

Adam Stiers Technical Manager Regulatory Applications Regulatory Affairs

Tel: (519) 436-4558 Email: <u>astiers@uniongas.com</u> EGIRegulatoryProceedings@enbridge.com Enbridge Gas Inc. P.O. Box 2001 50 Keil Drive N. Chatham, Ontario, N7M 5M1 Canada

May 25, 2020

BY RESS And EMAIL

Ms. Christine Long Board Secretary Ontario Energy Board 2300 Yonge Street, 27th Floor Toronto, ON M4P 1E4

Dear Ms. Long:

Re: EB-2019-0271 – Enbridge Gas Inc. (Enbridge Gas) – 2021 DSM Plans – Updated Interrogatory Responses

In accordance with the Ontario Energy Board's ("OEB" or "Board") Procedural Order No. 3 and Decision on Green Energy Coalition Motion, dated May 14, 2020, attached are updated responses to:

- Exhibit I.GEC.1 including detailed measure-level tracking data in the manner provided to the OEB's Evaluation Contractor for the Home Energy Conservation, Home Reno Rebate and two Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive programs for the 2017 and 2018 program years, at Attachments 1 and 2; and
- Exhibit I.SEC.12 including draft 2019 program results, in the same manner as originally filed by Enbridge Gas on April 6, 2020, at Attachment 5.

Enbridge Gas has delivered Exhibit I.GEC.1 Attachments 1 and 2, in excel spreadsheet format due to file size. This submission has been delivered to all parties, as directed by the Board.

If you have any questions, please contact the undersigned.

Sincerely,

[original signed by]

Adam Stiers Technical Manager, Regulatory Applications

c.c.: Dennis O'Leary (Aird & Berlis) Josh Wasylyk (OEB Staff) Michael Millar (OEB Counsel) EB-2019-0271 (Intervenors)

UPDATED: 2020-05-25 EB-2019-0271 Exhibit I.GEC.1 Page 1 of 3 Plus Attachment(s)

ENBRIDGE GAS INC.

Answer to Interrogatory from Green Energy Coalition (GEC)

Interrogatory

Question:

Please provide an Excel spreadsheet, with formulae and calculations intact, that shows the following for each efficiency measure and for each program – separately for Enbridge and Union Gas – that was supported in 2017, 2018 and 2019:

- a. The program name
- b. The measure name and description
- c. The per unit gas savings (m3), electric savings (kWh), water savings (litres), incremental cost, measure life and net-to-gross assumption used to estimate savings achieved in each year. For programs for which measure level data are not available (e.g. because savings are tracked at a measure bundle or program level only), as well as for C&I custom programs, please provide average per participant savings, incremental cost, measure life for the measure bundle.
- d. The actual number of participants per measure (or measure bundle or C&I Custom program).
- e. The gross realization rate adjustment factor applied (for the years for which it is available)
- f. The net-to-gross assumption used at the measure level (if applicable) or at the program level (if not applicable at the measure level).
- g. A computation of the net first year savings per measure (per measure savings multiplied by number of measures/participants multiplied by the gross realization rate multiplied by the net-to-gross ratio).
- h. A computation of the net lifetime savings per measure (per measure first year savings multiplied by measure life)
- i. The sum of net savings, both first year and lifetime, across all measures in each program and for the portfolio as a whole.
- j. The rebate level (or average rebate level for measures or measure bundles for which rebate levels vary by customer or project).
- k. Total rebate payments by measure (or measure bundle), program and program portfolio.
- I. Total non-rebate spending by program, including non-resource acquisition programs, and for the portfolio as a whole, broken down by any sub-categories that are separately tracked.

Response

Much of the information sought through this interrogatory exceeds the scope of Enbridge Gas's 2021 DSM Plans proceeding as defined within the OEB's Procedural Order No. 1.¹ Please see the response at Exhibit I.BOMA.4, for discussion regarding the scope of this proceeding established by the OEB. Accordingly, Enbridge Gas has provided limited responses to this interrogatory in an effort to be as responsive as reasonably possible and to comply with the OEB's Procedural Order No. 3, dated May 14, 2020.

Consistent with the OEB's direction in Procedural Order No. 3, Enbridge Gas has filed this updated interrogatory response to include detailed measure-level tracking data in the manner provided to the OEB's Evaluation Contractor for the Home Energy Conservation, Home Reno Rebate and two Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive programs for the 2017 and 2018 program years.²

The relevant information requested can be found in-part in the response at Exhibit I.SEC.12, as reasonably available.

For 2015 DSM program year details, please see the response at Exhibit I.SEC.12 Attachment 1.

For 2016 DSM program year details, please see the response at Exhibit I.SEC.12 Attachment 2

For Draft 2017 budget, expenditure and savings details (as Enbridge Gas has not yet filed a 2017/2018 DSM Deferral and Variance Account Clearance application with the OEB), please see the response at Exhibit I.SEC.12 Attachment 3.

For Draft 2018 budget, expenditure and savings details (as Enbridge Gas has not yet filed a 2017/2018 DSM Deferral and Variance Account clearance application with the OEB), please see the response at Exhibit I.SEC.12 Attachment 4.

For Draft 2019 budget, expenditure and savings details (as 2019 DSM program year details are pre-audit), please see the response at Exhibit I.SEC.12 Attachment 5.

For Draft 2017 and 2018 Union rate zones measure-level data for the Home Reno Rebate and Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive programs (as Enbridge Gas has not

¹ EB-2019-0271, OEB Procedural Order No. 1 (February 24, 2020), p. 3.

² EB-2019-0271, OEB Procedural Order No. 3 (May 14, 2020), p. 4.

yet filed a 2017/2018 DSM Deferral and Variance Account clearance application with the OEB), please see Attachment 1.

For Draft 2017 and 2018 EGD rate zone measure-level data for the Home Energy Conservation and Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive programs (as Enbridge Gas has not yet filed a 2017/2018 DSM Deferral and Variance Account clearance application with the OEB), please see Attachment 2.

