## COST OF CAPITAL SUMMARY

1. The evidence, in the following tables 1 through 3, shows a summary of Enbridge's cost of capital for each of the 2016 Board Approved (EB-2015-0114), the 2017 placeholder (EB-2012-0459), and the 2017 Updated Forecast.

TABLE 1
COST OF CAPITAL SUMMARY

| Line <br> No. |  | EB-2015-0114-2016 Approved (excluding CIS) |  |  |  | Return |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | Principal | Component | Cost Rate | Return |  |
|  |  | (\$Millions) | \% | \% | \% | (\$Millions) |
| 1. | Long-term debt | 3,546.1 | 61.41\% | 4.96\% | 3.046\% | 175.9 |
| 2. | Short-term debt | 49.6 | 0.86\% | 1.57\% | 0.013\% | 0.8 |
| 3. | Preferred shares | 100.0 | 1.73\% | 2.16\% | 0.037\% | 2.2 |
| 4. | Common Equity | 2,078.8 | 36.00\% | 9.19\% | 3.308\% | 191.0 |
|  | Total | 5,774.5 | 100.00\% |  | 6.404\% | 369.8 |

TABLE 2
COST OF CAPITAL SUMMARY

| Line No. |  | EB-2012-0459-2017 Placeholder (excluding CIS) |  |  |  | Return |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | Principal | Component | Cost Rate | Return |  |
|  |  | (\$Millions) | \% | \% | \% | (\$Millions) |
| 1. | Long-term debt | 3,591.4 | 60.57\% | 5.32\% | 3.222\% | 191.1 |
| 2. | Short-term debt | 103.1 | 1.74\% | 4.30\% | 0.075\% | 4.4 |
| 3. | Preferred shares | 100.0 | 1.69\% | 4.64\% | 0.078\% | 4.6 |
| 4. | Common Equity | 2,134.4 | 36.00\% | 10.17\% | 3.661\% | 217.1 |
| 5. | Total | 5,928.9 | 100.00\% |  | 7.036\% | 417.3 |

TABLE 3
COST OF CAPITAL SUMMARY

| Line <br> No. |  | 2017 Updated Forecast (excluding CIS) |  |  |  | Return |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | Principal | Component | Cost Rate | Return |  |
|  |  | (\$Millions) | \% | \% | \% | (\$Millions) |
| 1. | Long-term debt | 3,739.6 | 62.28\% | 4.83\% | 3.008\% | 180.6 |
| 2. | Short-term debt | 3.2 | 0.05\% | 1.23\% | 0.001\% | 0.0 |
| 3. | Preferred shares | 100.0 | 1.67\% | 2.24\% | 0.037\% | 2.2 |
| 4. | Common Equity | 2,161.6 | 36.00\% | 8.77\% | 3.157\% | 189.6 |
|  | Total | 6,004.4 | 100.00\% |  | 6.203\% | 372.5 |

2. As reflected in Table 3 versus Table 2 above, the 2017 Updated Forecast capital structure has been updated in accordance with the Board's EB-2012-0459 Decision and Rate Order requiring the return on equity to be re-set each year using the Board approved parameters, and that the cost of debt be updated annually using the most current information, including information on actual amounts and rates associated with debt issued in the prior year.
3. Details of the 2017 Updated Forecast financing costs, including forecast debt issuances and cost rates, are included in Exhibit E1, Tab 3, Schedule 1. Evidence with respect to the updated 2017 return on equity included within the 2017 updated allowed revenue and revenue deficiency calculation is found in evidence at Exhibit E1, Tab 2, Schedule 1.
4. Further details of each of the elements of the 2017 updated forecast capital structure, and the determination of the overall cost of capital and resulting deficiency in earnings are found at Exhibits E2, Tab 1, Schedules 1 through 5.

