



Adam Stiers
Technical Manager
Regulatory Applications
Regulatory Affairs

Tel: (519) 436-4558
Email: astiers@uniongas.com
EGIRegulatoryProceedings@enbridge.com

Enbridge Gas Inc.
P.O. Box 2001
50 Keil Drive N.
Chatham, Ontario, N7M 5M1
Canada

May 25, 2020

BY RESS And EMAIL

Ms. Christine Long
Board Secretary
Ontario Energy Board
2300 Yonge Street, 27th Floor
Toronto, ON M4P 1E4

Dear Ms. Long:

Re: EB-2019-0271 – Enbridge Gas Inc. (Enbridge Gas) – 2021 DSM Plans – Updated Interrogatory Responses

In accordance with the Ontario Energy Board's ("OEB" or "Board") Procedural Order No. 3 and Decision on Green Energy Coalition Motion, dated May 14, 2020, attached are updated responses to:

- Exhibit I.GEC.1 – including detailed measure-level tracking data in the manner provided to the OEB's Evaluation Contractor for the Home Energy Conservation, Home Reno Rebate and two Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive programs for the 2017 and 2018 program years, at Attachments 1 and 2; and
- Exhibit I.SEC.12 – including draft 2019 program results, in the same manner as originally filed by Enbridge Gas on April 6, 2020, at Attachment 5.

Enbridge Gas has delivered Exhibit I.GEC.1 Attachments 1 and 2, in excel spreadsheet format due to file size. This submission has been delivered to all parties, as directed by the Board.

If you have any questions, please contact the undersigned.

Sincerely,

[original signed by]

Adam Stiers
Technical Manager, Regulatory Applications

c.c.: Dennis O'Leary (Aird & Berlis)
Josh Wasylyk (OEB Staff)
Michael Millar (OEB Counsel)
EB-2019-0271 (Intervenors)

ENBRIDGE GAS INC.

Answer to Interrogatory from
Green Energy Coalition (GEC)

Interrogatory

Question:

Please provide an Excel spreadsheet, with formulae and calculations intact, that shows the following for each efficiency measure and for each program – separately for Enbridge and Union Gas – that was supported in 2017, 2018 and 2019:

- a. The program name
- b. The measure name and description
- c. The per unit gas savings (m3), electric savings (kWh), water savings (litres), incremental cost, measure life and net-to-gross assumption used to estimate savings achieved in each year. For programs for which measure level data are not available (e.g. because savings are tracked at a measure bundle or program level only), as well as for C&I custom programs, please provide average per participant savings, incremental cost, measure life for the measure bundle.
- d. The actual number of participants per measure (or measure bundle or C&I Custom program).
- e. The gross realization rate adjustment factor applied (for the years for which it is available)
- f. The net-to-gross assumption used at the measure level (if applicable) or at the program level (if not applicable at the measure level).
- g. A computation of the net first year savings per measure (per measure savings multiplied by number of measures/participants multiplied by the gross realization rate multiplied by the net-to-gross ratio).
- h. A computation of the net lifetime savings per measure (per measure first year savings multiplied by measure life)
- i. The sum of net savings, both first year and lifetime, across all measures in each program and for the portfolio as a whole.
- j. The rebate level (or average rebate level for measures or measure bundles for which rebate levels vary by customer or project).
- k. Total rebate payments by measure (or measure bundle), program and program portfolio.
- l. Total non-rebate spending by program, including non-resource acquisition programs, and for the portfolio as a whole, broken down by any sub-categories that are separately tracked.

Response

Much of the information sought through this interrogatory exceeds the scope of Enbridge Gas's 2021 DSM Plans proceeding as defined within the OEB's Procedural Order No. 1.¹ Please see the response at Exhibit I.BOMA.4, for discussion regarding the scope of this proceeding established by the OEB. Accordingly, Enbridge Gas has provided limited responses to this interrogatory in an effort to be as responsive as reasonably possible and to comply with the OEB's Procedural Order No. 3, dated May 14, 2020.

Consistent with the OEB's direction in Procedural Order No. 3, Enbridge Gas has filed this updated interrogatory response to include detailed measure-level tracking data in the manner provided to the OEB's Evaluation Contractor for the Home Energy Conservation, Home Reno Rebate and two Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive programs for the 2017 and 2018 program years.²

The relevant information requested can be found in-part in the response at Exhibit I.SEC.12, as reasonably available.

For 2015 DSM program year details, please see the response at Exhibit I.SEC.12 Attachment 1.

For 2016 DSM program year details, please see the response at Exhibit I.SEC.12 Attachment 2

For Draft 2017 budget, expenditure and savings details (as Enbridge Gas has not yet filed a 2017/2018 DSM Deferral and Variance Account Clearance application with the OEB), please see the response at Exhibit I.SEC.12 Attachment 3.

For Draft 2018 budget, expenditure and savings details (as Enbridge Gas has not yet filed a 2017/2018 DSM Deferral and Variance Account clearance application with the OEB), please see the response at Exhibit I.SEC.12 Attachment 4.

For Draft 2019 budget, expenditure and savings details (as 2019 DSM program year details are pre-audit), please see the response at Exhibit I.SEC.12 Attachment 5.

For Draft 2017 and 2018 Union rate zones measure-level data for the Home Reno Rebate and Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive programs (as Enbridge Gas has not

¹ EB-2019-0271, OEB Procedural Order No. 1 (February 24, 2020), p. 3.

² EB-2019-0271, OEB Procedural Order No. 3 (May 14, 2020), p. 4.

yet filed a 2017/2018 DSM Deferral and Variance Account clearance application with the OEB), please see Attachment 1.

For Draft 2017 and 2018 EGD rate zone measure-level data for the Home Energy Conservation and Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive programs (as Enbridge Gas has not yet filed a 2017/2018 DSM Deferral and Variance Account clearance application with the OEB), please see Attachment 2.

Due to their size, and as originally requested by GEC, Attachments 1 and 2 have been provided in excel spreadsheet format only. Consistent with the OEB's direction in Procedural Order No. 3 Enbridge Gas has delivered this updated response, including attachments, to all parties.

ENBRIDGE GAS INC.

Answer to Interrogatory from
School Energy Coalition (SEC)

Interrogatory

Reference:

[General]

Question:

The 2018 Audit Report contains tables 1-1 through 1-4. Please file those tables for 2018, and the same data in the same format for each of 2015, 2016, 2017, and 2019.

Response

Consistent with the OEB's direction in Procedural Order No. 3, Enbridge Gas has filed this updated interrogatory response to include Draft 2019 program results, in the same manner as the original response filed April 6, 2020.¹ Consistent with the OEB's direction in Procedural Order No. 3, Enbridge Gas has delivered this updated response, including attachments, to all parties.

For 2015 DSM program year details, please see Attachment 1.

For 2016 DSM program year details, please see Attachment 2.

For Draft 2017 DSM program year details (as Enbridge Gas has not yet filed a 2017/2018 DSM Deferral and Variance Account Clearance application with the OEB), please see Attachment 3.

For Draft 2018 DSM program year details (as Enbridge Gas has not yet filed a 2017/2018 DSM Deferral and Variance Account Clearance application with the OEB), please see Attachment 4.

For Draft 2019 DSM program year details (as 2019 DSM program year details are pre-audit), please see Attachment 5.

¹ EB-2019-0271, OEB Procedural Order No. 3 (May 14, 2020), pp. 4-5.

Source: Utilities' 2015 Demand Side Management Annual Report. Targets and spend are consistent with those presented in the 2015 Natural Gas Demand-Side Management Annual Verification Report (DNV GL), however, actual achievement was modified through Decision and Order EB-2017-0323/EB-2017-0324, which also impacts incentives and cost effectiveness. Created based on Table 1-3 from 2018 Natural Gas Demand-Side Management Annual Verification Report (DNV GL) but some columns have been re-ordered to accommodate additional data.