Due to their size, and as originally requested by GEC, Attachments 1 and 2 have been provided in excel spreadsheet format only. Consistent with the OEB's direction in Procedural Order No. 3 Enbridge Gas has delivered this updated response, including attachments, to all parties.

UPDATED: 2020-05-25 EB-2019-0271 Exhibit I.SEC.12 Page 1 of 1 Plus Attachment(s)

ENBRIDGE GAS INC.

Answer to Interrogatory from <u>School Energy Coalition (SEC)</u>

Interrogatory

Reference:

[General]

Question:

The 2018 Audit Report contains tables 1-1 through 1-4. Please file those tables for 2018, and the same data in the same format for each of 2015, 2016, 2017, and 2019.

Response

Consistent with the OEB's direction in Procedural Order No. 3, Enbridge Gas has filed this updated interrogatory response to include Draft 2019 program results, in the same manner as the original response filed April 6, 2020.¹ Consistent with the OEB's direction in Procedural Order No. 3, Enbridge Gas has delivered this updated response, including attachments, to all parties.

For 2015 DSM program year details, please see Attachment 1.

For 2016 DSM program year details, please see Attachment 2.

For Draft 2017 DSM program year details (as Enbridge Gas has not yet filed a 2017/2018 DSM Deferral and Variance Account Clearance application with the OEB), please see Attachment 3.

For Draft 2018 DSM program year details (as Enbridge Gas has not yet filed a 2017/2018 DSM Deferral and Variance Account Clearance application with the OEB), please see Attachment 4.

For Draft 2019 DSM program year details (as 2019 DSM program year details are preaudit), please see Attachment 5.

¹ EB-2019-0271, OEB Procedural Order No. 3 (May 14, 2020), pp. 4-5.

Filed: 2020-04-06, EB-2019-0271, Exhibit I.SEC.12, Attachment 1, Page 1 of 2

Source: Utilities' 2015 Demand Side Management Annual Report. Targets and spend are consistent with those presented in the 2015 Natural Gas Demand-Side Management Annual Verification Report (DNV GL), however, actual achievement was modified through Decision and Order EB-2017-0323/EB-2017-0324, which also impacts incentives and cost effectiveness. Created based on Table 1-3 from 2018 Natural Gas Demand-Side Management Annual Verification Report (DNV GL) but some columns have been re-ordered to accommodate additional data.

EGD Rate Zone (2015)

Table 1-1. EGD Rate Zone savings, spend, cost effectiveness, and incentive results*†

Program/Offering	Metric	Verified First-Year Savings (m3)	Verified Cumulative Savings or Other Metric	Lower Band	Target	Upper Band	Metric Weight	Percent of Target Metric Achieved	Weighted % of Scorecard Achieved***	DSM Shareholder Incentive	Maximum Shareholder Incentive Available	OEB-Approved Program Budget	Utility Spending**	Budget/ Spending Variance	Cost Effectiveness (TRC Benefit Cost Ratio)	Net Present Value (TRC Plus)	Participants/Units	Gross Annual Natural Gas Savings (m³)	Gross Cumulative Natural Gas Savings (CCM)
Resource Acquisition		44,698,971	734,128,834						152.3%	\$6,482,744	\$6,482,744	\$19,175,275	\$23,389,805	\$4,214,530	3.12	\$109,161,947	23,463	62,780,541	1,021,749,154
Commercial & Industrial Custom	CCM Savings	31,325,608	524,020,079	758,900,000	1,011,900,000	1,264,900,000	92%	45.1%	41.5%	\$6,482,744	\$6,482,744	\$12,571,070	\$6,821,798	-\$4,182,640	3.74	\$86,594,569	677	46,951,420	771,244,862
Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive	CCM Savings	6,073,751	105,009,436										\$107,736		5.65	\$18,362,440	17,112	7,336,075	127,331,700
Run-it-Right	CCM Savings	536,821	2,684,105										\$1,458,896		0.33	-\$1,068,205	28	536,821	2,684,105
Home Energy Conservation	CCM Savings	6,762,791	102,415,214								Γ	\$1,872,720	\$9,362,295	\$7,489,575	2.24	\$10,912,223		7,956,225	120,488,487
	Deep Savings Participants	N/A	5,646	571	762	952	8%	1385.3%	110.8%						N/A	N/A	5,646		
Resource Acquisition	Overhead	-						-				\$4,731,485	\$5,639,080	\$907,595		-			
Low Income		4,272,585	92,036,617						116.2%	\$1,483,792	\$2,495,721	\$7,382,078	\$7,173,711	-\$208,367	1.88	\$7,166,734	4,674	4,306,970	92,380,469
Single Family (Part 9)	CCM Savings	1,129,070) 28,067,263	18,100,000	24,100,000	30,200,000	50%	132.5%	66.2%	\$1,483,792	\$2,495,721	\$4,655,790	\$4,444,616	-\$211,174	1.06	\$232,036	1,343	1,135,609	28,132,657
Multi Residential (Part 3)	CCM Savings	3,143,515	63,969,353	51,600,000	68,700,000	86,000,000	45%	86.2%	38.8%			\$2,208,300	\$2,111,746	-\$96,554	3.20	\$7,552,047	3,331	3,171,361	64,247,812
Multi Residential (Part 3)	Participants (%)	N/A	64.7%	30%	40%	50%	5%	223.5%	11.2%					\$0	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Low Income	Overhead											\$517,988	\$617,349	\$99,361					
Market Transformation										\$2,111,159	\$2,111,159	\$6,244,587	\$4,657,079	-\$1,587,508	N/A	N/A	44,013	N/A	N/A
Residential Savings By Design									170.5%	\$1,076,493	\$1,076,493	\$2,493,900	\$2,032,022	-\$461,878	N/A	N/A	2,006	N/A	N/A
Residential Savings by Design	Builders	N/A	19	13	18	22	60%	112.5%	67.5%	\$1,076,493	\$1,076,493	\$2,493,900	\$2,032,022	-\$461,878			19		
	Homes		1,987	833	1,111	1,389	40%	257.6%	103.0%								1,987		
Commercial Savings By Design									150.0%	\$418,269	\$418,269	\$969,000	\$890,464	-\$78,536	N/A	N/A	24	N/A	N/A
Commercial Savings by Design	Developments	N/A	24	11	18	24	100%	150.0%	150.0%	\$418,269	\$418,269	\$969,000	\$890,464	-\$78,536			24		
Home Labelling (Rating)									236.9%	\$616,397	\$616,397	\$1,428,000	\$121,241	-\$1,306,759	N/A	N/A	41,983	N/A	N/A
Home Labelling	Commitments	N/A	41,650	N/A	5,001	10,001	50%	466.5%	233.2%	\$616,397	\$616,397	\$1,428,000	\$121,241	-\$1,306,759			41,650		
	Ratings Performed		333	2,250	4,500	6,750	50%	7.4%	3.7%								333		
Market Transformation	Overhead		•						•			\$1,353,687	\$1,613,352	\$259,665				•	
EGD Rate Zone Program Total		48,971,556	826,165,451							\$10,077,695	\$11,089,624	\$32,801,940	\$35,220,595	\$2,418,655	2.95	\$116,328,681	72,150	67,087,511	1,114,129,623
Portfolio Overhead and Administrative Costs												\$4,920,291	\$559,378	-\$4,360,913					
EGD Rate Zone Portfolio Total												\$37,722,231	\$35,779,973	-\$1,942,258					

