70 %<br>0.71 %                |  |
| 13<br>14<br>15<br>16<br>17<br>18                           | 13-Sep-15<br>14-Sep-15<br>15-Sep-15<br>16-Sep-15<br>17-Sep-15<br>18-Sep-15 | 0.72 %<br>0.72 %<br>0.73 %<br>0.73 %<br>0.72 %      |  |
| 19<br>20<br>21<br>22<br>23<br>24<br>25                     | 19-Sep-15<br>20-Sep-15<br>21-Sep-15<br>22-Sep-15<br>23-Sep-15<br>24-Sep-15 | 0.73 %<br>0.73 %<br>0.72 %<br>0.73 %<br>0.73 %      |  |
| 26<br>27<br>28<br>29<br>30<br>31                           | 26-Sep-15<br>27-Sep-15<br>28-Sep-15<br>29-Sep-15<br>30-Sep-15              | 0.73 %<br>0.73 %<br>0.74 %                          |  |
| Source Bank of Canada / Statistics Canada<br>Series V39071 |  |   |  |

#### **Reference on Calculation Method:**

• Appendix D of the Report of the Board on Cost of Capital for Ontario's Regulated Utilities, issued December 11, 2009.