EGD Rate Zone (2015)

Table 1-1. EGD Rate Zone savings, spend, cost effectiveness, and incentive results*†

Program/Offering	Metric	Verified First-Year Savings (m3)	Verified Cumulative Savings or Other Metric	Lower Band	Target	Upper Band	Metric Weight	Percent of Target Metric Achieved	Weighted % of Scorecard Achieved***	DSM Shareholder Incentive	Maximum Shareholder Incentive Available	OEB-Approved Program Budget	Utility Spending**	Budget/ Spending Variance	Cost Effectiveness (TRC Benefit Cost Ratio)	Net Present Value (TRC Plus)	Participants/Units	Gross Annual Natural Gas Savings (m³)	Gross Cumulative Natural Gas Savings (CCM)
Resource Acquisition		44,698,971	734,128,834						152.3%	\$6,482,744	\$6,482,744	\$19,175,275	\$23,389,805	\$4,214,530	3.12	\$109,161,947	23,463	62,780,541	1,021,749,154
Commercial & Industrial Custom	CCM Savings	31,325,608	524,020,079	758,900,000	1,011,900,000	1,264,900,000	92%	45.1%	41.5%	\$6,482,744	\$6,482,744	\$12,571,070	\$6,821,798	-\$4,182,640	3.74	\$86,594,569	677	46,951,420	771,244,862
Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive	CCM Savings	6,073,751	105,009,436										\$107,736		5.65	\$18,362,440	17,112	7,336,075	127,331,700
Run-it-Right	CCM Savings	536,821	2,684,105										\$1,458,896		0.33	-\$1,068,205	28	536,821	2,684,105
Home Energy Conservation	CCM Savings	6,762,791	102,415,214	571	762	952	8%	1385.3%	110.8%			\$1,872,720	\$9,362,295	\$7,489,575	2.24	\$10,912,223		7,956,225	120,488,487
	Deep Savings Participants	N/A	5,646												N/A	N/A	5,646		
Resource Acquisition Overhead													\$4,731,485		\$5,639,080	\$907,595			
Low Income		4,272,585	92,036,617						116.2%	\$1,483,792	\$2,495,721	\$7,382,078	\$7,173,711	-\$208,367	1.88	\$7,166,734	4,674	4,306,970	92,380,469
Single Family (Part 9)	CCM Savings	1,129,070	28,067,263	18,100,000	24,100,000	30,200,000	50%	132.5%	66.2%	\$1,483,792	\$2,495,721	\$4,655,790	\$4,444,616	-\$211,174	1.06	\$232,036	1,343	1,135,609	28,132,657
Multi Residential (Part 3)	CCM Savings	3,143,515	63,969,353	51,600,000	68,700,000	86,000,000	45%	86.2%	38.8%			\$2,208,300	\$2,111,746	-\$96,554	3.20	\$7,552,047	3,331	3,171,361	64,247,812
Multi Residential (Part 3)	Participants (%)	N/A	64.7%	30%	40%	50%	5%	223.5%	11.2%				\$0	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Low Income Overhead												\$517,988	\$617,349	\$99,361					
Market Transformation										\$2,111,159	\$2,111,159	\$6,244,587	\$4,657,079	-\$1,587,508	N/A	N/A	44,013	N/A	N/A
Residential Savings By Design									170.5%	\$1,076,493	\$1,076,493	\$2,493,900	\$2,032,022	-\$461,878	N/A	N/A	2,006	N/A	N/A
Residential Savings by Design	Builders	N/A	19	13	18	22	60%	112.5%	67.5%	\$1,076,493	\$1,076,493	\$2,493,900	\$2,032,022	-\$461,878			19		
	Homes		1,987	833	1,111	1,389	40%	257.6%	103.0%								1,987		
Commercial Savings By Design									150.0%	\$418,269	\$418,269	\$969,000	\$890,464	-\$78,536	N/A	N/A	24	N/A	N/A
Commercial Savings by Design	Developments	N/A	24	11	18	24	100%	150.0%	150.0%	\$418,269	\$418,269	\$969,000	\$890,464	-\$78,536			24		
Home Labelling (Rating)									236.9%	\$616,397	\$616,397	\$1,428,000	\$121,241	-\$1,306,759	N/A	N/A	41,983	N/A	N/A
Home Labelling	Commitments	N/A	41,650	N/A	5,001	10,001	50%	466.5%	233.2%	\$616,397	\$616,397	\$1,428,000	\$121,241	-\$1,306,759			41,650		
	Ratings Performed		333	2,250	4,500	6,750	50%	7.4%	3.7%								333		
Market Transformation Overhead												\$1,353,687	\$1,613,352	\$259,665					
EGD Rate Zone Program Total		48,971,556	826,165,451							\$10,077,695	\$11,089,624	\$32,801,940	\$35,220,595	\$2,418,655	2.95	\$116,328,681	72,150	67,087,511	1,114,129,623
Portfolio Overhead and Administrative Costs													\$4,920,291	\$559,378	-\$4,360,913				
EGD Rate Zone Portfolio Total													\$37,722,231	\$35,779,973	-\$1,942,258				

*Not all values may compute exactly due to rounding.

†CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas.

**The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spending to differ from the approved budget. Sections 6.6 and 11.2 of the [Filing Guidelines](#) provide details for acceptable spending differences.

***Actual scorecard achievements are shown but weighted scorecard is capped at 150%.

Source: Utilities' 2015 Demand Side Management Annual Report. Targets and spend are consistent with those presented in the 2015 Natural Gas Demand-Side Management Annual Verification Report (DNV GL), however, actual achievement was modified through Decision and Order EB-2017-0323/EB-2017-0324, which also impacts incentives and cost effectiveness. Created based on Table 1-3 from 2018 Natural Gas Demand-Side Management Annual Verification Report (DNV GL) but some columns have been re-ordered to accommodate additional data.

Union Rate Zones (2015)

Table 1-3. Union Rate Zones achievement, spend, cost effectiveness, and incentive results*†

Program/Offering	Metric	Verified First-Year Savings (m³)	Verified Cumulative Savings or Other Metric	Lower Band	Target	Upper Band	Metric Weight	Percent of Target Metric Achieved	Weighted % of Scorecard Achieved***	DSM Shareholder Incentive	Maximum Shareholder Incentive Available	OEB- Approved Program Budget	Utility Spending**	Budget/ Spending Variance	Cost Effectiveness (TRC Benefit Cost Ratio)	Net Present Value (TRC)	Participants/Units	Gross Annual Natural Gas Savings (m³)	Gross Cumulative Natural Gas Savings (CCM)	
Resource Acquisition		56,239,793	919,157,080						130.9%	\$4,443,225	\$5,761,833	\$15,185,808	\$16,818,607	\$1,632,799	2.68	\$105,948,039	25,912	108,355,744	1,737,648,089	
Commercial & Industrial Custom	CCM Savings	42,588,031	664,199,557	612,421,364	816,561,818	1,020,702,273	90%	125.1%	112.6%	\$4,443,225	\$5,761,833	\$4,984,937	\$5,512,879	\$527,942	3.53	\$88,200,561	588	92,582,677	1,443,912,081	
Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive	CCM Savings	9,283,248	182,411,887									\$3,806,470	\$2,831,233	-\$975,237	3.16	\$21,692,889	3,042	10,659,544	208,919,006	
Energy Savings Kit	CCM Savings	1,179,468	14,800,935									\$2,779,776	\$4,525,364	\$1,745,588	5.40	\$2,907,038	19,753	1,361,705	16,882,059	
Home Reno Rebate	CCM Savings	3,189,046	57,744,701												0.78	-\$2,903,318		3,751,818	67,934,943	
	Participants	N/A	2,529	934	1,245	1,556	5%	306.3%	15.3%						N/A	N/A	2,529			
Commercial & Industrial Deep Savings	% Savings	N/A	8.08%	7.88%	8.88%	9.88%	5%	60.0%	3.0%			-	-	-						
Overhead and Administrative Costs												\$3,614,625	\$3,949,131	\$334,506						
Low Income		2,309,842	52,180,787						139.7%	\$2,462,534	\$2,810,129	\$7,406,335	\$7,701,034	\$294,699	1.07	\$552,817	1,603	2,355,887	53,040,835	
Single Family (Part 9)	CCM Savings	1,435,616	35,847,426	19,500,000	26,000,000	32,500,000	60.00%	175.8%	105.4%	\$2,462,534	\$2,810,129	\$4,712,975	\$4,836,139	\$123,164	1.32	\$1,460,361	1,472	1,435,649	35,847,824	
Multi-Family (Part 3)	CCM Savings	874,226	16,333,361	13,200,000	17,600,000	22,000,000	40.00%	85.6%	34.2%			\$1,597,857	\$1,808,928	\$211,071	1.06	\$148,423	131	920,238	17,193,011	
Overhead and Administrative Costs												\$1,095,503	\$1,055,967	-\$39,536						
Large Volume		66,527,557	779,427,613						21.8%	\$0	\$1,862,877	\$4,909,773	\$3,209,716	-\$1,700,057	6.97	\$113,820,505	150	144,457,130	1,691,806,721	
Rate T1	CCM Savings	8,842,211	121,416,767	154,692,013	206,256,017	257,820,021	60%	17.7%	11.1%	\$0	\$1,862,877	\$1,250,254	\$477,540	-\$772,714	7.62	\$18,645,277	40	19,205,955	263,624,641	
Rate T2/100	CCM Savings	57,685,346	658,010,847	772,381,040	1,029,841,387	1,287,301,734	40%	27.8%	10.6%			\$2,634,452	\$1,745,745	-\$888,707	7.30	\$96,161,659	110	125,251,175	1,428,182,080	
Overhead and Administrative Costs												\$1,025,067	\$986,431	-\$38,636						
Market Transformation									305.7%	\$566,721	\$566,721	\$1,493,642	\$1,405,340	-\$88,302	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	
Optimum Home	Homes Built	N/A	50.3%	24.73%	29.73%	34.73%	100%	305.7%	305.7%	\$566,721	\$566,721	\$1,283,349	\$1,018,637	-\$264,712						
Overhead and Administrative Costs												\$210,293	\$386,703	\$176,410						
Union Program Total		125,077,193	1,750,765,480							\$7,472,480	\$11,001,560	\$28,995,558	\$29,134,697	\$139,139	3.33	217,424,127	27,665	255,168,761	3,482,495,645	
Portfolio Overhead and Administrative Costs												\$4,992,321	\$3,257,947	-\$1,734,374						
Union Rate Zones Portfolio Total												\$33,987,879	\$32,392,644	-\$1,595,235						