34 *Not all values may compute exactly due to rounding.
35 †CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas.

36 **The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spending to differ from the approved budget. Sections 6.6 and 11.2 of the <u>Filing Guidelines</u> provide details for acceptable spending differences.

38 ***Actual scorecard achievements are shown but weighted scorecard is capped at 150%.

Filed: 2020-04-06, EB-2019-0271, Exhibit I.SEC.12, Attachment 1, Page 2 of 2

Source: Utilities' 2015 Demand Side Management Annual Report. Targets and spend are consistent with those presented in the 2015 Natural Gas Demand-Side Management Annual Verification Report (DNV GL), however, actual achievement was modified through Decision and Order EB-2017-0323/EB-2017-0324, which also impacts incentives and cost effectiveness. Created based on Table 1-3 from 2018 Natural Gas Demand-Side Management Annual Verification Report (DNV GL) but some columns have been re-ordered to accommodate additional data.

Union Rate Zones (2015)

Table 1-3. Union Rate Zones achievement, spend, cost effectiveness, and incentive results*†

Program/Offering	Metric	Verified First-Year Savings (m ³)	Verified Cumulative Savings or Other Metric	Lower Band	Target	Upper Band	Metric Weight	Percent of Target Metric Achieved	Weighted % of Scorecard Achieved***	DSM Shareholder Incentive	Maximum Shareholder Incentive Available	OEB- Approved Program Budget	Utility Spending**	Budget/ Spending Variance	Cost Effectiveness (TRC Benefit Cost Ratio)	Net Present Value (TRC)	Participants/Units	Gross Annual Natural Gas Savings (m ³)	Gross Cumulative Natural Gas Saving (CCM)
Resource Acquisition		56,239,793	919,157,080						130.9%	\$4,443,225	\$5,761,833	\$15,185,808	\$16,818,607	\$1,632,799	2.68	\$105,948,039	25,912	108,355,744	1,737,648,08
Commercial & Industrial Custom	CCM Savings	42,588,031	664,199,557	612,421,364	816,561,818	1,020,702,273	90%	125.1%	112.6%	\$4,443,225	\$5,761,833	\$4,984,937	\$5,512,879	\$527,942	3.53	\$88,200,561	588	92,582,677	1,443,912,08
Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive	CCM Savings	9,283,248	182,411,887									\$3,806,470	\$2,831,233	-\$975,237	3.16	\$21,692,889	3,042	10,659,544	208,919,00
Energy Savings Kit	CCM Savings	1,179,468	14,800,935									\$2,779,776	\$4,525,364	\$1,745,588	5.40	\$2,907,038	19,753	1,361,705	16,882,05
Home Reno Rebate	CCM Savings	3,189,046	57,744,701												0.78	-\$2,903,318		3,751,818	67,934,94
	Participants	N/A	2,529	934	1,245	1,556	5%	306.3%	15.3%						N/A	N/A	2,529		
Commercial & Industrial Deep Savings	% Savings	N/A	8.08%	7.88%	8.88%	9.88%	5%	60.0%	3.0%			-	-	-					
Overhead and Administrative Co	sts											\$3,614,625	\$3,949,131	\$334,506					
Low Income		2,309,842	52,180,787						139.7%	\$2,462,534	\$2,810,129	\$7,406,335	\$7,701,034	\$294,699	1.07	\$552,817	1,603	2,355,887	53,040,83
Single Family (Part 9)	CCM Savings	1,435,616	35,847,426	19,500,000	26,000,000	32,500,000	60.00%	175.8%	105.4%	\$2,462,534	\$2,810,129	\$4,712,975	\$4,836,139	\$123,164	1.32	\$1,460,361	1,472	1,435,649	35,847,82
Multi-Family (Part 3)	CCM Savings	874,226	16,333,361	13,200,000	17,600,000	22,000,000	40.00%	85.6%	34.2%			\$1,597,857	\$1,808,928	\$211,071	1.06	\$148,423	131	920,238	17,193,01
Overhead and Administrative Co	osts	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·						•				\$1,095,503	\$1,055,967	-\$39,536					
Large Volume		66,527,557	779,427,613						21.8%	\$0	\$1,862,877	\$4,909,773	\$3,209,716	-\$1,700,057	6.97	\$113,820,505	150	144,457,130	1,691,806,72
Rate T1	CCM Savings	8,842,211	121,416,767	154,692,013	206,256,017	257,820,021	60%	17.7%	11.1%	\$0	\$1,862,877	\$1,250,254	\$477,540	-\$772,714	7.62	\$18,645,277	40	19,205,955	263,624,64
Rate T2/100	CCM Savings	57,685,346	658,010,847	772,381,040	1,029,841,387	1,287,301,734	40%	27.8%	10.6%			\$2,634,452	\$1,745,745	-\$888,707	7.30	\$96,161,659	110	125,251,175	1,428,182,08
Overhead and Administrative Co	osts							-				\$1,025,067	\$986,431	-\$38,636					
Market Transformation									305.7%	\$566,721	\$566,721	\$1,493,642	\$1,405,340	-\$88,302	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Optimum Home	Homes Built	N/A	50.3%	24.73%	29.73%	34.73%	100%	305.7%	305.7%	\$566,721	\$566,721	\$1,283,349	\$1,018,637	-\$264,712					
Overhead and Administrative Co	osts	-										\$210,293	\$386,703	\$176,410					
Union Program Total		125,077,193	1,750,765,480							\$7,472,480	\$11,001,560	\$28,995,558	\$29,134,697	\$139,139	3.33	217,424,127	27,665	255,168,761	3,482,495,64
Portfolio Overhead and Administrative	e Costs											\$4,992,321	\$3,257,947	-\$1,734,374					
Union Rate Zones Portfolio Total												\$33,987,879	\$32,392,644	-\$1,595,235					

