## EB-2015-0238 Distributor Gas Supply Planning Consultation Gas Supply Planning Comparison March 22, 2016

	Union	Enhridge	Difference / Pationale	Comments
1 Ohios		Libridge	Difference / Nationale	
1 Object	"The objective of Union's gas supply plan is to create an efficient supply portfolio that will meet the demands of sales service and bundled direct purchase ("DP") customers, while meeting the overall gas supply planning principles.  Union's gas supply plan provides the strategic direction guiding the Company's long-term supply acquisition process. The gas supply plan does not commit Union to the acquisition of a specific supply type or facility, nor does it preclude Union from pursuing a particular supply. Rather, the gas supply plan identifies the transportation and supply volume requirements to meet annual, seasonal and design day demand for sales service and bundled DP customers. Union recognizes that the gas supply planning process is dynamic, reflecting changing market forces."	"The objective of gas supply planning is to develop a portfolio of natural gas supply, transportation, and storage assets that provide for the safe, reliable, and cost effective delivery of natural gas to customers throughout the calendar year. A gas supply portfolio is structured first and foremost to meet demand for natural gas on peak day (i.e. the day of highest demand) along with seasonal demand for natural gas throughout the winter and summer months."	No material differences	FRPO — a. While the document conveys no material difference: EGD emphasizes the paramount importance of peak day, while Union notes annual, seasonal and daily. b. All in costs to deliver should be understood to make informed decisions. In Union's case, bringing in gas through Dawn requires incremental Dawn-Parkway build. These builds are occurring at close to twice the existing embedded rate. Further, feeding communities in the NDA from Dawn requires either short-haul FT or STS capacity to get gas from Dawn to the NDA in the winter (previously FT from Empress was used in the winter supplemented by STS). Union's new approach

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> EB-2015-0116, Exhibit A, Tab 3, 2015/16 Union's Gas Supply Plan Memorandum, September 2015, page 4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> EB-2015-0122, Exhibit D, Tab 4, Schedule 1 - 2014-2015 Enbridge's Gas Supply Plan Memorandum dated April 2015, page 5.

	Union	Enbridge	Difference / Rationale	Comments
				transportation cost which gets evaluated in landed cost to a storage cost which would be hidden from a landed cost perspective. Therefore, the all-in annualized cost to serve these northern service must be understood through evidence submission and approval by the Board. A similar effect is a concern in Enbridge's EDA but Enbridge has kept more FT capacity thus maintaining a more balanced approach.
2 Guiding	Principles			
Inherent Risks	The gas supply planning process manages inherent supply of natural gas will be available within the lo customer needs. The inherent risks include reliabil dynamics, price volatility and cost. Although risks mitigated by applying Board approved methodolog planning principles when establishing the portfolio	cal distribution company's franchise area to meet lity, supply interruption, changing supply are not entirely eliminated, the inherent risks are gies and a balanced application of gas supply		
Criteria	The goal of the gas supply plan is to ensure that customers that rely on Union for gas supply and upstream transportation service receive secure, diverse gas supply at a prudently incurred cost. Union uses a balance of the principles to develop the gas supply plan portfolio and manage the associated risks and gas costs. The gas supply guiding principles were reviewed by Sussex Economic Advisors and accepted by the Board in EB-2013-0109 and are discussed below.	Enbridge uses a balance of 4 principles to develop the gas supply plan portfolio and manage the associated risks and gas costs. A balance implies that the principles do not always align with each other and at times require a degree of judgement when being applied to gas supply planning. For example, the most cost effective transportation portfolio would typically include only the single lowest landed cost path. However, in order to maintain diversity, flexibility and reliability, other transportation paths that may not have the lowest landed cost are included in the portfolio.	No material differences	

	Union	Enbridge	Difference / Rationale	Comments
	Ensure secure and reliable gas supply to	The principles and the inherent risks have been discussed by Enbridge in a variety of forums including the 2014-2015 Gas Supply Planning Memorandum <sup>3</sup> and are captured below.  1. Reliability – Enbridge is the "supplier of last	No material differences.	FRPO-
Guiding Principles	Union's service territory - Union has an obligation to ensure its firm sales service customers have access to secure and reliable gas supply sources as well as ensuring sufficient firm transportation for Union North bundled DP customers. Union ensures adequate firm transportation capacity is available on a sustained basis to meet firm design day and annual demands through transportation capacity contractual rights.  Union is the supplier of last resort and this guiding principle mitigates the risk of customers not having ongoing access to gas supply when needed. The gas supply plan ensures firm transportation capacity is available to meet design day demands for Union North sales service and bundled DP customers, while ensuring Union South customers' annual demands are met.  2. Minimize risk by diversifying contract terms, supply basins and upstream pipelines - Union's current upstream transportation portfolio and related supply are diversified with respect to supply basin access, gas supply producers and marketers, contract term and transportation service provider.  Having diversity of producer, pipeline and basin mitigates the risk of customers not having access to gas supply when needed as a	resort" and as a result supplies are sourced from established liquid hubs and transported to the markets served by Enbridge via firm transportation contracts in order to mitigate delivery interruption;  2. Diversity – Mitigates reliability and cost risks by procuring supplies from multiple procurement points and transporting supplies to market and/or storage through several different paths; and  3. Flexibility – Manages shifting demand requirements through differentiated supply procurement patterns and provides operational flexibility through service attributes and contract parameters.	Both utilities consider reliability, diversity and flexibility in their respective gas supply portfolios.	a. Criteria – Union speaks of diversity but is not concerned that over 90% of deliveries for Union South originate at Dawn – what criteria does Union have for path diversity in the winter? What does SENDOUT use as constraints? b. As mentioned objectives, the total costs of feeding delivery areas must be understood as opposed to landed costs. c. Inherent risks – an aspect of economic prudency is accessing supply at source and supply closer to market minimizing exposure to unforeseen circumstances and the potential for stranded assets. Said differently, if a utility sources all gas in the supply field, unforeseen circumstances and market evolution may make that decision uneconomic (e.g., Alliance). Buying a portion of the portfolio to the delivery or market area