*Not all values may compute exactly due to rounding.
†CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas.
** The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spending to differ from the approved budget. Sections 6.6 and 11.2 of the [Filing Guidelines](#) provide details for acceptable spending differences.
***Actual scorecard achievements are shown but weighted scorecard is capped at 150%.

Source: 2016 Natural Gas Demand-Side Management Annual Verification Report (DNV GL) for achievement, spend, and cost effectiveness. Utilities' data for targets and incentive results due to Decision and Order EB-2018-0300/EB-2018-0301 that modified targets. Created based on Table 1-3 from 2018 Natural Gas Demand-Side Management Annual Verification Report (DNV GL) but some columns have been re-ordered to accommodate additional data. Participants/units and Gross Annual Savings are not available in the 2016 Annual Verification Report. This data has been taken from the Utilities' data. This data may vary from the Auditor results due to rounding and inability to completely reproduce results. Differences are not material.

EGD Rate Zone (2016)

Table 1-1. EGD Rate Zone savings, spend, cost effectiveness, and incentive results*†

8	Program/Offering	Metric	Verified First-Year Savings (m3)	Verified Cumulative Savings or Other Metric	Lower Band	Target	Upper Band	Metric Weight	Percent of Target Metric Achieved	Weighted % of Scorecard Achieved	DSM Shareholder Incentive	Maximum Shareholder Incentive Available	OEB-Approved Program Budget	Utility Spending* **	Budget/ Spending Variance	Cost Effectiveness (TRC Benefit Cost Ratio)	Net Present Value (TRC Plus)	Participants/Units	Gross Annual Natural Gas Savings (m ³)	Gross Cumulative Natural Gas Savings (CCM)			
9	Resource Acquisition		45,247,691	723,570,707						123.9%	\$4,658,886	\$6,787,943	\$34,336,673	\$38,867,717	\$4,531,044	2.73	\$95,507,000	37,990	84,749,901	1,365,482,647			
10	Commercial & Industrial Custom	CCM Savings	18,327,992	315,357,341	See separate table below					92.4%	\$4,658,886	\$6,787,943	\$7,020,664	\$6,746,119	-\$274,545	4.04	\$48,734,000	677	53,834,552	899,531,474			
11	Commercial & Industrial Direct Install	CCM Savings	5,277,573	79,163,595												\$4,955,421	\$2,390,902	-\$2,564,519	10.80	\$11,971,000	345	5,555,340	83,330,100
12	Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive	CCM Savings	3,174,750	51,377,592												\$2,196,952	\$1,001,671	-\$1,195,281	3.24	\$8,047,000	6,909	3,735,085	60,591,326
13	Comprehensive Energy Management	CCM Savings	-	-												\$48,805	\$0	-\$48,805	-	-	-	-	-
14	Energy Leaders Initiative	CCM Savings	67,119	671,186												\$400,000	\$73,775	-\$326,225	1.51	\$74,000	4	67,119	671,186
15	Residential Adaptive Thermostats	CCM Savings	3,024,528	45,367,920												\$876,371	\$1,666,753	\$790,382	2.71	\$8,441,000	17,030	3,150,550	47,258,250
16	Run-it-Right	CCM Savings	387,468	1,937,342												\$1,260,162	\$300,962	-\$959,200	0.67	-\$202,000	39	774,008	3,870,040
17	Small Commercial New Construction	CCM Savings	-	-												\$396,933	\$0	-\$396,933	-	-	-	-	-
18	Home Energy Conservation	CCM Savings	14,988,260	229,695,730												\$12,148,317	\$22,057,458	\$9,909,141	1.96	\$23,071,000	-	17,633,248	270,230,271
19		Participants	N/A	12,986					157.2%	31.5%						N/A	N/A	12,986					
20	Resource Acquisition Overhead												\$5,033,048	\$4,630,077	-\$402,971								
21	Low Income		5,275,898	113,543,335						109.5%	\$1,214,842	\$2,361,462	\$11,945,410	\$8,732,571	-\$3,212,839	1.95	\$9,951,000	2,328	5,282,139	113,605,747			
22	Home Winterproofing	CCM Savings	1,155,256	28,814,754	23,842,500	31,790,000	47,685,000	45%	90.1%	40.8%	\$1,214,842	\$2,361,462	\$5,806,064	\$4,543,350	-\$1,262,714	1.12	\$537,000	1,700	1,159,201	28,854,208			
23	Multi Residential	CCM Savings	4,120,642	84,728,581	48,675,000	64,900,000	97,350,000	45%	130.6%	58.7%					\$3,279,028	\$2,326,325	-\$952,703	3.42	\$11,017,000	622	4,122,938	84,751,540	
24	New Construction	Applications	N/A	6	5	6	9	10%	100.0%	10.0%					\$1,116,696	\$258,877	-\$857,819	N/A	N/A	6			
25	Low Income Overhead												\$1,743,622	\$1,604,019	-\$139,603								
26	Market Transformation									98.6%	\$492,023	\$1,300,595	\$6,579,034	\$6,377,381	-\$201,653	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A			
27	School Energy Competition	Schools	N/A	25	41	55	83	10%	46.4%	4.6%	\$492,023	\$1,300,595	\$302,197	\$289,555	-\$12,642	N/A	N/A	25					
28	Run-it-Right	Participants		84	62	83	124	20%	101.2%	20.2%					\$250,824			\$225,819	-\$25,005	84			
29	Comprehensive Energy Management	Participants		7	5	7	11	20%	100.0%	20.0%					\$464,930			\$106,806	-\$358,124	7			
30	Residential Savings by Design	Builders		31	25	33	50	10%	93.7%	9.4%					\$3,250,842			\$3,469,121	\$218,279	31			
31		Homes		2,206	2,063	2,751	4,127	15%	80.2%	12.0%										2,206			
32	Commercial Savings by Design	Developments		43	25	33	50	25%	129.4%	32.4%					\$1,345,890			\$1,398,940	\$53,050	43			
33	Market Transformation Overhead												\$964,351	\$887,140	-\$77,211								
34	EGD Rate Zone Program Total		50,523,589	837,114,042							\$6,365,751	\$10,450,000	\$52,861,117	\$53,977,669	\$1,116,552	2.60	\$105,458,000	40,318	90,032,041	1,479,088,394			
35	Portfolio Overhead and Administrative Costs													\$3,500,000	\$1,670,616	-\$1,829,384							
36	EGD Rate Zone Portfolio Total													\$56,361,117	\$55,648,285	-\$712,832							

37 *Not all values may compute exactly due to rounding.
38 †CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas.
39 **The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spending to differ from the approved budget. Sections 6.6 and 11.2 of the [Filing Guidelines](#) provide details for acceptable spending differences.