31 *Not all values may compute exactly due to rounding. 32 †CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas.

33 ** The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spending to differ from the approved budget. Sections 6.6 and 11.2 of the <u>Filing Guidelines</u> provide details for acceptable spending differences.

35 ***Actual scorecard achievements are shown but weighted scorecard is capped at 150%.

Filed: 2020-04-06, EB-2019-0271, Exhibit I.SEC.12, Attachment 2, Page 1 of 2

Source: 2016 Natural Gas Demand-Side Management Annual Verification Report (DNV GL) for achievement, spend, and cost effectiveness. Utilities' data for targets and incentive results due to Decision and Order EB-2018-0300/EB-2018-0301 that modified targets. Created based on Table 1-3 from 2018 Natural Gas Demand-Side Management Annual Verification Report (DNV GL) but some columns have been re-ordered to accommodate additional data. Participants/units and Gross Annual Savings are not available in the 2016 Annual Verification Report. This data has been taken from the Utilities' data. This data may vary from the Auditor results due to rounding and inability to completely reproduce results. Differences are not material.

EGD Rate Zone (2016)

Table 1-1. EGD Rate Zone savings, spend, cost effectiveness, and incentive results * †

manual material materi				Varified Currenteting					Dereceded	Woighted 04	DEM	Maximum				Cost			Gross Appual	Cross C
matchmatchdatadatadatamatchma	Program/Offering	Metric		Savings or Other	Lower Band	Target	Upper Band	Metric Weight	Target Metric	Scorecard	Shareholder			Utility Spending**				Participants/Units	Natural Gas Savings	Natural (
and 1 data67 days67 days1 1/2 fr 1									Achieved											
man 1 wind wind wind wind wind wind wind wind	source Acquisition		45,247,691	723,570,707						123.9%	\$4,658,886	\$6,787,943	\$34,336,673	\$38,867,717	\$4,531,044	4 2.73	\$95,507,000	37,990	84,749,901	1,
mark i	mmercial & Industrial Custom	CCM Savings	18,327,992			See separat	e table below			92.4%	\$4,658,886	\$6,787,943	\$7,020,664	\$6,746,119	-\$274,545	5 4.04	\$48,734,000	677	53,834,552	
and single dialand dialand dialand dialand dialand dialand dialand dialand dialand single dialand dial	mmercial & Industrial Direct Install	CCM Savings	5,277,573	79,163,595									\$4,955,421	\$2,390,902	-\$2,564,519	9 10.80	\$11,971,000	345	5,555,340	
gind find (a) (a) (b) (b) (b) (b) (c) (c)(b) (c)(b) (c)	mmercial & Industrial Prescriptive	CCM Savings	3,174,750	51,377,592									\$2,196,952	\$1,001,671	1 -\$1,195,281	3.24	\$8,047,000	6,909	3,735,085	
Number stateTotal st	omprehensive Energy Management	CCM Savings	-	-									\$48,805	\$C	-\$48,805	ō -	-	-	-	
randomrand	nergy Leaders Initiative	CCM Savings	67,119	671,186									\$400,000	\$73,775	-\$326,225	5 1.51	\$74,000	4	67,119	
a bin	esidential Adaptive Thermostats	_	3,024,528	45,367,920									\$876,371	\$1,666,753	\$ \$790,382	2 2.71	\$8,441,000	17,030	3,150,550	
in the field in the interval i	un-it-Right	CCM Savings	387,468	1,937,342									\$1,260,162	\$300,962	-\$959,200	0.67	-\$202,000	39	774,008	
numbernumb	nall Commercial New Construction	CCM Savings	-	-									\$396,933	\$C	-\$396,933	- 3	-	-	-	
base bit bit <td>ome Energy Conservation</td> <td>CCM Savings</td> <td>14,988,260</td> <td>229,695,730</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>\$12,148,317</td> <td>\$22,057,458</td> <td>\$9,909,141</td> <td>1 1.96</td> <td>\$23,071,000</td> <td></td> <td>17,633,248</td> <td></td>	ome Energy Conservation	CCM Savings	14,988,260	229,695,730									\$12,148,317	\$22,057,458	\$9,909,141	1 1.96	\$23,071,000		17,633,248	
sharp <th< td=""><td></td><td>Participants</td><td>N/A</td><td>12,986</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>157.2%</td><td>31.5%</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>N/A</td><td>N/A</td><td>12,986</td><td></td><td></td></th<>		Participants	N/A	12,986					157.2%	31.5%						N/A	N/A	12,986		
or description of the base	Resource Acquisition Ove	erhead							-	-			\$5,033,048	\$4,630,077	7 -\$402,971	1				
Selection Selection Selection Mathematic Mathema	w Income		5,275,898	113,543,335						109.5%	\$1,214,842	\$2,361,462	\$11,945,410	\$8,732,571	-\$3,212,839	9 1.95	\$9,951,000	2,328	5,282,139	
Selection Obtained Obt	ome Winterproofing	CCM Savings	1 155 256	28 814 754	23 842 500	31 790 000	47 685 000	45%	90.1%	40.8%	\$1 214 842	\$2 361 462	\$5,806,064	\$4 543 350	-\$1 262 714	1 1 12	\$537,000	1 700	1 159 201	
Shame of the problemImage of the problem <th< td=""><td>· •</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>ψ1,211,012</td><td>¢2,001,102</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></th<>	· •										ψ1,211,012	¢2,001,102								
In chardward Image: Control of the				6	-0,070,000	6	,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,											6	4,122,750	
neh forward seriesNote of seriesNote of series			N/A	0	5	0	,	1070	100.070	10.070							W/A	0		
inverse inverse <t< td=""><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></t<>																				