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Ibid, page 8

Union	Enbridge	Difference / Rationale	Comments
result of an outage on a pipeline, supply constraint at a certain basin, or producer/marketer non-performance.  Varying contract terms ensure the portfolio is flexible enough to adjust to changing supply dynamics and mitigates pricing anomalies associated with any one supply basin ensuring the portfolio continues to be at a reasonable cost.  3. Encourage new sources of supply as well as new infrastructure to Union's service territory - Union continues to seek new sources of cost-effective supplies to serve its customer base either through accessing new supply sources with existing infrastructure or participating in longer-term projects to encourage the development of new infrastructure to and through Ontario.  This guiding principle provides diverse gas supply at a prudently incurred cost and enhances diversity and reliability.  Encouraging new infrastructure will add new supplies and create and/or enhance			allows the utility to balance its portfolio and take advantage of the market working to reduce costs. It is accepted that this approach could result in some higher costs of gas in some circumstances. However, so does buying the gas by choosing what is believed to be the better path in the short term and accepting a longer term contract with its inherent risks.
competition.	4 Landed Cost Delances are supply seets with	Enhvidge has a constate	
	<ol> <li>Landed Cost – Balances gas supply costs with the other principles and ensures low cost natural gas supply for customers.</li> </ol>	Enbridge has a separate guiding principle highlighting cost with a balance across the other principles.	
		As noted above, Union uses a balance of the principles to develop the gas supply plan portfolio and manage the associated risks and gas costs.	

	Union	Enbridge	Difference / Rationale	Comments
	<ul> <li>4. Meet planned peak day and seasonal gas delivery requirements</li> <li>Design day requirements – plan to provide the necessary service to sales service and bundled DP customers on the day of highest anticipated demand in each delivery area in Union North and Union South.</li> <li>Seasonal/annual requirements – plan to be able to meet the annual requirements of infranchise consumption demands while balancing the summer / winter load changes through supply and the use of storage assets.</li> <li>This guiding principle mitigates the risk of customers not having access to sufficient gas supply on the coldest day, while also utilizing the available storage to meet the seasonal / annual requirements.</li> <li>5. Deliver gas to various receipt points on Union's system to maintain system integrity - The Union South transportation portfolio has delivery points at Dawn, Parkway, Kirkwall, St. Clair and Ojibway. In addition to the physical connections Union has with adjoining pipelines, it is also Union's practice to contractually receive gas at multiple points.</li> <li>This guiding principle reduces Union's reliance on one receipt point for all of its gas supplies. A system interruption or upset would not cause a complete supply failure to Union's</li> </ul>	Enbridge	The Gas Supply Planning process contemplates design day and seasonal / annual demand requirements for both companies.  Union has a separate guiding principle that specifically identifies the need to meet planned peak day and seasonal gas delivery requirements.  Enbridge contemplates meeting design day and seasonal / annual demand in the overarching objectives of the gas supply plan.  Union has a separate guiding principle to maintain system integrity, Enbridge addresses this through the specific guiding principles of Reliability, Diversity and Flexibility	Comments
3 Planning	system.			
5 Fiaililling	Union prepares a 5-year rolling gas supply plan	Prior to developing a gas supply plan, Enbridge	No material differences	FRPO - While the LDC's run
Gas Supply Plan	that is updated annually, with the primary focus being the first two years.  The 2 year planning horizon ensures that a	conducts an annual design day and baseload day demand analysis over a 5 year planning horizon with the primary focus being the first two years.  A main purpose of these analyses is to determine		a 5 year model of SENDOUT, the output is not in front of the Board as evidence nor for approval.

	Union	Enbridge	Difference / Rationale	Comments
	complete gas year cycle is taken into account as the gas supply plan is developed.  The timeframe to develop the gas supply plan spans approximately 9 months. This is an involved and integrated process as shown in the 2015/16 Gas Supply Memorandum <sup>4</sup> , that is initiated with the preparation of the demand forecast that typically starts in February and culminates with the gas supply memorandum being filed with the Board as part of the annual rate application in September.	the expected demand in future years, in order to evaluate the renewal, addition and shedding of transportation and/or other market-based solutions to meet that demand.  Enbridge develops the gas supply plan over a 2 year planning horizon with the primary focus being on the first year. The 2 year planning horizon ensures that a complete storage management cycle is taken into account as the gas supply plan is developed. The primary focus is on the first year to correspond with the annual rate application that is filed with the Board.  The planning horizon to develop the gas supply plan spans approximately 9 months. This is an intensive process which is initiated with the development of a demand forecast that traditionally begins in February. The outputs and cost consequences of the gas supply plan that is developed are filed with the Board as part of the annual rate application in September.	Sincrence / Nationale	Other jurisdictions require that output reports are required to demonstrate robust analytics around alternatives. SENDOUT can generate summary reports to demonstrate the efficacy of proposed portfolio approaches relative to alternatives.
Contracting Decisions	The planning horizon for Union's contracting requirements is typically 2-3 years with a focus on contract renewal requirements (i.e. TransCanada has 2 year renewal requirements) and plans subsequent to contract expiry of upstream transportation capacity. In some cases, the planning horizon will be up to 15 years (or longer) if a long-term contract commitment is required to support capital investment and new infrastructure.  Union contemplates future trends and new infrastructure open seasons that may require longer term planning (i.e. NEXUS) and leaves a certain amount of flexibility should future	Contracting requirements are determined by Enbridge through an annual design day and baseload day demand analysis. The planning horizon for these analyses will correspond with the term of the arrangements being considered. In most cases, this will involve contract renewals which typically require a 2 year planning horizon. In situations where TransCanada Pipelines Limited ("TransCanada") has issued a Term-up Notice in accordance with their Firm Transportation Service Toll Schedule, the planning horizon would be 5 years. When new transportation capacity is being considered, the planning horizon is longer. Where this involves new infrastructure, the planning horizon will	No material differences. Both utilities consider contracting decisions for the term of the gas supply planning horizon keeping in mind contracts may be longer than the term of the plan due to renewal provisions and the longer term nature of contracts supporting new infrastructure.	