## RETURN ON EQUITY CALCULATION FOR 2017

1. The purpose of this evidence is to provide the Return On Equity ("ROE") to be used as part of the cost of capital determination for the proposed 2017 revenue requirement, as well as for the calculation of Earnings Sharing, if any, for 2017. The Company has calculated the ROE using the methodology provided in the Report of the Board on the Cost of Capital for Ontario's Regulated Utilities (Cost of Capital Report) issued December 2009. The following illustrates how the ROE is calculated in accordance with the Cost of Capital Report:

$$
\mathrm{ROE}_{t}=9.75 \%+\left[0.5 \times\left(\mathrm{LCBF}_{t}-4.25 \%\right)\right]+\left[0.5 \times\left(\mathrm{UBS}_{t}-1.415 \%\right)\right]
$$

Where:

- ROE is set in the month that is three months in advance of the effective date for rate implementation.
- LCBF is the Long Canada Bond Forecast determined as the average 3month out and 1-year out yields of the 10-year Government of Canada (GoC) Bond Yield Forecasts (as sourced from Consensus Economics) plus the actual spread of the 30-year over the 10-year GoC (as published by the Bank of Canada) in the month of analysis.
- UBS is the A-rated Utility Bond Yield Spread between the Canada 30-year Utility bond index yield (as reported by Bloomberg L.P.) and the 30-year GoC (as published by the Bank of Canada) in the month of analysis.
- $9.75 \%$ is the Base ROE,
- $4.25 \%$ is the Base LCFB, and
- $1.415 \%$ is the Base UBS.

2. In its EB-2012-0459 Decision issued July 17, 2014, the Board determined that "the Cost of Capital will be re-set each year using the Board's established approach" (p.10). The Board further concluded that "the allowed ROE for purposes of calculating the ESM should be the ROE used to determine the allowed revenue requirement" ( $p .14$ ). " $[T]$ he preferred approach is to update the return on equity each year during the annual rate adjustment proceeding using the Board-approved
parameters. The Board publishes these figures in November which should provide Enbridge with adequate time to incorporate them into the final rates" (p.55).
3. The Board issued its Cost of Capital Parameter Updates for 2017 Applications (the "Update") on October 27, 2016 where the ROE effective January 1, 2017 is determined to be 8.78\%.
4. The following is the derivation of the ROE of $8.78 \%$ for 2017 in accordance with the Update. The LCBF of $2.037 \%$ is derived at Step 3 of the Update and the UBS of $1.680 \%$ is determined at Step 1 so that:

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \operatorname{ROE}_{2017}=9.75 \%+\left[0.5 \times\left(\mathrm{LCBF}_{2017}-4.25 \%\right)\right]+\left[0.5 \times\left(\mathrm{UBS}_{2017}-1.415 \%\right)\right] \\
& \operatorname{ROE}_{2017}=9.75 \%+[0.5 \times(2.037 \%-4.25 \%)]+[0.5 \times(1.680 \%-1.415 \%)] \\
& \operatorname{ROE}_{2017}=8.78 \%
\end{aligned}
$$

## 2017 COST OF DEBT

1. As set out in the EB-2012-0459 Decision and Rate Order (pages 2 and 3), Enbridge's cost of debt is to be updated each year from 2015 to 2018 using the most current information available, including information about the actual amounts and rates associated with any debt issued in the prior year.
2. Enbridge's forecast cost of debt for 2017 is set out within Table 1, and explained below.

TABLE 1
COST OF DEBT SUMMARY

| Line <br> No. |  | 2017 Updated Forecast (excluding CIS) |  |  |  | Return |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | Principal | Component | Cost Rate | Return |  |
|  |  | (\$Millions) | \% | \% | \% | (\$Millions) |
| 1. | Long-term debt | 3,739.6 | 62.28\% | 4.83\% | 3.008\% | 180.6 |
| 2. | Short-term debt | 3.2 | 0.05\% | 1.23\% | 0.001\% | 0.0 |
| 3. | Preferred shares | 100.0 | 1.67\% | 2.24\% | 0.037\% | 2.2 |
| 4. | Total | 3,842.8 | 64.00\% |  | 3.046\% | 182.9 |

3. As required by the Board's EB-2012-0459 Decision and Rate Order, Enbridge has updated its cost of debt by taking account of its forecast 2017 rate base for ratemaking purposes, its actual level and cost of debt, which has been updated to include actual debt issuances through 2016, and to also include the impact of updated forecast 2017 debt issuances.
4. Enbridge's actual 2016 long term debt issuance increased modestly to $\$ 300$ million, as compared to the $\$ 250$ million forecast within EB-2015-0114. Issuance timing was deferred from March to August as better than anticipated liquidity enabled

Witnesses: R. Craddock
R. Small

Filed: 2016-10-04
EB-2016-0215
Exhibit E1
Tab 3
Schedule 1
Page 2 of 3
Enbridge to delay issuing until pricing was optimized. The debt was issued at an effective cost rate of $3.42 \%$ including the impact of hedge settlements, as compared to $4.47 \%$ forecast within EB-2015-0114. The lower rate was as a result of lower corporate spreads and underlying Government of Canada rates.
5. For 2017, Enbridge plans to issue $\$ 300$ million of debt, the details of which can be found in Table 2 below. The issuances will fund a maturing 10 year medium-term note in the amount of $\$ 200$ million, as well as growth in rate base.