mining mining<	arket Transformation									98.6%	\$492,023	\$1,300,595	\$6,579,034	\$6,377,381	-\$201,653	B N/A	N/A		N/A	
Image: space	hool Energy Competition	Schools	N/A	25	41	55	83	10%	46.4%	4.6%	\$492,023	\$1,300,595	\$302,197	\$289,555	5 -\$12,642	2 N/A	N/A	25		
Matche America Matche	un-it-Right	Participants	-	84	62	83	124	20%	101.2%	20.2%		·	\$250,824	\$225,819	-\$25,005	5		84		
Imme Impe Impe <th< td=""><td>omprehensive Energy Management</td><td>Participants</td><td></td><td>7</td><td>5</td><td>7</td><td>11</td><td>20%</td><td>100.0%</td><td>20.0%</td><td></td><td></td><td>\$464,930</td><td>\$106,806</td><td>-\$358,124</td><td>1</td><td></td><td>7</td><td></td><td></td></th<>	omprehensive Energy Management	Participants		7	5	7	11	20%	100.0%	20.0%			\$464,930	\$106,806	-\$358,124	1		7		
Image is program in the second by the second is program in the second is	sidential Savings by Design	Builders	-	31	25	33	50	10%	93.7%	9.4%			\$3,250,842	\$3,469,121	1 \$218,279	9		31		
Kannet instrumente dentende Kannet instrumente dentende State dans formante dans fo		Homes	-	2,206	2,063	2,751	4,127	15%	80.2%	12.0%								2,206		
1 sha 2 and (regree 1 regree)	ommercial Savings by Design	Developments	-	43	25	33	50	25%	129.4%	32.4%			\$1,345,890	\$1,398,940	\$53,050	0		43		
Non-Participation Participation Participateo Parti Parte Participation Participation Participation Partic	Market Transformation Ove	erhead	-		• •								\$964,351	\$887,140	-\$77,211	1			1	
Non-Participation Participation Participateo Parti Parte Participation Participation Participation Partic	CD Pate Zone Program Total		50,523,589	837,114,042							\$6,365,751	\$10,450,000	\$52,861,117	\$53,977,669	\$1,116,552	2 2.60	\$105,458,000	40,318	90,032,041	1,-
Delation 1 1 1 1 1 1 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 101 <td>SD Kate Zone Program Total</td> <td></td>	SD Kate Zone Program Total																			
																4				
A no carried and a finite meter a fi																4				
A no carried and a finite meter a fi	ortfolio Overhead and Administrative Costs GD Rate Zone Portfolio Total												\$56,361,117	\$55,648,285						
Parametric Scorecard and Score Advisors Score and Sco	ortfolio Overhead and Administrative Costs GD Rate Zone Portfolio Total												\$56,361,117	\$55,648,285						
hgtrid Metric Program Loop Metric Swing Cool Swing Cool Swing Cool Loove Ban Loove Ban <thloove ban<="" th=""> <thloove ban<="" th=""> <thloov< th=""><th>CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas.</th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th>\$56,361,117</th><th>\$55,648,285</th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th></thloov<></thloove></thloove>	CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas.												\$56,361,117	\$55,648,285						
hgtrid Metric Program Loop Metric Swing Cool Swing Cool Swing Cool Loove Ban Loove Ban <thloove ban<="" th=""> <thloove ban<="" th=""> <thloov< td=""><td>CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas.</td><td>ig to differ from the approved budget.</td><td>Sections 6.6 and 11.2 of the</td><td><u>Filing Guidelines</u> provide</td><td>details for acceptable spo</td><td>ending differences.</td><td>-</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>\$56,361,117</td><td>\$55,648,285</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></thloov<></thloove></thloove>	CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas.	ig to differ from the approved budget.	Sections 6.6 and 11.2 of the	<u>Filing Guidelines</u> provide	details for acceptable spo	ending differences.	-						\$56,361,117	\$55,648,285						
gam Metric Savings (CM) Savings (CM) Lowe Band Target Metric Weight Target Mail	Control of the second s	ng to differ from the approved budget.	Sections 6.6 and 11.2 of the	Filing Guidelines provide	details for acceptable spo	ending differences.							\$56,361,117	\$55,648,285						
And a	ortfolio Overhead and Administrative Costs GD Rate Zone Portfolio Total Not all values may compute exactly due to rounding. CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas. "The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spending			Filing Guidelines provide	details for acceptable spo	ending differences.							\$56,361,117	\$55,648,285						
nmercial & Industrial Custom cost Savings 299,900,780 328,747,651 249,142,962 332,190,616 498,285,924 40% 99.0% 39.6% mmercial & Industrial Proscriptus 21,800,900 21,800,900 21,800,900 406,553 406,85	Controlio Overhead and Administrative Costs GD Rate Zone Portfolio Total Not all values may compute exactly due to rounding. CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas. The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spending GD Rate Zone 2017 Resource Acqu	uisition Scorecard and A	chievement Program Level	Metric-Level	details for acceptable spo					Weighted % of			\$56,361,117	\$55,648,285						