 $<sup>^4</sup>$  EB-2015-0116, Exhibit A, Tab 3, 2015/16 Gas Supply Plan Memorandum, September 2015, Appendix A

		Union	Enbridge	Difference / Rationale	Comments
		demands change (i.e. Demand Side Management	range from 15 to 20 years as a result of the	Zincicine / italicinale	
		("DSM") or Cap and Trade impacts)	longer contract term commitment when new		
			capital investment is required.		
4	Current	& Future Trends (short/long-term) Influencing Gas	Supply Planning		
		Union monitors current and future trends to	Market trends and regulatory oversight have a	No material differences in	FRPO - With substantial
		anticipate the impacts on Union's upstream	significant influence on gas supply planning and	the process of identifying	increases in supply
		transportation portfolio and gas supply purchase	are monitored by Enbridge on a frequent basis.	and taking future trends	available to the market, the
		decisions including supply shifts, new	Some examples of current and future market	into consideration in the	market is supply driven.
		pipelines/infrastructure; system expansions;	trends and regulatory decisions that have, or	gas supply planning	This evolution should be
		migration to/from Direct Purchase; and	may in the future, an impact on Enbridge's gas	process.	recognized in the utilities
		commodity pricing in different basins.	supply planning are outlined below.		plans reflecting a balance in
			An increased use of annual transportation		gas purchased in the
		Future trends impacting the gas supply plan are	services to replace seasonal transportation		market as opposed to all at
		reviewed at Natural Gas Market Reviews by the	services, such as Short Term Firm		source. Buying all gas at
		OEB and intervenors and where appropriate and	Transportation, as a result of unlimited		source is not a balanced
		are included as part for the Gas Supply Plan	pricing flexibility being applied to		risk-managed position. In
		Memorandum. Some examples of market trends	discretionary services on the TransCanada		fact, it can lead to higher
		and regulatory decisions that have, or may in the	Mainline.		costs of excess
		future, impact on gas supply planning include:	Changes to the direction of flow and distance		underutilized capacity
		Conversion of long-haul transportation to	of haul for transportation services that are		which can be optimized for
		short-haul transportation	used to meet market demands as a result of		shareholder benefit and
		<ul> <li>NEXUS transport and access to Utica</li> </ul>	incremental market access to more		some level of consumer
		Marcellus Supply in close proximity to Union	proximate natural gas supply being produced		cost mitigation.
		Less reliance on discretionary services due to	from evolving shale formations.		Changes in the location of
		changing TransCanada operations and	An increase in the renewal term for existing		supply source primarily
		discretionary service availability and pricing.	transportation contracts on the TransCanada		driven by Appalachian gas
			Mainline as a result of increased focus on		have resulted in many
		Union participates in the annual Natural Gas	discretionary capacity management on the		pipelines in Northeast
		Market Review and works with ICF (a consultant)	TransCanada Mainline.		North America by
		to identify and track trends. The impacts are	An increase in long-term contract		becoming bi-directional.
		reflected in the gas supply plan as transportation	commitments for new transportation		The LDC's ought to be
		contracting decisions are made.	capacity as a result of increased focus on		required to demonstrate why increasing supply from
			discretionary capacity management on the		these sources should not
			TransCanada Mainline and the need for		be a growing part of their
			infrastructure investments that provide		respective portfolios. We
			market access to more proximate natural gas		appreciate Enbridge's
			supply being produced from evolving shale		positive step in that
			formations		direction with significant
					commitment to Niagara
<u> </u>					communicate to Magara

	Union	Enbridge	Difference / Rationale	Comments
			Difference / Nationale	delivery and we would encourage further consideration of Iroquois. On the other hand, Union continues to maintain only a small commitment to Niagara. Among Union's stated reasons for not increasing commitments at Niagara was the lack of incremental capacity from Niagara. However, TCPL presented its expansion plans for the Niagara to Kirkwall line showing a low cost solution to add 400 to 500 TJ's per day. In our view, requiring the LDC's to demonstrate a thorough evaluation of alternatives in its long term plans will reduce the risk of the Board approving another long term contract without complete information.
5 Gas Supp	ply Planning Inputs			
Demand – Annual	The monthly demand forecast for the upcoming 3 year period is updated annually to reflect projected changes in consumption and to reflect an additional year of weather using Board-approved weather normalized methodology (50:50 blended approach of the 20-year declining trend and the 30-year average methodology - per Union's 2013 Cost of Service, EB-2011-0210), net of Demand Side Management ("DSM").  The annual demand forecast assumes no migration between sales service and bundled DP customers subsequent to April 1 for the	Annual demand is largely a function of forecasted weather conditions. Enbridge determines the budget weather using separate Board approved methodologies by weather zone which includes:  • Central – 50% based on a 10-year moving average and 50% based on a 20-year trend forecast;  • Eastern – de Bever with trend regression considers 5 year weighted averages within a weather cycle; and  • Niagara – 10 year moving average.  The annual forecast methodology for budget	No material differences in the process to derive the annual demand forecast.  The weather normalization methodology is based on the uniqueness of each utility as approved by the Board. Both Union and Enbridge continue to evaluate the weather normalization methodology to assess the reasonableness of the	FRPO - a. Demand Sensitivity analysis for: 1. Seasonal load balancing e.g., +/- 10% heating degree days over the winter season to simulate supply alternatives. 2. For pipeline constrained areas: apply a band of a sensitivity of around growth projections to ensure security of supply while considering

	Union	Enbridge	Difference / Rationale	Comments
	Union  upcoming year.  The annual demand forecast includes compressor fuel and company used gas offset by customer supplied compressor fuel forecast and unaccounted for gas forecast.	demand takes into consideration the volumetric impacts of Demand Side Management ("DSM") and Unaccounted for gas forecasts and assumes no migration of bundled Direct Purchase ("DP") customers and sales service. Enbridge determines the annual budget demand by customer type as follows:  • General service budget demand forecast based on average use regression analysis and projected number of customers; and  • Contract market budget demand forecast based on grass roots approach for existing customers and probability-weighted approach for expected customers.  In order to utilize the annual budget demand in the gas supply planning process, it is disaggregated into a daily demand profile.	methodology.  Within the Gas Supply Plan, Union uses a monthly demand profile for annual and seasonal supply requirements; Enbridge derives a daily demand profile for the same purpose.	alternative solutions (e.g., market based service, targeted DSM). b. supply  Constraints added to the SENDOUIT model to balance commodity purchased in supply field vs. amount bought in the market area. c. Transportation  Seek and analyze pricing for market based solution alternatives. d. storage What analytics has Union done, SENDOUT or otherwise to determine if additional storage beyond excess over average for infranchise customers? e. balancing approach for DP customers  Union notes that all load balancing costs are borne by DP customers. What does Union analyze to ensure that some of those
				costs should not be borne by system gas customers?
Demand - Design Day	Design day demand is based on the coldest observed degree day in history (EB-2013-0109) for Union's delivery areas:  • 43.1 HDD - Union South  • 56.1 HDD - WDA  • 54.7 HDD - Fort Frances (MDA)  • 48.2 HDD - SSMDA	Design day demand is developed for each weather zone through regression analysis of driver variables and Board approved Design Criteria.  The driver variables that are used to determine the peak day demand include:  • Heating degree days;	No material differences in the process to derive the design day demand, although the inputs and the level of risk inherent in the Design Criteria are different.	OEB - Rational for chosen approach in developing heating degree day. Describe in more detail.  Energy Probe - This matter has been reviewed previously (Navigant). We