EGD Rate Zone 2017 Resource Acquisition Scorecard and Achievement

	Program/Offering	Metric	Program Level Savings (CCM)	Metric-Level Savings (CCM)	Lower Band	Target	Upper Band	Metric Weight	Percent of Target Metric Achieved	Weighted % of Scorecard Achieved
45	Commercial & Industrial Custom	Large Volume Customer - CCM Savings	299,900,768	328,747,651	249,142,962	332,190,616	498,285,924	40%	99.0%	39.6%
46	Commercial & Industrial Direct Install		4,696,088							
47	Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive		21,806,900							
48	Comprehensive Energy Management		-							
49	Energy Leaders Initiative		406,553							
50	Run-it-Right		1,937,342							
51	Small Commercial New Construction		-							
52	Home Energy Conservation	Small Volume Customer - CCM Savings	229,695,730	394,823,056	224,198,225	298,930,967	448,396,450	40%	132.0%	52.8%
53	Residential Adaptive Thermostats		45,367,920							
54	Commercial & Industrial Custom		15,456,573							
55	Commercial & Industrial Direct Install		74,467,508							
56	Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive		29,570,692							
57	Energy Leaders Initiative		264,633							
58	Home Energy Conservation	Participants	12,986	12,986	6,194	8,259	12,388	20%	157.2%	31.5%

Source: 2016 Natural Gas Demand-Side Management Annual Verification Report (DNV GL) for achievement, and cost effectiveness. Utilities' Data for spend, targets and incentive results (some changes due to Decision and Order EB-2018-0300/EB-2018-0301 that modified targets.)
Created based on Table 1-3 from 2018 Natural Gas Demand-Side Management Annual Verification Report (DNV GL) but some columns have been re-ordered to accommodate additional data.
Participants/units and Gross Annual Savings are not available in the 2016 Annual Verification Report. This data has been taken from the Utilities' Data. This may vary from the Auditor results due to rounding and inability to completely reproduce results. Differences are not material.

Union Rate Zones (2016)

Table 1-3. Union Rate Zones achievement, spend, cost effectiveness, and incentive results*†

8	Program/Offering	Metric	Verified First-Year Savings (m³)	Verified Cumulative Savings or Other Metric	Lower Band	Target	Upper Band	Metric Weight	Percent of Target Metric Achieved	Weighted % of Scorecard Achieved	DSM Shareholder Incentive	Maximum Shareholder Incentive Available	OEB- Approved Program Budget	Utility Spending * *	Budget/ Spending Variance	Cost Effectiveness (TRC Benefit Cost Ratio)	Net Present Value (TRC Plus)	Participants/Units	Gross Annual Natural Gas Savings (m³)	Gross Cumulative Natural Gas Savings (CCM)		
9	Resource Acquisition		46,526,753	814,757,917						105.0%	\$2,907,230	\$6,402,042	\$27,927,833	\$27,585,941	-\$341,892	3.01	\$124,808,924	10,613	110,283,924	1,839,468,214		
10	Commercial & Industrial Custom	CCM Savings	34,079,900	544,862,192	840,194,699	1,120,259,599	1,680,389,398	75%	73.0%	55.0%	\$2,907,230	\$6,402,042	\$7,808,000	\$8,559,792	\$751,792	3.53	\$87,270,221	432	96,817,327	1,549,389,969		
11	Commercial & Industrial Direct Install	CCM Savings	-	-									\$500,000	\$0	-\$500,000	-	-	-	-			
12	Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive	CCM Savings	8,034,415	159,584,798									\$6,755,000	\$4,023,711	-\$2,731,289	3.43	\$26,160,054	3,586	8,821,926	173,961,480		
13	Home Reno Rebate	CCM Savings	4,412,437	110,310,927									\$7,233,000	\$9,689,152	\$2,456,152	1.67	\$11,378,649		4,644,671	116,116,765		
14		Participants	N/A	6,595	2,475	3,300	4,950	25%	200.0%	50.0%						N/A	N/A	6,595				
15	Overhead and Administrative Costs												\$5,631,833	\$5,313,286	-\$318,547							
16	Low Income		2,670,900	64,829,070						103.0%	\$1,151,656	\$2,614,993	\$11,407,470	\$10,400,613	-\$1,006,857	1.53	\$5,265,799	2,010	2,714,980	65,831,099		
17	Home Weatherization	CCM Savings	1,831,630	45,754,201	28,339,761	37,786,348	56,679,521	60.00%	121.0%	73.0%	\$1,151,656	\$2,614,993	\$6,335,000	\$7,588,591	\$1,253,591	1.46	\$3,423,123	1,867	1,831,659	45,754,573		
18	Furnace End-of-Life	CCM Savings	1,617	29,106									\$761,000	\$7800	-\$753,200	0.51	-\$6,693	24	1,617	29,106		
19	Indigenous	CCM Savings	-	-									\$8,000	\$13,632	\$5,632	-	-	-	-			
20	Multi-Family - Social & Assisted	CCM Savings	493,667	10,894,573									\$2,651,000	\$1,767,368	-\$883,632	1.75	\$1,849,369	78	519,613	11,467,220		
21	Multi-Family - Market Rate	CCM Savings	343,986	8,151,190	2,252,430	3,003,240	4,504,860	5.00%	200.0%	10.0%								41	362,091	8,580,200		
22	Overhead and Administrative Costs												\$1,652,470	\$1,023,222	-\$629,248							
23	Large Volume		6,772,053	79,848,302						9.0%	\$0	\$916,941	\$4,000,000	\$2,989,176	-\$1,010,824	5.02	\$12,668,784	71	75,741,890	853,595,980		
24	Large Volume	CCM Savings	6,772,053	79,848,302	668,168,041	890,890,721	1,336,336,082	100%	9.0%	9.0%	\$0	\$916,941	\$3,150,000	\$2,441,555	-\$708,445	5.02	\$12,668,784	71	75,741,890	853,595,980		
25	Overhead and Administrative Costs												\$850,000	\$547,621	-\$302,379							
26	Market Transformation									50.0%	\$0	\$390,403	\$1,703,070	\$1,004,693	-\$698,377	N/A	N/A	0	N/A	N/A		
27	Optimum Home	Homes Built		70.09%	53.00%	70.00%	100.00%	50%	100.0%	50.0%	\$0	\$390,403	\$841,000	\$665,825	-\$175,175							
28	Commercial New Construction	New Developments		0	6	8	12	50%	0.0%	0.0%			\$500,000	\$28,786	-\$471,214							
29	Overhead and Administrative Costs												\$362,070	\$310,082	-\$51,988							
30	Performance Based									108.0%	\$61,844	\$125,621	\$548,000	\$274,604	-\$273,396	N/A	N/A	35	N/A	N/A		
31	RunSmart	Participants	N/A	32	21	28	41	50%	115.0%	58.0%	\$61,844	\$125,621	\$297,000	\$93,103	-\$203,897	N/A	N/A	32	N/A	N/A		
32	Strategic Energy Management	Participants		3	2	3	5	50%	100.0%	50.0%				\$40,152	\$40,152			3				
33	Overhead and Administrative Costs												\$251,000	\$141,349	-\$109,651							
34	Union Rate Zones Program Total		55,969,706	959,435,289							\$4,120,730	\$10,450,000	\$45,586,373	\$42,255,027	-\$3,331,346	2.90	142,743,507	12,729	188,740,794	2,758,895,293		
35	Portfolio Overhead and Administrative Costs														\$11,235,000	\$8,410,624	-\$2,824,376					
36	Union Rate Zones Portfolio Total														\$56,821,373	\$50,665,651	-\$6,155,722					

37 *Not all values may compute exactly due to rounding.
38 †CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas.
39 ** The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spending to differ from the approved budget. Sections 6.6 and 11.2 of the [Filing Guidelines](#) provide details for acceptable spending differences.

Source: 2018 Natural Gas Demand-Side Management Annual Verification Report (DNV GL). Spend from Utility data.
Table 1-1 is the basis but some columns have been re-ordered to accommodate additional data
Columns have been added from other tables in the Annual Verification Report. These are highlighted orange.
Participants/units and Gross Savings are not entirely available in the Annual Verification Report. This data has been taken from the Utilities’ data. This may vary from the Auditor results due to rounding and inability to completely reproduce results. Differences are not material.