nmerclai & Industrial Direct Install CAM Savings 4,696,08 nmerclai & Industrial Prescriptive 21,086,008 nprehensive Lnergy Management	rtfolio Overhead and Administrative Costs 5D Rate Zone Portfolio Total ot all values may compute exactly due to rounding. CM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas. The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spending GD Rate Zone 2017 Resource Acqu	uisition Scorecard and A	chievement Program Level	Metric-Level			Upper Band	Metric Weight	Target Metric	Scorecard			\$56,361,117	\$55,648,285						
Industrial Procent mericial A Industrial Procent rgy Leaders Initiative Image a Industrial Procent Initiative Image a I	rtfolio Overhead and Administrative Costs 3D Rate Zone Portfolio Total Iot all values may compute exactly due to rounding. CM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas. The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spending GD Rate Zone 2017 Resource Acqu ogram/Offering	uisition Scorecard and A	chievement Program Level Savings (CCM)	Metric-Level Savings (CCM)	Lower Band	Target			Target Metric Achieved	Scorecard Achieved			\$56,361,117	\$55,648,285						
nprehensive Energy Management Image Image <t< td=""><td>Commercial & Industrial Custom</td><td>uisition Scorecard and A Metric Large Volume Customer -</td><td>Chievement Program Level Savings (CCM) 299,900,768</td><td>Metric-Level Savings (CCM)</td><td>Lower Band</td><td>Target</td><td></td><td></td><td>Target Metric Achieved</td><td>Scorecard Achieved</td><td></td><td></td><td>\$56,361,117</td><td>\$55,648,285</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></t<>	Commercial & Industrial Custom	uisition Scorecard and A Metric Large Volume Customer -	Chievement Program Level Savings (CCM) 299,900,768	Metric-Level Savings (CCM)	Lower Band	Target			Target Metric Achieved	Scorecard Achieved			\$56,361,117	\$55,648,285						
straight and straight	Control of the second s	uisition Scorecard and A Metric Large Volume Customer -	Chievement Program Level Savings (CCM) 299,900,768 4,696,088	Metric-Level Savings (CCM)	Lower Band	Target			Target Metric Achieved	Scorecard Achieved			\$56,361,117	\$55,648,285						
Interce Interce <t< td=""><td>Control of the second s</td><td>uisition Scorecard and A Metric Large Volume Customer -</td><td>Chievement Program Level Savings (CCM) 299,900,768 4,696,088</td><td>Metric-Level Savings (CCM)</td><td>Lower Band</td><td>Target</td><td></td><td></td><td>Target Metric Achieved</td><td>Scorecard Achieved</td><td></td><td></td><td>\$56,361,117</td><td>\$55,648,285</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></t<>	Control of the second s	uisition Scorecard and A Metric Large Volume Customer -	Chievement Program Level Savings (CCM) 299,900,768 4,696,088	Metric-Level Savings (CCM)	Lower Band	Target			Target Metric Achieved	Scorecard Achieved			\$56,361,117	\$55,648,285						
all Commercial New Construction Image: Commercia	rtfolio Overhead and Administrative Costs 3D Rate Zone Portfolio Total ot all values may compute exactly due to rounding. CM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas. The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spending GD Rate Zone 2017 Resource Acqu ogram/Offering mmercial & Industrial Custom mmercial & Industrial Direct Install mmercial & Industrial Prescriptive	uisition Scorecard and A Metric Large Volume Customer -	Chievement Program Level Savings (CCM) 299,900,768 4,696,088	Metric-Level Savings (CCM)	Lower Band	Target			Target Metric Achieved	Scorecard Achieved			\$56,361,117	\$55,648,285						
me Energy Conservation Small Volume Customer - idential Adaptive Thermostats 229,695,70 394,823,056 224,198,225 298,930,967 448,396,450 40% 132.0% 52.8% indextrial Custom 15,456,573 15,456,573 15,456,573 15,456,573 15,456,573 15,456,573 15,456,573 inmercial & Industrial Direct Install 74,467,508 15,957,0592 15,156,1573 15,156,1573 15,156,1573	Artfolio Overhead and Administrative Costs GD Rate Zone Portfolio Total Lot all values may compute exactly due to rounding. CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas. The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spending GD Rate Zone 2017 Resource Acque rogram/Offering commercial & Industrial Custom commercial & Industrial Direct Install commercial & Industrial Prescriptive comprehensive Energy Management	uisition Scorecard and A Metric Large Volume Customer -	Chievement Program Level Savings (CCM) 299,900,768 4,696,088 21,806,900 -	Metric-Level Savings (CCM)	Lower Band	Target			Target Metric Achieved	Scorecard Achieved			\$56,361,117	\$55,648,285						
Sidential Adaptive ThermostatsCCM Savings45,367,920nmercial & Industrial Custom15,456,573nmercial & Industrial Direct Install74,467,508nmercial & Industrial Prescriptive29,570,692	Artfolio Overhead and Administrative Costs GD Rate Zone Portfolio Total Itot all values may compute exactly due to rounding. CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas. The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spending GD Rate Zone 2017 Resource Acquer rogram/Offering ommercial & Industrial Custom ommercial & Industrial Direct Install ommercial & Industrial Prescriptive omprehensive Energy Management nergy Leaders Initiative	uisition Scorecard and A Metric Large Volume Customer -	Chievement Program Level Savings (CCM) 299,900,768 4,696,088 21,806,900 - 406,553	Metric-Level Savings (CCM)	Lower Band	Target			Target Metric Achieved	Scorecard Achieved			\$56,361,117	\$55,648,285						