	Union	Enbridge	Difference / Rationale	Comments
	• 49.0 HDD - NCDA	One day lagged heating degree days;	Union manages to the	suggest that based on peer
	• 51.9 HDD - NDA	Wind speed; and	coldest observed day.	group reviews, statistical
	• 47.1 HDD - EDA	Customer unlocks.	There is a risk that actual	analysis should be used and
			weather could exceed what	be common to both Union
	Union develops a trend line using the daily firm	Board approved Design Criteria is also used to	is reflected in Union's Gas	and Enbridge (unless this is
	customer consumption from the prior winter and	determine the design profile which includes:	Supply Plan.	not demonstrated to be
	the associated daily degree day data, wind speed	• 1 in 5 recurrence interval (based on a log-		appropriate due to physical
	adjusted. Union extrapolates the calculated	normal distribution) for Peak and Multi-Peak	Enbridge manages to	market differences).
	trend line to the coldest observed degree day	degree days	heating degree days that	Determining the
	resulting in the estimated design day demand for	Peak Day Heating Degree Days:	are statistically determined	appropriate
	each delivery area.	<ul> <li>41.4 in the Central weather zone</li> </ul>	through a 1 in 5 recurrence	methodology(ies) should be
		<ul> <li>48.2 in the Eastern weather zone</li> </ul>	interval over a log-normal	a matter for review in the
	For Union North, design day demand is for the	<ul> <li>38.8 in the Niagara weather zone</li> </ul>	distribution. This approach	next rebasing Applications.
	total firm requirement of the in-franchise sales	• 18 Multi-Peaks over the months of January,	was approved by the Board	
	service and bundled DP customers. T-service	February, and March for each of the Central,	in Enbridge's 2013 Rate	
	customers provide their own upstream	Niagara, and Eastern weather zones.	Case (EB-2011-0354).	
	transportation service.	_		
			Since the Design Criteria for	
	As noted by Sussex Economic Advisors in the Gas		Enbridge does not include	
	Supply Planning Review filed in EB-2013-0109		the coldest observed day,	
	Exhibit C, Tab 2,		there is a greater	
	"the use of the coldest temperature observed is		probability or risk that	
	reasonable as Union has experienced weather		actual weather could	
	close to the coldest observed in all the gas supply		exceed what has been	
	planning areas; and it is consistent with the		planned for when	
	practice of the LDCs in the Sussex benchmarking		compared to Union. If	
	analysis."		Enbridge were to align to	
			the coldest observed day,	
	Sussex also noted that of the 21 companies		the peak heating degree	
	considered in their benchmarking analysis, 12 of		day would be higher and	
	21 utilized the coldest day observed approach.		additional assets would be	
	Hatan to dealer a server start to	Fallatidas trabadas konsus (1917)	required.	
	Union includes contracted transportation	Enbridge includes transportation inputs based on	No material differences.	
	capacity during the gas supply plan period and	parameters contained in precedent agreements	Both utilities include	
	contracts are reviewed to understand renewal	and transportation agreements such as receipt	contracted transportation	
<b>T</b> ransportati	expectations. The tolls and fuel ratios for the	point(s), delivery points(s), contract demand,	agreements and associated	
on	transportation capacity are provided from the	start date, and expiry date. The tolls and fuel	tolls.	
	transportation agreement or through approved	ratios for the transportation capacity are		
	toll schedules provided by the service provider.	obtained from the transportation agreement (as		
	For Union North the unstream transportation	applicable) or through approved toll schedules provided by the service provider.		
	For Union North, the upstream transportation	provided by the service provider.		

	Union	Enbridge	Difference / Rationale	Comments
	capacity is first sized to meet the winter design day demand requirement and then filled to meet supply requirement on the day and for the year. As a result, a portion of Union North's contract capacity is planned to be unutilized during the year resulting in planned Unabsorbed Demand Charges ("UDC").			
Supply	Union includes supply inputs based on the various supply basins associated with contracted transportation capacity and supply is priced at the most recent Quarterly Rate Adjustment Mechanism ("QRAM") 21-day strip pricing for the gas supply plan forecast period.	Enbridge includes supply inputs based on commodity prices for supply hubs associated with contracted transportation capacity using monthly natural gas forward curves from independent third parties for a 21 day average settlement price for each forward contract month.	No material differences. Both utilities include the cost of supply in the gas supply plan based on the pricing methodology used in the QRAM process.	
Storage	Union includes the storage requirement for sales service and bundled DP customers based on the aggregate excess methodology (Storage Allocation Methodology approved in Natural Gas Electricity Interface Review ("NGEIR") – EB-2005-0551). Consistent with the NGEIR Decision, the allotment of storage space to in-franchise customers (including sales service, bundled DP, unbundled and T-service) is 100 PJ. Excess infranchise space is sold as short term storage for the upcoming gas year. The gas supply plan targets control points throughout the winter including:  • November 1 <sup>st</sup> - the plan assumes inventory is full based on aggregate excess methodology (except for integrity);  • February 28 <sup>th</sup> – the plan assumes sufficient inventory is available to meet design day needs; and  • March 31 <sup>st</sup> - the plan assumes storage is empty (except for integrity).  System integrity capacity approved in the EB-2011-0210 Decision includes 3.5 PJ of system integrity space (empty) on October 31 <sup>st</sup> and 6.0 PJ of system integrity supply available for March 31 <sup>st</sup> . In total, of the 100 PJ of storage for	Enbridge's gas supply plan includes 97.8 PJ of underground storage at Tecumseh near Corunna in southwestern Ontario and at Crowland near Welland in the Niagara Region. The deliverability for these facilities is a function of the volume of natural gas in storage and is provided at cost of service. In addition to these facilities, Enbridge also has contracted for 24.4 PJ of storage capacity with third party providers that include contractually specified deliverability at market based rates.  New storage deliverability targets were established in the 2015 Rate Application under EB-2014-0289 and include:  • Maximum storage deliverability to be maintained to the end of February  • Storage deliverability required to meet the March peak demand to be maintained to end of March  Despite the new storage deliverability targets and increased heat sensitive load leading to a "peakier" load profile, the volume of storage in Enbridge's gas supply plan has remained relatively constant. These changes are currently being managed by increasing gas supply	Union has system integrity capacity and system integrity molecules in the gas supply plan whereas Enbridge does not.  The volume and deliverability of storage available in the gas supply plan for both utilities is different.	