## Table 2

| Item No. | Amount (\$MM) | Issue Date | Term (Yrs) | Canada Yield | Corporate Spread | Coupon | Amortized Issue Costs | Effective Cost |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 |  | gust 2017 | 10 | 1.80\% | 1.40\% | 3.20\% | 0.05\% | 3.25\% |
| 2 |  | gust 2017 | 30 | 2.30\% | 1.70\% | 4.00\% | 0.02\% | 4.02\% |

6. Details of all elements of Enbridge's term debt forecast for the 2017 Updated Forecast, are set out within Exhibit E2, Tab 1, Schedule 2.
7. The calculation of the average cost rate for Enbridge's term debt, which equates to $4.83 \%$, is set out at Exhibit E2, Tab 1, Schedule 1, page 2.
8. There are no preferred share issuances planned for 2017. Enbridge continues to have $\$ 100$ million of preference shares, with a 2017 cost rate of $2.24 \%$.
9. As explained in Exhibit B1, Tab 1, Schedule 1, Enbridge's rate base for ratemaking purposes for 2017, exclusive of CIS (which has a different cost of capital, in accordance with the EB-2011-0226 Settlement Agreement) is $\$ 6,004.4$ million. Under Enbridge's capital structure, which includes a 64\% weighting of debt and preferred shares, this means that Enbridge's level of debt for ratemaking purposes in 2017 is $\$ 3,842.8$ million.

Witnesses: R. Craddock<br>R. Small

Filed: 2016-10-04
EB-2016-0215
Exhibit E1
Tab 3
Schedule 1
Page 3 of 3
10. In total, Enbridge's cost of debt (exclusive of CIS / CC) to be included in 2017 Allowed Revenue is $\$ 182.9$ million.

COST OF CAPITAL 2017 UPDATED FORECAST


| Line No. |  | Col. 1 | Col. 2 | Col. 3 <br> Carrying Cost |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | Average of Monthly Averages |  |  |
| Long and Medium-Term Debt (\$Millions) (\$Millions) |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1. | Debt Summary | 3,771.7 |  | 182.2 |
| 2. | Unamortized Finance Costs | (32.1) |  | - |
| 3. | (Profit)/Loss on Redemption | - |  | - |
| 4. |  | 3,739.6 |  | 182.2 |
| 5. | Calculated Cost Rate |  | 4.83\% |  |
| Short-Term Debt |  |  |  |  |
| 6. | Calculated Cost Rate |  | 1.23\% |  |
| Preference Shares |  |  |  |  |
| 7. | Preference Share Summary | 100.0 |  | 2.2 |
| 8. | Unamortized Finance Costs | - |  | - |
| 9. | (Profit)/Loss on Redemption | - |  | - |
| 10. |  | 100.0 |  | 2.2 |
| 11. | Calculated Cost Rate |  | 2.24\% |  |
| Common Equity |  |  |  |  |
| 12. | Board Formula ROE |  | 8.77\% |  |

# SUMMARY STATEMENT OF PRINCIPAL AND CARRYING COST OF TERM DEBT 2017 UPDATED FORECAST 

$\left.\left.\begin{array}{ccccc}\text { Line Coupon } & & \begin{array}{c}\text { Average of } \\ \text { Monthly Averages } \\ \text { No. Rate }\end{array} & \text { Maturity Date } & \begin{array}{c}\text { Effective } \\ \text { Principal }\end{array}\end{array} \begin{array}{c}\text { Carrying } \\ \text { Cost Rate }\end{array}\right) \begin{array}{ccc}\text { Cost }\end{array}\right]$