IntervisionIntervisionIntervision15,456,573Intervision74,467,508Intervision29,570,692	rtfolio Overhead and Administrative Costs 3D Rate Zone Portfolio Total ot all values may compute exactly due to rounding. CM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas. The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spending GD Rate Zone 2017 Resource Acqu ogram/Offering mmercial & Industrial Custom mmercial & Industrial Direct Install mmercial & Industrial Prescriptive mprehensive Energy Management ergy Leaders Initiative in-it-Right	uisition Scorecard and A Metric Large Volume Customer -	Chievement Program Level Savings (CCM) 299,900,768 4,696,088 21,806,900 - 406,553	Metric-Level Savings (CCM)	Lower Band	Target			Target Metric Achieved	Scorecard Achieved			\$56,361,117	\$55,648,285						
nmercial & Industrial Customnmercial & Industrial Direct Install74,467,508nmercial & Industrial Prescriptive29,570,692	Control of the second s	Uisition Scorecard and A Metric Large Volume Customer - CCM Savings	Chievement Program Level Savings (CCM) 299,900,768 4,696,088 21,806,900 - 406,553 1,937,342 -	Metric-Level Savings (CCM) 328,747,651	Lower Band 249,142,962	Target 332,190,616	498,285,924	40%	Target Metric Achieved 99.0%	Scorecard Achieved 39.6%			\$56,361,117	\$55,648,285						
nmercial & Industrial Direct Install74,467,508nmercial & Industrial Prescriptive29,570,692	Control of the second s	Uisition Scorecard and A Metric Large Volume Customer - CCM Savings	Chievement Program Level Savings (CCM) 299,900,768 4,696,088 21,806,900 - 406,553 1,937,342 - 229,695,730	Metric-Level Savings (CCM) 328,747,651	Lower Band 249,142,962	Target 332,190,616	498,285,924	40%	Target Metric Achieved 99.0%	Scorecard Achieved 39.6%			\$56,361,117	\$55,648,285						
nmercial & Industrial Prescriptive 29,570,692	Control of the second s	Uisition Scorecard and A Metric Large Volume Customer - CCM Savings	Chievement Program Level Savings (CCM) 299,900,768 4,696,088 21,806,900 	Metric-Level Savings (CCM) 328,747,651	Lower Band 249,142,962	Target 332,190,616	498,285,924	40%	Target Metric Achieved 99.0%	Scorecard Achieved 39.6%			\$56,361,117	\$55,648,285						
	Control of the second s	Uisition Scorecard and A Metric Large Volume Customer - CCM Savings	Chievement Program Level Savings (CCM) 299,900,768 4,696,088 21,806,900 	Metric-Level Savings (CCM) 328,747,651	Lower Band 249,142,962	Target 332,190,616	498,285,924	40%	Target Metric Achieved 99.0%	Scorecard Achieved 39.6%			\$56,361,117	\$55,648,285						
	rtfolio Overhead and Administrative Costs SD Rate Zone Portfolio Total tot all values may compute exactly due to rounding. CM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas. The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spending GD Rate Zone 2017 Resource Acqu ogram/Offering mmercial & Industrial Custom ommercial & Industrial Direct Install ommercial & Industrial Prescriptive omprehensive Energy Management tergy Leaders Initiative In-it-Right nall Commercial New Construction ome Energy Conservation isidential Adaptive Thermostats ommercial & Industrial Custom ommercial & Industrial Custom ome Energy Conservation Isidential Adaptive Thermostats ommercial & Industrial Direct Install	Uisition Scorecard and A Metric Large Volume Customer - CCM Savings	Chievement Program Level Savings (CCM) 299,900,768 4,696,088 21,806,900 406,553 1,937,342 229,695,730 45,367,920 15,456,573 74,467,508	Metric-Level Savings (CCM) 328,747,651	Lower Band 249,142,962	Target 332,190,616	498,285,924	40%	Target Metric Achieved 99.0%	Scorecard Achieved 39.6%			\$56,361,117	\$55,648,285						
Bit is a state of the	Artfolio Overhead and Administrative Costs GD Rate Zone Portfolio Total Itot all values may compute exactly due to rounding. CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas. The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spending GD Rate Zone 2017 Resource Acquer rogram/Offering ommercial & Industrial Custom ommercial & Industrial Direct Install ommercial & Industrial Prescriptive omprehensive Energy Management nergy Leaders Initiative un-it-Right nall Commercial New Construction ome Energy Conservation esidential Adaptive Thermostats ommercial & Industrial Direct Install ommercial & Industrial Custom	Uisition Scorecard and A Metric Large Volume Customer - CCM Savings	Program Level Savings (CCM) 299,900,768 4,696,088 21,806,900 - 406,553 1,937,342 - 229,695,730 45,367,920 15,456,573 74,467,508 29,570,692	Metric-Level Savings (CCM) 328,747,651	Lower Band 249,142,962	Target 332,190,616	498,285,924	40%	Target Metric Achieved 99.0%	Scorecard Achieved 39.6%			\$56,361,117	\$55,648,285						