	Union	Enbridge	Difference / Rationale	Comments
	infranchise customers, 9.5 PJ is reserved for system integrity.  Inputs into the gas supply plan include the Daily Contract Quantity ("DCQ") and receipt point obligations for bundled DP customers and the forecast consumption profile and use of load balancing gas. The DCQ is calculated using weather normalized annual consumption divided by 365. As indicated above, the annual demand forecast assumes no migration between sales service and bundled DP subsequent to April 1 for the upcoming year.  From an operational perspective, any difference between deliveries and consumption is tracked in a Banked Gas Account ("BGA") for each bundled DP customer. For Union South, bundled	purchases earlier in the winter season and reducing gas supply purchases later in the winter season in order to maintain sufficient storage inventory balances.  The gas supply plan assumes that bundled DP customers will consume natural gas in accordance with their contractually specified consumption profile and as a result will have no volume in their Banked Gas Account ("BGA") at the end of the contract term. It is also assumed in the plan that there will be no migration between the various bundled DP and sales services.  From an operational perspective, bundled DP customers deliver natural gas supply to Enbridge based on a contractually defined Mean Daily Volume ("MDV") over the contract term. Any variance between the deliveries received by	No material differences in supply planning assumptions as both utilities assume that bundled DP demand and supply are equal within the gas supply plan.  From an operational perspective, Union and Enbridge have different balancing requirements that reflect the differences in the gas supply portfolio and use of assets for each	Comments
Balancing Approach for DP customers	the upcoming year.  From an operational perspective, any difference between deliveries and consumption is tracked in a Banked Gas Account ("BGA") for each	From an operational perspective, bundled DP customers deliver natural gas supply to Enbridge based on a contractually defined Mean Daily Volume ("MDV") over the contract term. Any	perspective, Union and Enbridge have different balancing requirements that reflect the differences in the gas supply portfolio	
	balancing transactions or financial balancing with Union.  Union has the obligation to balance consumption and weather variances on behalf of bundled DP customers:  • that do not meet checkpoint;  • for weather variances after the checkpoint balancing actions are communicated; and		South provides DP customers the opportunity to manage the costs of balancing to contracted BGA checkpoints.	

	Union	Enbridge	Difference / Rationale	Comments
6 Gas Sup	for weather and consumption variances outside of the balancing checkpoints.  Any load balancing costs incurred by Union are recovered from bundled DP customers.  ply Planning Outputs			
Transportati	<ul> <li>The gas supply plan identifies:         <ul> <li>Incremental transportation capacity requirements for annual demand. For Union South, shortfalls in supply are identified in the gas supply plan as "uncommitted" and are priced at Dawn subject to final transportation contracting decisions;</li> <li>Incremental design day transportation capacity requirements for Union North; and</li> <li>Planned unutilized transportation capacity for Union North resulting in UDC.</li> <li>Subsequent to plan completion, Union evaluates how to meet any transportation capacity requirement shortfalls by contracting for incremental upstream transportation capacity, purchasing supply at Dawn, or through market based solutions.</li> <li>Union South – gas supply plan only contemplates the annualized supply. Design day demand for Union South is the total firm requirement of all in-franchise customers (including T-service). The gas supply plan is an input to meeting design day requirements as supply, storage and transmission assets are utilized to meet design day as part of the Storage and Transmission System Plans.</li></ul></li></ul>	Enbridge's gas supply plan includes the portfolio of transportation that is needed to meet the demand that is determined through the annual design day and baseload day demand analysis described above in section 3. The transportation portfolio includes existing and renewed contracts as well as new capacity. When evaluating options for the transportation portfolio to meet annual design day demand, Enbridge takes each of its 4 gas supply planning principles into consideration in addition to a strategic view of natural gas market conditions.  Once the portfolio of assets is established, it is used to develop the gas supply plan. The portfolio that is required to meet design demand is optimized to meet annual and seasonal demand. The key principle applied in this part of the process is landed cost – Enbridge evaluates and determines which assets should be used throughout the year to achieve the lowest cost outcome.	No material differences in the outputs in the gas supply plan. Both utilities contemplate capacity requirements to meet design day and annual and seasonal demand and how the capacity will be utilized on a planned basis.	FRPO - In our view, the key to ensuring the appropriate analyzation of the right balance of gas management solutions is in the effective input of a range of parameters and alternatives complete with the reporting of the results to plan for robust, cost effective solutions. These outputs would report at a summary level on all of the below parameters with cost estimates demonstrating superior solutions at right level of calculated risk.

	Union	Enbridge	Difference / Rationale	Comments
	delivery to and from storage including STS, short-haul, and enhanced market balancing services on TransCanada.			
Commodity Portfolio	The gas supply plan identifies total annual and seasonal supply requirements for Union South and for each delivery area in Union North based on the various supply basins associated with contracted transportation capacity. For Union South, shortfalls or "uncommitted" supply requirements are assumed to be purchased at Dawn in the gas supply plan subject to final transportation contracting decisions	Enbridge's gas supply plan identifies the planned procurement of supply at all available supply basins/hubs and the associated costs on a daily basis based on forecast demand and pricing.	No material differences	
Storage	Union's gas supply plan provides the planned injection and withdrawal volumes and the forecast monthly storage inventory position for sales service and bundled DP customers.	Enbridge's gas supply plan identifies the planned injection and withdrawal volumes, storage balances, and costs for all storage facilities and contracts on a daily basis pursuant to injection and withdrawal parameters and storage contract parameters.	No material differences	
Market Based Solutions	Union will purchase market based solutions to meet transportation capacity requirement shortfalls if firm capacity is not available (i.e. market based transportation service between Dominion South Point (Marcellus) and Dawn). Market based solutions can be exposed to price volatility and availability on an annual basis. Union typically will use a market based solution until a permanent solution can be found.	Enbridge will utilize market based solutions to mitigate supply deficiencies that are not addressed through contracted supply, transportation, and storage assets. Market based solutions may include, but are not limited to, curtailment, peaking supplies, delivered supplies, capacity assignments, and storage agreements underpinned by the purchase and sale of futures contracts rather than physical storage assets.	Both utilities may utilize market based solutions if appropriate.  Union does not have a formal curtailment service similar to Enbridge, as Union does not interrupt distribution service for supply management needs. This is managed by each individual customer due to the multi-point balancing requirements.	
7 Planning	Summary- Risk and Costs			
	A cost risk trade-off is not performed by Union as part of the annual gas supply plan because Union has the obligation to serve customers and needs firm assets to meet peak design day demand and annual balancing requirements.	The level of risk that is incorporated into Enbridge's gas supply plan is not determined when the gas supply plan is being developed. The level of risk is largely defined in advance of the gas supply plan development through the Board approved Design Criteria that are used to	The differences between Union and Enbridge have been identified in section 5.  As noted above, the Design Criteria approved for	FRPO - LDC's should be required to demonstrate analysis done on a variety of Sensitivity analysis using summary reports from SENDOUT as outlined