EGD Rate Zone (2017)

Table 1-1. EGD Rate Zone savings, spend, cost effectiveness, and incentive results*†

8	Program/Offering	Metric	Verified First-Year Savings (m3)	Verified Cumulative Savings or Other Metric	Lower Band	Target	Upper Band	Metric Weight	Percent of Target Metric Achieved	Weighted % of Scorecard Achieved	DSM Shareholder Incentive	Maximum Shareholder Incentive Available	OEB-Approved Program Budget	Utility Spending* +	Budget/ Spending Variance	Cost Effectiveness (TRC Benefit Cost Ratio)	Net Present Value (TRC Plus)	Participants/Units	Gross Annual Natural Gas Savings (m ³)	Gross Cumulative Natural Gas Savings (CCM)			
9	Resource Acquisition		39,695,229	698,209,189						93.9%	\$2,120,130	\$7,025,881	\$39,488,708	\$40,290,430	\$801,722	2.63	\$104,016,000	31,025	67,186,971	1,126,355,600			
10	Commercial & Industrial Custom	CCM Savings	24,517,940	406,957,161	See separate table below					86.6%	68.9%	\$2,120,130	\$7,025,881	\$7,157,145	\$7,240,134	\$82,989	3.62	\$66,292,000	823	50,031,101	795,451,865		
11	Commercial & Industrial Direct Install	CCM Savings	3,734,401	56,016,021										\$5,060,872	\$1,807,641	-\$3,253,231	5.38	\$9,007,000	258	3,930,949	58,964,233		
12	Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive	CCM Savings	2,437,180	41,009,936										\$2,241,134	\$1,113,533	-\$1,127,601	2.77	\$7,179,000	4,202	2,853,530	48,098,120		
13	Comprehensive Energy Management	CCM Savings	-	-										\$80,184	\$0	-\$80184	-	-					
14	Energy Leaders Initiative	CCM Savings	137,553	1,375,530										\$400,000	\$78,613	-\$321,387	1.60	\$115,000	5	137,553	1,375,530		
15	Residential Adaptive Thermostats	CCM Savings	2,537,549	38,063,232										\$1,525,000	\$1,479,319	-\$45,681	2.90	\$8,613,000	14,288	2,643,280	39,649,200		
16	Run-It-Right	CCM Savings	173,891	869,455										\$1,434,480	\$872,005	-\$562,475	0.24	-\$668,000	59	347,365	1,736,825		
17	Small Commercial New Construction	CCM Savings	-	-										\$1,305,566	\$0	-\$1305566	-	-					
18	Home Energy Conservation	CCM Savings	6,156,714	153,917,853										\$15,180,000	\$22,644,994	\$7,464,994	1.50	\$13,478,000		7,243,193	181,079,827		
19		Participants	N/A	11,390						124.9%	25.0%						N/A	N/A	11,390				
20	Resource Acquisition Overhead												\$5,104,327	\$5,054,191	-\$50,136								
21	Low Income		4,321,445	88,962,125						50.3%	\$0	\$2,228,895	\$12,527,420	\$10,067,601	-\$2,459,819	2.20	\$10,811,000	2,907	4,313,092	89,084,809			
22	Home Winterproofing	CCM Savings	790,266	19,598,357	30,517,631	40,690,174	61,035,261	45%	48.2%	21.7%	\$0	\$2,228,895	\$6,290,000	\$4,539,420	-\$1,750,580	0.89	-\$517,000	1,352	796,791	19,663,606			
23	Multi Residential	CCM Savings	3,531,178	69,363,767	94,799,664	126,399,552	189,599,328	45%	54.9%	24.7%			\$3,418,121	\$2,765,831	-\$652,290	3.52	\$11,328,000	1,544	3,516,301	69,421,203			
24	New Construction	Applications	N/A	11	21	28	42	10%	39.3%	3.9%			\$1,200,000	\$1,158,956	-\$41,044	N/A	N/A	11					
25	Low Income Overhead												\$1,619,299	\$1,603,394	-\$15,905								
26	Market Transformation									66.3%	\$0	\$1,195,224	\$6,717,716	\$7,463,036	\$745,320	N/A	N/A	2,723	N/A	N/A			
27	School Energy Competition	Schools	N/A	65	43	57	86	10%	114.0%	11.4%	\$0	\$1,195,224	\$600,000	\$460,396	-\$139,604	N/A	N/A	65					
28	Run-It-Right	Participants		29	88	117	176	20%	24.1%	4.8%					\$285,520			\$421,777	\$136,257		29		
29	Comprehensive Energy Management	Participants		5	41	55	83	20%	10.7%	2.1%					\$763,861			\$234,085	-\$529,776		5		
30	Residential Savings by Design	Builders		24	24	32	48	10%	75.0%	7.5%					\$3,250,000			\$4,216,284	\$966,284		24		
31		Homes		2,570	1,705	2,273	3,410	15%	113.1%	17.0%											2,570		
32	Commercial Savings by Design	Developments		30	24	32	48	25%	93.8%	23.5%					\$950,000			\$1,270,688	\$320,688		30		
33	Market Transformation Overhead												\$868,335	\$859,806	-\$8,529								
34	EGD Rate Zone Program Total		44,016,673	787,171,313							\$2,120,130	\$10,450,000	\$58,733,844	\$57,821,067	-\$912,777	2.58	\$114,826,000	36,655	71,500,063	1,215,440,409			
35	Portfolio Overhead and Administrative Costs													\$4,200,000	\$5,085,923	\$885,923							
36	EGD Rate Zone Portfolio Total													\$62,933,844	\$62,906,990	-\$26,854							

37 *Not all values may compute exactly due to rounding.
38 †CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas.
39 **The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spending to differ from the approved budget. Sections 6.6 and 11.2 of the [Filing Guidelines](#) provide details for acceptable spending differences.

EGD Rate Zone 2017 Resource Acquisition Scorecard and Achievement

	Program/Offering	Metric	Program Level Savings (CCM)	Metric-Level Savings (CCM)	Lower Band	Target	Upper Band	Metric Weight	Percent of Target Metric Achieved	Weighted % of Scorecard Achieved
45	Commercial & Industrial Custom	Large Volume Customer - CCM Savings	372,554,306	401,225,443	327,070,149	436,093,532	654,140,298	40%	92.0%	36.8%
46	Commercial & Industrial Direct Install		9,352,973							
47	Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive		17,142,080							
48	Comprehensive Energy Management		-							
49	Energy Leaders Initiative		1,306,630							
50	Run-It-Right		869,455							
51	Small Commercial New Construction		-							
52	Home Energy Conservation	Small Volume Customer - CCM Savings	153,917,853	296,983,745	296,983,745	370,375,390	555,563,085	40%	80.2%	32.1%
53	Residential Adaptive Thermostats		38,063,232							
54	Commercial & Industrial Custom		34,402,855							
55	Commercial & Industrial Direct Install		46,663,048							
56	Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive		23,867,857							
57	Energy Leaders Initiative		68,900							
58	Home Energy Conservation	Participants	11,390	11,390	6,837	9,116	13,674	20%	124.9%	25.0%

Source: 2018 Natural Gas Demand-Side Management Annual Verification Report (DNV GL). Spend from Utility data.
Table 1-3 is the basis but some columns have been re-ordered to accommodate additional data
Columns have been added from other tables in the Annual Verification Report. These are highlighted orange.
Participants/units and Gross Savings are not entirely available in the Annual Verification Report. This data has been taken from the Utilities' data. This may vary from the Auditor results due to rounding and inability to completely reproduce results. Differences are not material.