## Medium Term Notes

| 1. | 8.85\% | October 2, 2025 | 20.0 | $8.970 \%$ | 1.8 |
| ---: | :--- | :--- | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| 2. | $7.60 \%$ | October 29, 2026 | 100.0 | $8.086 \%$ | 8.1 |
| 3. | $6.65 \%$ | November 3, 2027 | 100.0 | $6.711 \%$ | 6.7 |
| 4. | $6.10 \%$ | May 19, 2028 | 100.0 | $6.161 \%$ | 6.2 |
| 5. | $6.05 \%$ | July 5, 2023 | 100.0 | $6.383 \%$ | 6.4 |
| 6. | $6.90 \%$ | November 15, 2032 | 150.0 | $6.950 \%$ | 10.4 |
| 7. | $6.16 \%$ | December 16, 2033 | 150.0 | $6.180 \%$ | 9.3 |
| 8. | $5.21 \%$ | February 25, 2036 | 300.0 | $5.183 \%$ | 15.5 |
| 9. | $4.77 \%$ | December 17, 2021 | 175.0 | $5.310 \%$ | 9.3 |
| 10. | $5.16 \%$ | December 4, 2017 | 191.7 | $5.220 \%$ | 10.0 |
| 11. | $4.04 \%$ | November 23, 2020 | 200.0 | $5.209 \%$ | 10.4 |
| 12. | $4.95 \%$ | November 22, 2050 | 200.0 | $4.990 \%$ | 10.0 |
| 13. | $4.95 \%$ | November 22, 2050 | 100.0 | $4.731 \%$ | 4.7 |
| 14. | $4.10 \%$ | November 23, 2020 | 200.0 | $2.801 \%$ | 5.6 |
| 15. | $4.50 \%$ | November 23, 2043 | 200.0 | $4.198 \%$ | 8.4 |
| 16. | $1.85 \%$ | April 24, 2017 | - | $1.970 \%$ | - |
| 17. | $3.15 \%$ | August 22, 2024 | 215.0 | $3.241 \%$ | 7.0 |
| 18. | $4.00 \%$ | August 22, 2044 | 215.0 | $3.889 \%$ | 8.4 |
| 19. | $4.00 \%$ | August 22, 2044 | 170.0 | $4.436 \%$ | 7.5 |
| 20. | $3.31 \%$ | September 11, 2025 | 400.0 | $3.619 \%$ | 14.5 |
| 21. | $2.50 \%$ | August 5, 2026 | 300.0 | $3.415 \%$ | 10.2 |
| 22. | $3.20 \%$ | August 15, 2027 | 56.3 | $3.252 \%$ | 1.8 |
| 23. | $4.00 \%$ | August 15, 2047 | 56.3 | $4.021 \%$ | -2.3 |
| 24. |  |  | $3,699.3$ |  | 174.5 |

## Long-Term Debentures

| 25. | 9.85\% | December 2, 2024 | 85.0 | 9.910\% | 8.4 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 26. |  |  | 85.0 |  | 8.4 |
| 27. | Remov 64\% as rate ba | f separately treated med debt of 2017 \$ value | (12.6) | 5.350\% | (0.7) |
| 28. | Total T | Debt | 3,771.7 |  | 182.2 |

Notes:

1. Enbridge's April 2014 issuance of a $\$ 300$ million three-year note has been removed from the calculation of long and medium-term debt costs, and has been re-categorized to short-term debt in a manner consistent with the treatment approved within the Settlement Agreement in Enbridge's 2015 Rate Adjustment proceeding, EB-2014-0276.

## UNAMORTIZED DEBT DISCOUNT AND EXPENSE AVERAGE OF MONTHLY AVERAGES 2017 UPDATED FORECAST




Fixed/Floating Cumulative Redeemable Convertible \$25 Par Value

| 1. $\mathrm{N} / \mathrm{A}$ | Group 3 Series D | 100.0 | $2.24 \%$ | 2.2 |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 2. Total |  | 100.0 |  | 2.2 |


| Line | Issue |
| :--- | :---: |
| No. | Expense |

(\$Millions)

| 1. January 1 |  |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 2. January 31 | - |  |
| 3. | February | - |
| 4. | March | - |
| 5. April | - |  |
| 6. May | - |  |
| 7. June | - |  |
| 8. July | - |  |
| 9. August | - |  |
| 10. September | - |  |
| 11. October | - |  |
| 12. November | - |  |
| 13. | - |  |
| 14. Aecember | Average of Monthly Averages | - |