incurred cost.  The principles are designed to limit the risk of gas supply not being available when it is needed to meet annual, seasonal and design day delivery requirements. The gas supply plan is based on "normal weather". For Union North, the gas supply plan also considers assets required to ensure supply can be delivered on the coldest day (design day). Union's gas supply plan is fiexible and was effective in managing the warmest winter on record (winter 2011/12), as well the opposite extreme, the coldest winter on record (winter 2013/14). For Union South, assets are also designed to meet peak day, however the planning for peak day for Union South, assets are also designed to meet peak day, however the planning for peak day for Union South, assets are also designed to meet peak day, however the planning for peak day for Union South, assets are also designed to meet peak day, however the planning for peak day for Union South, assets are also designed to meet peak day, however the planning for peak day for Union South, assets are also designed to meet peak day, however the planning for peak day for Union South, assets are also designed to meet peak day, however the planning for peak day for Union South, assets are also designed to meet peak day, however the condest winter on record (winter 2011/12), as well the opposite extreme, the coldest winter on record in the coldest doserved day. Union says gas supply plan."  Design Criteria Demand Variance Above Budget cost light Budget	Union	Enbridge	Difference / Rationale	Comments
availability risk during periods of volatility.  measures such as the interruption of firm customers may be required to maintain the integrity of the distribution system.	Union follows the Board-approved gas supply planning principles to derive a gas supply plan which satisfies the goal of ensuring customers receive secure, diverse gas supply at a prudently incurred cost.  The principles are designed to limit the risk of gas supply not being available when it is needed to meet annual, seasonal and design day delivery requirements. The gas supply plan is based on "normal weather". For Union North, the gas supply plan also considers assets required to ensure supply can be delivered on the coldest day (design day). Union's gas supply plan is flexible and was effective in managing the warmest winter on record (winter 2011/12), as well the opposite extreme, the coldest winter on record (winter 2013/14). For Union South, assets are also designed to meet peak day, however the planning for peak day for Union South is outside the gas supply plan.  The gas supply plan is underpinned by Boardapproved methodologies, including system integrity assets, designed to ensure secure and reliable services to Union's customers. Union's gas supply portfolio ensures that assets are available every day to meet customer demands on the coldest day without compromising Union's ability to get gas to the delivery area to serve customers and exposing customers to	Enbridge discussed the relationship between risk assumed in the Design Criteria and its gout supply plan costs at the 2014 Natural Gas Market Review indicating that "[a] more conservative approach is taken to the cost/risk trade-off. Minimal  Risky  Design Criteria  Risky  Demand Variance Above Based Neutral Execution Cost  Neutral Execution Cost  High Budget Cost Neutral Execution Cost  When the discussion from the 2014 Natural Gas Market Review makes the assumption that incremental supply and transportation wood available (albeit at a higher cost). The use of more risky Design Criteria increases the risk actual demand will exceed design demand there is no assurance that incremental supply and transportation wood impacts increase significantly as emergency measures such as the interruption of firm customers may be required to maintain the	Enbridge is more risky than for Union. This provides for lower costs where actual temperatures are warmer than budgeted, but exposes Enbridge's ratepayers to potentially more costs, or risk of being unserved in the event of a colder than budget winter.  Idd Id. The Union manages to the coldest observed day. Union's gas supply portfolio ensures that assets are available every day to meet customer demands based on the coldest observed day without compromising service and exposing that the during periods of volatility. However, as noted in Section 5, there is a risk that actual weather could exceed the coldest observed day and require more assets than are reflected in Union's gas supply plan.	above.  Board Staff – Need for clarity for the following sentence.  "For Union South, assets are also designed to meet peak day, however the planning for peak day for Union South is outside the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> EB-2014-0289 Enbridge Written Comments filed January 16, 2015, page 4 and 5

		- 1 - 1	D: (1	Comments
	Union	Enbridge	Difference / Rationale	Comments
		gas supply plan for factors other than demand variations is mitigated through a disciplined and		
		balanced application of the gas supply planning		
		principles. A gas supply portfolio that is reliable, diverse, and flexible will be more resilient		
		· ·		
		through unplanned infrastructure disruptions and will also be more cost effective through		
		periods of localized extreme weather conditions		
		or high demand.		
8 Review 8	L & Approval Process (External)	or nign demand.		
8 Review C		Fabridad's assessment place asset alice and the	Fobridge files on wordsto to	EDDO Maragarana and the
	Union's gas supply plan is presented and made	Enbridge's gas supply plan portfolio and the	Enbridge files an update to	FRPO -We recommend the
	available to the Board and intervenors in the annual Gas Supply Memorandum and	associated cost consequences are filed with the Board as part of the annual rate application.	the gas supply cost consequences annually and	Board require submission
	• • •	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		of the rolling 5-year gas acquisition strategy
	Stakeholder Meeting Presentations. The Gas Supply Plan Memorandum is filed as part of the	Enbridge has committed to filing expanded gas supply evidence in its next rate adjustment	seeks OEB approval as part of the approved IRM.	complete with summary
	annual rates proceeding each fall prior to the	proceedings, including an explanation of the	of the approved ikivi.	reports from SENDOUT.
	start of the gas year. In addition, a Stakeholder	principles driving the gas supply plan, and how	Union files the gas supply	These summary reports
	presentation is provided as part of the annual	those principles have been implemented. The	plan cost consequences in	should include input
	deferral proceeding in the April timeframe	Board and interested parties are provided with	the cost of service	assumptions, applied
	during the gas year. Feedback received during	opportunities throughout the regulatory	proceeding. Union's gas	constraints and criteria
	this process is considered when developing the	proceeding to review the information on the	supply plan is presented	output reports showing the
	following year's gas supply plan.	evidentiary record and seek clarity through the	and made available to the	results for the proposed
	Tomorring your o gao cappi, plain	various phases of the proceeding.	Board and intervenors in	approach and reasonable
	Union files an updated gas supply plan as part of	Tarreas priases or the processing.	the annual Gas Supply	alternatives complete with
	cost of service rebasing proceedings. Union	Information related to the gas supply plan and	Memorandum and	sensitivity analysis. In our
	North transportation and storage rates are set as	considerations for future gas supply plans is	Stakeholder Meeting	review, these reports
	part of the cost of service rebasing proceeding.	typically presented by Enbridge at the Incentive	Presentations. In addition,	would filed as evidence
	During the Incentive Regulation Mechanism	Regulation Stakeholder Day that is held around	Union provides information	submitted for testing and
	("IRM") period, Union North transportation and	April, and is also addressed in Enbridge's annual	to the Board and interested	Board approval.
	storage costs included in rates for sales service	Gas Supply Plan Memorandum. Feedback	parties regarding for all	
	and bundled DP customers are updated as	received during the Stakeholder Day is	new transportation	Energy Probe - As well as
	necessary to reflect updated pipeline tolls as part	considered when developing the following year's	contracts annually,	the material provided at
	of the QRAM process.	gas supply plan.	including the landed cost	the Gas Supply Planning
			analysis as part of the	Forum, both utilities should
	Union will file additional evidence with the Board	If any material changes are anticipated for the	deferral disposition	file an Annual Gas Supply
	if critical aspects of the gas supply planning	Design Criteria or other critical aspects of the gas	proceeding	Outlook Memorandum in a
	process change during an IRM period (An	supply planning process, this will be highlighted		common format similar to
	example is the Dawn Reference Price	in detailed evidence filed with the Board. Most		that filed by Union.
	proceeding, EB-2015-0181).	recently, this was done in respect of changes to		
		storage deliverability targets which were filed		