Union Rate Zones (2017)

Table 1-3. Union Rate Zones achievement, spend, cost effectiveness, and incentive results*†

Program/Offering	Metric	Verified First-Year Savings (m³)	Verified Cumulative Savings or Other Metric	Lower Band	Target	Upper Band	Metric Weight	Percent of Target Metric Achieved	Weighted % of Scorecard Achieved	DSM Shareholder Incentive	Maximum Shareholder Incentive Available	OEB- Approved Program Budget	Utility Spending **	Budget/ Spending Variance	Cost Effectiveness (TRC Benefit Cost Ratio)	Net Present Value (TRC Plus)	Participants/Units	Gross Annual Natural Gas Savings (m³)	Gross Cumulative Natural Gas Savings (CCM)	
Resource Acquisition		57,864,098	999,091,347						126.7%	\$4,753,191	\$6,595,243	\$33,404,162	\$44,240,315	\$10,836,153	2.00	\$101,711,000	19,078	118,538,183	2,005,294,378	
Commercial & Industrial Custom	CCM Savings	37,907,520	579,288,646	732,348,080	976,464,106	1,464,696,159	75%	102.3%	76.7%	\$4,753,191	\$6,595,243	\$7,808,000	\$9,216,161	\$1,408,161	2.47	\$63,948,000	581	97,144,048	1,557,120,813	
Commercial & Industrial Direct Install	CCM Savings	1,922,435	28,836,528									\$2,500,000	\$1,449,230	-\$1,050,770	4.93	\$4,756,000	228	2,023,616	30,354,240	
Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive	CCM Savings	10,249,139	196,341,071									\$6,763,000	\$5,202,184	-\$1,560,816	2.70	\$25,630,000	4,540	11,175,778	212,950,797	
Home Reno Rebate	CCM Savings	7,785,004	194,625,102	5,144	6,859	10,289	25%	200.2%	50.0%			\$9,880,000	\$21,375,224	\$11,495,224	1.18	\$7,377,000		8,194,741	204,868,528	
	Participants	N/A	13,729											N/A	N/A	13,729				
Overhead and Administrative Costs												\$6,453,162	\$6,997,515	\$544,353						
Low Income		2,596,404	57,467,519						82.8%	\$304,325	\$2,436,943	\$12,342,841	\$10,882,721	-\$1,460,120	1.21	\$2,335,000	2,353	2,666,702	58,855,704	
Home Weatherization	CCM Savings	1,197,217	29,828,405	33,770,520	45,027,360	67,541,040	60.00%	68.1%	40.9%	\$304,325	\$2,436,943	\$6,136,000	\$6,432,937	\$296,937	0.98	-\$104,000	1,611	1,197,301	29,829,466	
Furnace End-of-Life	CCM Savings	24570	442260									\$784,000	\$168790	-\$615210	0.35	-\$181000	464	24570	442260	
Indigenous	CCM Savings	16,675	406,272									\$419,000	\$212,185	-\$206,815	0.52	-\$84,000	68	16,683	406,369	
Multi-Family - Social & Assisted	CCM Savings	1,180,238	22,426,926	14,512,897	19,350,529	29,025,794	35.00%	115.9%	40.6%			\$3,359,000	\$2,503,499	-\$419,814	1.74	\$2,704,000	169	1,241,091	23,584,287	
Multi-Family - Market Rate	CCM Savings	177,703	4,363,656										\$435,687			41	187,056	4,593,322		
Overhead and Administrative Costs												\$1,644,841	\$1,129,624	-\$515,217						
Large Volume		9,474,468	125,804,115						27.2%	\$0	\$789,751	\$4,000,000	\$2,622,762	-\$1,377,238	1.80	\$10,086,000	48	61,884,178	821,712,050	
Large Volume	CCM Savings	9,474,468	125,804,115	347,325,300	463,100,400	694,650,600	100%	27.2%	27.2%	\$0	\$789,751	\$3,150,000	\$2,127,205	-\$1,022,795	1.80	\$10,086,000	48	61,884,178	821,712,050	
Overhead and Administrative Costs												\$850,000	\$495,557	-\$354,443						
Market Transformation									150.0%	\$461,623	\$461,623	\$2,338,070	\$1,698,246	-\$639,824	N/A	N/A	22	N/A	N/A	
Optimum Home	Builders	N/A	10	8	10	15	20%	100.0%	20.0%	\$461,623	\$461,623	\$841,000	\$685,326	-\$155,674	N/A	N/A	10			
	Homes Built		60.00%	22.50%	30.00%	45.00%	30%	200.0%	60.0%											
Commercial New Construction	New Developments		12	6	8	12	50%	150.0%	75.0%								12			
Overhead and Administrative Costs												\$497,070	\$306,762	-\$190,308						
Performance Based									18.2%	\$0	\$166,440	\$843,000	\$532,776	-\$310,224	N/A	N/A	35	N/A	N/A	
RunSmart	Participants	N/A	35	57	76	114	20%	46.1%	9.2%	\$0	\$166,440	\$200,000	\$162,052	-\$37,948	N/A	N/A	35			
	% Savings		1.49%	7.50%	10.00%	15.00%	60%	14.9%	8.9%											
Strategic Energy Management	Participants		-	24	32	48	20%	-	0.0%											
Overhead and Administrative Costs												\$251,000	\$176,837	-\$74,163						
Union Rate Zones Program Total		69,934,970	1,182,362,981							\$5,519,140	\$10,450,000	\$52,928,073	\$59,976,819	\$7,048,746	1.91	\$114,640,000	21,536	183,089,063	2,885,862,133	
Portfolio Overhead and Administrative Costs													\$5,642,000	\$4,604,292	-\$1,037,708					
Union Rate Zones Portfolio Total													\$58,570,073	\$64,581,110	\$6,011,037					

*Not all values may compute exactly due to rounding.

†CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas.

** The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spending to differ from the approved budget. Sections 6.6 and 11.2 of the [Filing Guidelines](#) provide details for acceptable spending differences.

Source: 2018 Natural Gas Demand-Side Management Annual Verification Report (DNV GL). Spend from Utility data
Table 1-1 is the basis but some columns have been re-ordered to accommodate additional data
Columns have been added from other tables in the Annual Verification Report. These are highlighted orange.
Participants/units and Gross Savings are not entirely available in the Annual Verification Report. This data has been taken from the Utilities' data. This may vary from the Auditor results due to rounding and inability to completely reproduce results. Differences are not material.

EGD Rate Zone (2018)

Table 1-1. EGD Rate Zone savings, spend, cost effectiveness, and incentive results* †

8	Program/Offering	Metric	Verified First-Year Savings (m3)	Verified Cumulative Savings or Other Metric	Lower Band	Target	Upper Band	Metric Weight	Percent of Target Metric Achieved	Weighted % of Scorecard Achieved	DSM Shareholder Incentive	Maximum Shareholder Incentive Available	OEB-Approved Program Budget	Utility Spending**	Budget/ Spending Variance	Cost Effectiveness (TRC Benefit Cost Ratio)	Net Present Value (TRC Plus)	Participants/Units	Gross Annual Natural Gas Savings (m³)	Gross Cumulative Natural Gas Savings (CCM)		
9	Resource Acquisition		36,157,056	677,329,382						101.3%	\$2,955,435	\$7,119,472	\$43,162,456	\$41,427,686	-\$1,734,770	2.26	\$85,211,000	33,692	55,748,795	1,011,021,859		
10	Commercial & Industrial Custom	CCM Savings	19,799,976	352,950,627	See separate table below					84.1%	70.0%	\$2,955,435	\$7,119,472	\$7,361,562	\$7,696,271	\$334,709	3.48	\$54,562,000	508	37,557,690	647,388,799	
11	Commercial & Industrial Direct Install	CCM Savings	3,785,559	56,783,392										\$4,758,344	\$1,726,487	-\$3,031,857	5.35	\$10,053,000	353	3,984,799	59,771,991	
12	Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive	CCM Savings	2,132,567	36,475,770										\$2,232,905	\$1,164,036	-\$1,068,869	2.39	\$5,220,000	2,131	2,506,079	42,931,613	
13	Comprehensive Energy Management	CCM Savings	-	-										\$95,000	\$0	-\$95,000	-	-	-	-	-	
14	Energy Leaders Initiative	CCM Savings	1,206,466	29,708,535										\$400,000	\$324,138	-\$75,862	4.95	\$4,969,000	3	1,206,466	29,708,535	
15	Residential Adaptive Thermostats	CCM Savings	2,888,131	43,321,968										\$2,175,000	\$1,578,427	-\$596,573	2.92	\$10,113,000	16,262	3,008,470	45,127,050	
16	Run-It-Right	CCM Savings	25,991	129,953										\$1,584,600	\$522,385	-\$1,062,215	0.07	-\$486,000	22	51,919	259,595	
17	Small Commercial New Construction	CCM Savings	-	-										\$1,305,566	\$0	-\$1,305,566	-	-	-	-	-	
18	Home Energy Conservation	CCM Savings	6,318,365	157,959,136										\$18,000,000	\$23,256,751	\$5,256,751	1.02	\$782,000	14,413	7,433,371	185,834,276	
19		Participants	N/A	14,413						156.1%	31.2%						N/A	N/A				
20	Resource Acquisition Overhead												\$5,249,479	\$5,159,191	-\$90,288							
21	Low Income		6,069,722	130,147,292						87.0%	\$422,199	\$2,195,295	\$13,309,177	\$12,984,841	-\$324,336	2.32	\$16,074,000	2,779	6,042,260	130,193,197		
22	Home Winterproofing	CCM Savings	697,146	15,978,390	21,392,823	28,523,764	42,785,646	45%	56.0%	25.2%	\$422,199	\$2,195,295	\$6,477,200	\$5,224,730	-\$1,252,470	0.73	-\$1,357,000	1,807	698,549	15,992,420		
23	Multi Residential	CCM Savings	5,372,576	114,168,901	73,159,199	97,545,599	146,318,399	45%	117.0%	52.7%			\$3,813,296	\$4,417,079	\$603,783	3.42	\$17,430,000	959	5,343,711	114,200,777		
24	New Construction	Applications	N/A	13	11	14	21	10%	92.9%	9.2%			\$1,400,000	\$1,752,191	\$352,191	N/A	N/A	13				
25	Low Income Overhead												\$1,618,681	\$1,590,841	-\$27,840							
26	Market Transformation									111.1%	\$605,238	\$1,135,233	\$6,882,454	\$7,486,514	\$604,060	N/A	N/A	3,103	N/A	N/A		
27	School Energy Competition	Schools	N/A	14	59	78	117	10%	15.8%	1.6%	\$605,238	\$1,135,233	\$500,000	\$248,768	-\$251,232	N/A	N/A	14				
28	Run-It-Right	Participants		62	18	24	36	20%	258.3%	40.0%			\$315,400	\$608,623	\$293,223			62				
29	Comprehensive Energy Management	Participants		5	16	21	32	20%	20.0%	4.0%			\$905,000	\$314,424	-\$590,576			5				
30	Residential Savings by Design	Builders		35	15	20	30	10%	175.0%	17.5%			\$3,250,000	\$4,257,045	\$1,007,045			35				
31		Homes		2,956	1,634	2,179	3,269	15%	135.7%	20.3%								2,956				
32	Commercial Savings by Design	Developments		31	21	28	42	25%	110.7%	27.7%			\$1,075,000	\$1,234,997	\$159,997			31				
33	Market Transformation Overhead												\$837,054	\$822,657	-\$14,397							
34	EGD Rate Zone Program Total		42,226,778	807,476,673							\$3,982,872	\$10,450,000	\$63,354,087	\$61,899,041	-\$1,455,046	2.27	\$101,286,000	39,574	61,791,055	1,141,215,056		
35	Portfolio Overhead and Administrative Costs														\$4,200,000	\$4,255,425	\$55,425					
36	EGD Rate Zone Portfolio Total														\$67,554,087	\$66,154,466	-\$1,399,621					