	Union	Enbridge	Difference / Rationale	Comments
	Commodity rates for Union North and Union South, and transportation rates for Union South are set as part of the QRAM process.	with the Board and approved as part of Enbridge's 2015 rate adjustment application. Where applicable, Enbridge may also seek preapproval of long term contracts using the		
	Union provides information to the Board and intervenors regarding incremental contracting decisions for new transportation contracts as part of the annual deferral disposition proceeding. The Incremental Contracting Analysis process, as approved in EB-2005-0520, includes the rationale for entering into the contract, the benefits, the contract parameters and the landed cost analysis.	Guidelines for Pre-Approval of Natural Gas Supply and /or Upstream Transportation Contracts from the EB-2008-0280 proceeding. A recent example was the pre-approval of the costs for new capacity on NEXUS which was requested and approved under EB-2015-0175.		
	Union seeks pre-approval, as necessary, of the cost consequences of long term contracts in accordance with the filing guidelines for Pre-Approval of Long-term Natural Gas Supply and/or Upstream Transportation Contracts issued by the Board in EB-2008-0280 (For			
	example, the NEXUS proceeding, EB-2015-0166).			
9 Executio	n of the Plan - Operations and Risk Management			
	Union refers to its gas supply planning principles when making upstream transportation contracting decisions. Transportation is acquired	Transportation capacity to meet the annual design day and baseload day demand analysis (as described in sections 3 and 6) is typically	No material differences	FRPO - It is recognized and accepted that market conditions and pipeline
Transportatio	through negotiation with pipelines or through open seasons for new and existing capacity that are conducted by transportation service providers. Union must take a strategic long term view of the natural gas industry when assessing upstream transportation options by:	acquired through negotiation with pipelines or through open seasons for new and existing capacity posted by transportation service providers. In the case of new capacity requiring new assets to be constructed, this will result in binding precedent agreements that are		developments change over time. As a result, the utilities ought to be free to evolve their plans in the public interest. In changing their gas acquisition
n Acquisition	<ul> <li>Minimizing risks through portfolio diversification;</li> <li>Attracting new infrastructure to Ontario; and</li> <li>Understanding long-term market trends.</li> </ul>	negotiated between Enbridge and the transportation provider. When the transportation capacity goes into service, the precedent agreement is superseded with a gas transportation agreement that has been		strategies, the utility would identify the changes in base assumption and/or constraints that drove the change. Changes in the
	Union does not make long-term contracting decisions based on short-term pricing anomalies. This ensures that supply is prudently purchased over the long-term.	negotiated between Enbridge and the transportation provider.  Enbridge does not publically disclose the details		medium to long term strategy would be filed with the annual rate filing. Changes that have already

Union	Enbridge	Difference / Rationale	Comments
Union  Once a path is chosen based on a qualitative assessment, a landed-cost analysis is performed to ensure the cost is reasonable as compared to other options.  If the landed-cost of supply is reasonable using that transportation path, the contracts are negotiated and executed.  Using this approach ensures that the cost of supply for Union's customers is prudently incurred over the long-term.  Union is unable to file potential transportation portfolio path details prior to negotiating and executing contracts for a number of reasons:  Union would lose its negotiating position with upstream pipelines if it required pre-approval of its contracting intentions.  Depending on how the negotiation process proceeds, Union requires the ability to adjust its plans through the year as conditions change (a pipeline's ability to offer capacity, rate, term, etc.).  During the actual negotiation, key parameters may change based on changing market conditions or service availability on the pipeline or competing pipeline.  The gas supply planning and implementation process targets November 1 implementation each year. The gas supply plan is finalized late in the summer and final contracting decisions are made subsequent to the approval of the gas supply plan. Due to the effort required in addressing its uncommitted transportation requirements, Union may be executing contracts up until November 1. In	related to transportation arrangements that are being negotiated until the negotiations have been successfully concluded. This is necessary to ensure the integrity of current and future negotiations.	Difference / Rationale	Comments  been implemented would be filed with the deferral account disposition proceeding.