*Not all values may compute exactly due to rounding.
†CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas.
**The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spending to differ from the approved budget. Sections 6.6 and 11.2 of the [Filing Guidelines](#) provide details for acceptable spending differences.

EGD Rate Zone's 2018 Resource Acquisition Scorecard and Achievement

Program/Offering	Metric	Program Level Savings (CCM)	Metric-Level Savings (CCM)	Lower Band	Target	Upper Band	Metric Weight	Percent of Target Metric Achieved	Weighted % of Scorecard Achieved
Commercial & Industrial Custom	Large Volume Customer - CCM Savings	323,139,650	377,787,998	381,344,718	508,459,624	762,689,436	40%	74.3%	29.7%
Commercial & Industrial Direct Install		9,186,763							
Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive		15,642,977							
Comprehensive Energy Management		-							
Energy Leaders Initiative		29,688,655							
Run-it-Right		129,953							
Small Commercial New Construction		-							
Home Energy Conservation	Small Volume Customer - CCM Savings	157,959,136	299,541,383	222,815,737	297,087,649	445,631,474	40%	100.8%	40.3%
Residential Adaptive Thermostats		43,321,968							
Commercial & Industrial Custom		29,810,977							
Commercial & Industrial Direct Install		47,596,629							
Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive		20,832,793							
Energy Leaders Initiative		19,880							
Home Energy Conservation	Participants	14,413	14,413	6,926	9,235	13,853	20%	156.1%	31.2%

Table 1-3 is the basis but some columns have been re-ordered to accommodate additional data

Columns have been added from other tables in the Annual Verification Report. These are highlighted orange.

Participants/units and Gross Savings are not entirely available in the Annual Verification Report. This data has been taken from the Utilities' data. This may vary from the Auditor results due to rounding and inability to completely reproduce results. Differences are not material

Union Rate Zones (2018)

Table 1-3. Union Rate Zones achievement, spend, cost effectiveness, and incentive results* †

Program/Offering	Metric	Verified First-Year Savings (m³)	Verified Cumulative Savings or Other Metric	Lower Band	Target	Upper Band	Metric Weight	Percent of Target Metric Achieved	Weighted % of Scorecard Achieved	DSM Shareholder Incentive	Maximum Shareholder Incentive Available	OEB- Approved Program Budget	Utility Spending* *	Budget/ Spending Variance	Cost Effectiveness (TRC Benefit Cost Ratio)	Net Present Value (TRC Plus)	Participants/Units	Gross Annual Natural Gas Savings (m³)	Gross Cumulative Natural Gas Savings (CCM)	
Resource Acquisition		55,433,375	976,937,929						139.6%	\$5,809,659	\$6,642,647	\$36,633,281	\$46,146,906	\$9,513,625	2.05	\$108,537,000	19,893	105,514,281	1,809,039,310	
Commercial & Industrial Custom	CCM Savings	33,512,717	515,872,191	613,759,123	818,345,497	1,227,518,246	75%	119.4%	89.6%	\$5,809,659	\$6,642,647	\$7,808,000	\$8,379,370	\$571,370	2.46	\$59,748,000	358	82,136,252	1,318,801,709	
Commercial & Industrial Direct Install	CCM Savings	3,396,747	50,951,203									\$2,500,000	\$1,355,104	-\$1,144,896	7.02	\$8,699,000	222	3,575,523	53,632,845	
Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive	CCM Savings	10,318,033	204,967,607									\$7,486,000	\$4,752,739	-\$2,733,261	2.64	\$26,555,000	3,195	11,164,741	220,660,622	
Home Reno Rebate	CCM Savings	8,205,877	205,146,928	6,008	8,010	12,015	25%	201.2%	50.0%			\$12,226,000	\$24,194,382	\$11,968,382	1.30	\$13,536,000		8,637,765	215,944,134	
	Participants	N/A	16,118												N/A	N/A	16,118			
Overhead and Administrative Costs												\$6,613,281	\$7,465,311	\$852,030						
Low Income		2,678,832	58,343,698						83.9%	\$350,811	\$2,460,797	\$13,570,954	\$10,806,455	-\$2,764,500	1.30	\$3,090,000	2,249	2,752,139	59,729,042	
Home Weatherization	CCM Savings	1,278,504	31,815,336	30,755,897	41,007,862	61,511,793	60%	78.2%	46.9%	\$350,811	\$2,460,797	\$7,495,000	\$6,872,283	-\$622,717	1.04	\$289,000	1,885	1,278,623	31,816,819	
Furnace End-of-Life	CCM Savings	-	-									\$924,000	\$0	-\$924,000	-	-				
Indigenous	CCM Savings	9,932	237,038									\$511,000	\$174,604	-\$336,396	0.30	-\$123,000	61	9,941	237,146	
Multi-Family - Social & Assisted	CCM Savings	1,127,472	19,718,214	17,418,187	23,224,249	34,836,374	35%	84.9%	29.7%			\$2,984,000	\$1,985,957	-\$372,226	1.94	\$2,925,000	262	1,186,813	20,756,015	
Multi-Family - Market Rate	CCM Savings	262,924	6,573,109									3,389,095	4,518,793	6,778,190	5%	145.5%	7.3%	\$625,818	41	276,763
Overhead and Administrative Costs												\$1,656,954	\$1,147,793	-\$509,161						
Large Volume		8,055,743	89,196,896						45.6%	\$0	\$725,313	\$4,000,000	\$2,821,881	-\$1,178,119	2.47	\$9,955,000	43	52,604,257	582,379,894	
Large Volume	CCM Savings	8,055,743	89,196,896	146,795,489	195,727,318	293,590,977	100%	45.6%	45.6%	\$0	\$725,313	\$3,150,000	\$2,341,061	-\$808,939	2.47	\$9,955,000				
Overhead and Administrative Costs												\$850,000	\$480,819	-\$369,181						
Market Transformation									107.1%	\$205,755	\$423,958	\$2,338,070	\$2,156,909	-\$181,161	N/A	N/A	26	N/A	N/A	
Optimum Home	Builders	N/A	8	6	8	12	10%	100.0%	10.0%	\$205,755	\$423,958	\$841,000	\$847,194	\$6,194	N/A	N/A	8			
	Homes Built		83.33%	45.00%	60.00%	90.00%	30%	138.9%	41.7%											
	% of Homes Built		3.97%	3.75%	5.00%	7.50%	10%	79.4%	7.9%											
Commercial New Construction	New Developments		18	14	19	29	50%	94.7%	47.5%			\$1,000,000	\$988,548	-\$11,452			18			
Overhead and Administrative Costs												\$497,070	\$321,167	-\$175,903						
Performance Based									61.3%	\$0	\$197,285	\$1,088,000	\$694,395	-\$393,605	N/A	N/A	47	N/A	N/A	
RunSmart	Participants	N/A	44	33	44	66	10%	100.0%	10.0%	\$0	\$197,285	\$193,000	\$145,265	-\$47,735	N/A	N/A	44			
	% Savings		0.51%	1.47%	1.96%	2.94%	40%	26.0%	10.4%											
Strategic Energy Management	Participants		3	2	3	5	10%	100.0%	10.0%											
	% Savings		3.86%	3.75%	5.00%	7.50%	40%	77.2%	30.9%			\$644,000	\$357,804	-\$286,196			3			
Overhead and Administrative Costs												\$251,000	\$191,326	-\$59,674						
Union Rate Zones Program Total		66,167,950	1,124,478,523							\$6,366,226	\$10,450,000	\$57,630,305	\$62,626,546	\$4,996,241	2.01	\$121,582,000	22,258	160,870,677	2,451,148,246	
Portfolio Overhead and Administrative Costs												\$5,642,000	\$6,496,375	\$854,375						
Union Rate Zones Portfolio Total												\$63,272,305	\$69,122,921	\$5,850,616						