	Union	Enbridge	Difference / Rationale	Comments
	secondary market.	J		
Gas Supply Purchases	Gas supply is contracted in accordance with the System Gas, Gas Procurement Policy and Procedures (filed in EB-2011-0210).  Union develops a monthly procurement plan identifying the specific volumes and dates for gas supply purchases. Union's procurement plan will layer in annual, seasonal and monthly purchases each month. The monthly procurement plan is approved by the Vice President of BDS&T and the Director and Manager of Gas Supply on a monthly basis. On a planned basis, gas supply is purchased:  • Through a Request for Proposal ("RFP") process (written and verbal);  • Primarily based on index price contracts;  • Primarily in the forward market; and  • Primarily on a monthly, seasonal, and annual basis.  As system operator, Union manages many operational factors including:  • Actual and forecast consumption relative to planned consumption for its sales service customers (90% of all 1.4 million customers);  • Seasonal balancing requirements for sales service customers at key control points;  • Weather variances outside of checkpoint balancing for bundled DP customers;  • Changes in supply and balancing requirements as customers move between sales service and DP;  • Unaccounted for gas and compressor fuel variances; and  • Supply or pipeline disruptions – planned or unplanned.	Enbridge procures natural gas supply at various points in time leading up to and during the execution of the gas supply plan in accordance with its Natural Gas Procurement Policies and Procedures.  The procurement of supply is initiated leading into the start of each year. Since it is not known at that time if actual demand will be less than budgeted, only a portion of the total supply requirement is purchased. The supply is purchased through a Request for Proposal process based on a combination of annual and seasonal terms.  Leading into each month, the supply requirements are re-evaluated based on the level of demand that has been experienced, the level of supply that has been procured, BGA balancing requests from bundled DP customers, migration of customers between bundled DP and sales service, and a revised forecast of short and medium term demand. If additional supply is required for the upcoming month, it will be procured on a monthly basis through a Request for Proposal process, electronic trading systems (i.e. NGX) or directly from approved suppliers.  During each month, any short term supply shortfalls will be procured on a daily or rest of month basis through electronic trading systems or directly from approved suppliers.	No material differences. Both utilities acquire supply in accordance with their respective Gas Procurement Policy and Procedures.	
Operational Variances	Union frequently monitors actual and forecast consumption during the winter.	Enbridge addresses the execution of the gas supply plan and management of variances	No material differences.  Both utilities monitor and	

Union	Enbridge	Difference / Rationale	Comments
If actual consumption is greater than plan and sustained colder than normal weather is forecast (short-term and long-term to end of month / season) (forecast weather data is supplied electronically by DTN Meteorlogix):  • Union will fill planned UDC and purchase spot gas (typically at Dawn) for delivery as early as December based on actual and forecast variances to date;  • Union will layer in additional purchases through the winter to manage actual and forecast variances as new information is available;  • Union will purchase supply primarily in the forward market (buying the next month) rather than in the daily cash market to avoid potential price volatility;  • Union utilizes storage at Dawn to minimize the need to purchase gas during periods of high demand and in the daily cash market; and  • Union South bundled DP customers' BGA balance must not go below their February 28/29 <sup>th</sup> checkpoint, thereby ensuring supply is acquired to meet the checkpoint and assist Union in managing colder than normal weather variances and to eliminate the need for distribution interruptions for supply related reasons.  If actual consumption is less than plan and sustained warmer than normal weather is forecast:  • Union will utilize storage to inject excess gas during periods when the gas is not required  • Union reduces supply purchases to manage planned UDC, as well as actual and forecast excess supply (typically in the April to October time period);	between budgeted and actual weather and demand through regular operational planning meetings overseen by Enbridge's Director Energy Supply and Policy.  Frequency of the meetings range from daily (during periods of high demand and/or high demand variability) to bi-weekly (during periods of low demand and/or low demand variability).  Operational planning meetings take into consideration:  • Actual and budget year-to-date variances in weather and demand;  • Short term (7 day) and medium term (approximately 45 days) weather forecasts;  • Revised gas supply plan outlook that takes into account actual and short term demand forecast;  • Operational updates from Gas Control and Gas Storage;  • Procurement strategies; and  • Balancing requirements for DP customers.  Periods of peak or near peak day demand are typically managed through:  • Utilization of peaking services; and  • Curtailment of customers on interruptible distribution services.  Periods of forecasted long term higher demand than budget are typically managed through:  • Incremental procurement of supply, typically on a month ahead basis, at the most economical supply hubs/basins that correspond with unutilized transportation capacity; and  • Withdrawing from storage balances allocated to maintain incremental deliverability targets.	manage changes in demand throughout the year.	Comments

	Union	Enbridge	Difference / Rationale	Comments
	<ul> <li>The excess pipe capacity is left unutilized based on the greatest avoided cost of landed supply;</li> <li>Unutilized upstream transportation capacity is released to the secondary market and proceeds are used to reduce UDC costs;</li> <li>Net UDC costs are captured in gas cost deferral accounts and are reviewed and disposed of as part of Union's annual deferral disposition process; This includes costs for planned UDC and incremental UDC to manage lower consumption; and</li> <li>Union South bundled DP customers' BGA balance must not be greater than their September 30<sup>th</sup> checkpoint, thereby ensuring excess supply is taken off the system to meet the checkpoint and assists Union in managing warmer than normal weather variances and storage targets at November 1.</li> </ul>	Periods of forecasted long term lower demand than budget are typically managed through:  • Reduced procurement of supply at least economical supply hubs/basins; and  • Unutilized transportation capacity released to the secondary market to reduce UDC costs.		
10 Reportin	ng on Execution			
	Union reports to the Board on execution of the gas supply plan through processes defined by the Board including:  • QRAM Process - Variances in the actual cost of the gas supply portfolio, relative to what is included in rates, are captured in cost of gas deferral accounts and disposed of as part of the QRAM process.  • Annual Deferral Disposition Proceeding;  o UDC Deferral Disposition;  o Incremental Transportation  Contracting Analysis as outlined in the EB-2005-0520 Settlement Agreement;  • Annual Stakeholder Meeting. As noted in Section 8, Union's gas supply plan is made available to the Board and intervenors in the Annual Gas Supply Memorandum as part of the annual rates proceeding each fall prior to the start of the gas year. The active gas supply plan is reported on through a	Enbridge reports on the execution of its gas supply plan through various processes defined by the Board. These include QRAM applications, the annual Incentive Regulation Stakeholder Day, the annual deferral account disposition proceeding (which includes the Earnings Sharing Mechanism) and the annual rate adjustment proceeding.  The manner in which Enbridge's gas supply plan is presented and reviewed in the Board's annual processes is described above in section 8.  The QRAM process is a mechanistic approach to capture the impact of updated future forecasted prices on the Board approved gas supply portfolio. The QRAM process also provides the monetary impact of actual purchases incurred to date verses what was forecasted for clearance to customers.	No material differences. Both utilities file information with the Board supporting execution of the gas supply plan various processes defined by the Board.	FRPO - As outlined above, the utilities would report on changes to medium and long term changes to plans as part of the annual rate case evidentiary filing. These changes would be supported by evidence on the drivers associated with the applied for change. For shorter term changes that happen intra-year as a result of short-term effects, the reporting would occur as part of the annual deferral account disposition proceeding.

Union	Enbridge	Difference / Rationale	Comments
stakeholder presentation as part of the annual deferral proceeding in the April timeframe during the gas year.	The costs associated with UDC are captured in a deferral account ("UDCDA"). Like other deferral accounts, the UDCDA is brought forward for disposition as part of the annual deferral account disposition proceeding.		