*Not all values may compute exactly due to rounding

†CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas.

** The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spending to differ from the approved budget. Sections 6.6 and 11.2 of the [Filing Guidelines](#) provide details for acceptable spending differences.

Union Rate Zones (DRAFT 2019)

Union Rate Zones achievement, spend, cost effectiveness, and incentive results* †

Program/Offering	Metric	Draft First-Year Savings (m3)	Draft Cumulative Savings or Other Metric	Lower Band	Target	Upper Band	Metric Weight	Percent of Target Metric Achieved	Weighted % of Scorecard Achieved	DSM Shareholder Incentive	Maximum Shareholder Incentive Available	OEB- Approved Program Budget	Utility Spending * +	Budget/ Spending Variance	Cost Effectiveness (TRC Benefit Cost Ratio)	Net Present Value (TRC Plus)	Participants/Units	Draft Gross Annual Natural Gas Savings (m³)	Draft Gross Cumulative Natural Gas Savings (CCM)		
Resource Acquisition		55,337,645	967,385,296						130.0%	\$5,007,955	\$6,584,609	\$36,310,983	\$40,581,858	\$4,270,875	2.48	\$129,029,880	17,942	113,058,378	1,965,351,256		
Commercial & Industrial Custom	CCM Savings	36,781,872	595,312,464	560,567,790	747,423,720	1,121,135,581	75%	129.4%	97.1%	\$5,007,955	\$6,584,609	\$7,808,000	\$8,865,926	\$1,057,926	3.10	\$115,906,064	399	93,328,715	1,570,477,989		
Commercial & Industrial Direct Install	CCM Savings	4,852,657	72,789,855									\$2,500,000	\$2,011,911	-\$488,089			300	5,108,060	76,620,900		
Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive	CCM Savings	6,952,335	136,124,416									\$7,149,000	\$3,242,754	-\$3,906,246			2,480	7,521,670	146,598,798		
Residential Adaptive Thermostats	CCM Savings	561,096	8,416,434									\$0	\$550,816	\$550,816			3,805	584,475	8,767,119		
Home Reno Rebate	CCM Savings	6,189,685	154,742,128				25%	131.9%	33.0%			\$12,226,000	\$19,815,812	\$7,589,812				6,515,458	162,886,450		
	Participants	N/A	10,958									6,231	8,308	12,462				10,958			
Overhead and Administrative Costs												\$6,627,983	\$6,094,638	-\$533,345				10,958			
Low Income		3,641,030	80,501,296						116.2%	\$1,524,391	\$2,564,994	\$14,144,719	\$13,367,910	-\$776,809	1.62	\$7,700,884	7,957	3,713,052	81,911,364		
Home Weatherization	CCM Savings	2,305,558	53,928,316	32,841,561	43,788,748	65,683,123	60%	124.6%	74.7%	\$1,524,391	\$2,564,994	\$8,063,000	\$9,254,777	\$1,191,777			7,298	2,309,099	53,979,350		
Furnace End-of-Life	CCM Savings	5,922	106,596									\$919,000	\$36075	-\$882,925			111	5922	106596		
Indigenous	CCM Savings	22,111	514,326									\$456,000	\$327,899	-\$128,101			221	22,140	514,660		
Multi-Family - Social & Assisted	CCM Savings	1,137,876	21,754,896									\$3,031,000	\$2,598,715	-\$432,285			262	1,197,675	22,898,091		
Multi-Family - Market Rate	CCM Savings	169,562	4,197,162	4,703,219	6,270,958	9,406,437	5%	66.9%	3.3%								65	178,216	4,412,667		
Overhead and Administrative Costs												\$1,675,719	\$1,150,443	-\$525,276							
Large Volume		8,270,053	80,002,423						58.1%	\$0	\$725,357	\$4,000,000	\$3,088,606	-\$911,394	2.72	\$10,215,943	47	54,017,329	522,550,116		
Large Volume	CCM Savings	8,270,053	80,002,423	103,250,094	137,666,792	206,500,188	100%	58.1%	58.1%	\$0	\$725,357	\$3,150,000	\$2,684,610	-\$465,390			47	54,017,329	522,550,116		
Overhead and Administrative Costs												\$850,000	\$403,996	-\$446,004							
Market Transformation									137.7%	\$361,543	\$423,984	\$2,338,070	\$2,241,994	-\$96,076	N/A	N/A	26	N/A	N/A		
Optimum Home	Builders	N/A	4	3	4	6	10%	100.0%	10.0%	\$361,543	\$423,984	\$841,000	\$817,193	-\$23,807			4				
	Homes Built		95.45%	68.00%	90.00%	100.00%	10%	127.3%	12.7%												
	% of Homes Built		28.12%	3.25%	4.34%	6.50%	30%	200.0%	60.0%												
Commercial New Construction	New Developments		22	15	20	30	50%	110.0%	55.0%			\$1,000,000	\$924,147	-\$75,853			22				
Overhead and Administrative Costs												\$497,070	\$500,654	\$3,584							
Performance Based									30.8%	\$0	\$151,056	\$833,000	\$579,846	-\$253,154	0.01	-\$535,205	100	N/A	N/A		
RunSmart	Participants	N/A	59	42	56	84	10%	105.4%	10.5%	\$0	\$151,056	\$582,000	\$153,632	-\$119,361			59				
	% Savings		0.35%	0.52%	0.70%	1.05%	40%	50.6%	20.2%								41				
	% Savings		0.00%	3.56%	4.75%	7.12%	50%	0.0%	0.0%				\$309,007								
Strategic Energy Management																					
Overhead and Administrative Costs												\$251,000	\$117,207	-\$133,793							
Union Rate Zones Program Total		67,248,728	1,127,889,015							\$6,893,889	\$10,450,000	\$57,626,772	\$59,860,214	\$2,233,442	2.27	\$141,376,182	26,072	170,788,759	2,569,812,736		
Portfolio Overhead and Administrative Costs													\$5,642,000	\$5,744,092	\$102,092						
Union Rate Zones Portfolio Total														\$63,268,772	\$65,604,306	\$2,335,534					

*Not all values may compute exactly due to rounding.
†CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas.
** The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spending to differ from the approved budget. Sections 6.6 and 11.2 of the [Filing Guidelines](#) provide details for acceptable spending differences.