Filed: 2020-04-06, EB-2019-0271, Exhibit I.SEC.12, Attachment 2, Page 2 of 2

Source: 2016 Natural Gas Demand-Side Management Annual Verification Report (DNV GL) for achievement, and cost effectiveness. Utilities' Data for spend, targets and incentive results (some changes due to Decision and Order EB-2018-0300/EB-2018-0301 that modified targets.) Created based on Table 1-3 from 2018 Natural Gas Demand-Side Management Annual Verification Report (DNV GL) but some columns have been re-ordered to accommodate additional data. Participants/units and Gross Annual Savings are not available in the 2016 Annual Verification Report. This may vary from the Auditor results due to rounding and inability to completely reproduce results. Differences are not material.

Union Rate Zones (2016)

Table 1-3. Union Rate Zones achievement, spend, cost effectiveness, and incentive results*†

Program/Offering	Metric	Verified First-Year Savings (m ³)	Verified Cumulative Savings or Other Metric	Lower Band	Target	Upper Band	Metric Weight	Percent of Target Metric Achieved	Weighted % of Scorecard Achieved	DSM Shareholder Incentive	Maximum Shareholder Incentive Available	OEB- Approved Program Budget	Utility Spending**	Budget/ Spending Variance	Cost Effectiveness (TRC Benefit Cost Ratio)	Net Present Value (TRC Plus)	Participants/Units	Gross Annual Natural Gas Savings (m³)	Gross Cumulative Natural Gas Saving (CCM)
Resource Acquisition		46,526,753	814,757,917						105.0%	\$2,907,230	\$6,402,042	\$27,927,833	\$27,585,941	-\$341,892	3.01	\$124,808,924	10,613	110,283,924	1,839,468,21
Commercial & Industrial Custom	CCM Savings	34,079,900	544,862,192	840,194,699	1,120,259,599	1,680,389,398	75%	73.0%	55.0%	\$2,907,230	\$6,402,042	\$7,808,000	\$8,559,792	\$751,792	3.53	\$87,270,221	432	96,817,327	1,549,389,96
Commercial & Industrial Direct Install	CCM Savings	-	-									\$500,000	\$0	-\$500,000	-	-	-	-	
Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive	CCM Savings	8,034,415	159,584,798									\$6,755,000	\$4,023,711	-\$2,731,289	3.43	\$26,160,054	3,586	8,821,926	173,961,48
Home Reno Rebate	CCM Savings	4,412,437	110,310,927									\$7,233,000	\$9,689,152	\$2,456,152	1.67	\$11,378,649		4,644,671	116,116,76
	Participants	N/A	6,595	2,475	3,300	4,950	25%	200.0%	50.0%						N/A	N/A	6,595		
Overhead and Administrative Co	osts											\$5,631,833	\$5,313,286	-\$318,547					
Low Income		2,670,900	64,829,070						103.0%	\$1,151,656	\$2,614,993	\$11,407,470	\$10,400,613	-\$1,006,857	1.53	\$5,265,799	2,010	2,714,980	65,831,09
Home Weatherization	CCM Savings	1,831,630	45,754,201	28,339,761	37,786,348	56,679,521	60.00%	121.0%	73.0%	\$1,151,656	\$2,614,993	\$6,335,000	\$7,588,591	\$1,253,591	1.46	\$3,423,123	1,867	1,831,659	45,754,57
Furnace End-of-Life	CCM Savings	1,617	29,106									\$761,000	\$7800	-\$753,200	0.51	-\$6,693	24	1,617	29,10
Indigenous	CCM Savings	-	-									\$8,000	\$13,632	\$5,632	-	-	-	-	
Multi-Family - Social & Assisted	CCM Savings	493,667	10,894,573	13,836,358	18,448,477	27,672,716	35.00%	59.1%	21.0%			\$2,651,000	\$1,767,368	-\$883,632	1.75	\$1,849,369	78	519,613	11,467,22
Multi-Family - Market Rate	CCM Savings	343,986	8,151,190	2,252,430	3,003,240	4,504,860	5.00%	200.0%	10.0%								41	362,091	8,580,20
Overhead and Administrative Co	osts											\$1,652,470	\$1,023,222	-\$629,248					
Large Volume		6,772,053	79,848,302						9.0%	\$0	\$916,941	\$4,000,000	\$2,989,176	-\$1,010,824	5.02	\$12,668,784	71	75,741,890	853,595,98
Large Volume	CCM Savings	6,772,053	79,848,302	668,168,041	890,890,721	1,336,336,082	100%	9.0%	9.0%	\$0	\$916,941	\$3,150,000	\$2,441,555	-\$708,445	5.02	\$12,668,784	71	75,741,890	853,595,98
Overhead and Administrative Co	osts											\$850,000	\$547,621	-\$302,379					
Market Transformation									50.0%	\$0	\$390,403	\$1,703,070	\$1,004,693	-\$698,377	N/A	N/A	0	N/A	N/A
Optimum Home	Homes Built		70.09%	53.00%	70.00%	100.00%	50%	100.0%	50.0%	\$0	\$390,403	\$841,000	\$665,825	-\$175,175					
Commercial New Construction	New Developments	5	0	6	8	12	50%	0.0%	0.0%			\$500,000	\$28,786	-\$471,214					
Overhead and Administrative Co	osts											\$362,070	\$310,082	-\$51,988					
Performance Based									108.0%	\$61,844	\$125,621	\$548,000	\$274,604	-\$273,396	N/A	N/A	35	N/A	N/A
RunSmart	Participants	N/A	32	21	28	41	50%	115.0%	58.0%	\$61,844	\$125,621	\$297,000	\$93,103	-\$203,897	N/A	N/A	32	N/A	N/A
Strategic Energy Management	Participants		3	2	3	5	50%	100.0%	50.0%				\$40,152	\$40,152			3		
Overhead and Administrative Co	osts			•				•				\$251,000	\$141,349	-\$109,651					
Union Rate Zones Program Total		55,969,706	959,435,289							\$4,120,730	\$10,450,000	\$45,586,373	\$42,255,027	-\$3,331,346	2.90	142,743,507	12,729	188,740,794	2,758,895,29
Portfolio Overhead and Administrativ	e Costs											\$11,235,000	\$8,410,624	-\$2,824,376					
Union Rate Zones Portfolio Total												\$56,821,373	\$50,665,651	-\$6,155,722					

*Not all values may compute exactly due to rounding.
38 tCCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas.

39 ** The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spending to differ from the approved budget. Sections 6.6 and 11.2 of the Filing Guidelines provide details for acceptable spending differences.

Filed: 2020-04-06, EB-2019-0271, Exhibit I.SEC.12, Attachment 3, Page 1 of 2

Source: 2018 Natural Gas Demand-Side Management Annual Verification Report (DNV GL). Spend from Utility data.

Table 1-1 is the basis but some columns have been re-ordered to accommodate additional data Columns have been added from other tables in the Annual Verification Report. These are highighted orange.

Participants/units and Gross Savings are not entirely available in the Annual Verification Report. This data has been taken from the Utilities' data. This may vary from the Auditor results due to rounding and inability to completely reproduce results. Differences are not material.

EGD Rate Zone (2017)

Table 1-1. EGD Rate Zone savings, spend, cost effectiveness, and incentive results * †

Program/Offering	Metric	Verified First-Year	/erified Cumulative Savings or Other	Lower Band	Target	Upper Band	Metric Weight	Percent of Target Metric	Weighted % of Scorecard	DSM Shareholder	Maximum Shareholder	OEB-Approved	Utility Spending**	Budget/ Spending	Cost Effectiveness	Net Present Value	Participants/Units Na		Gross Cumulative atural Gas Saving
		Savings (m3)	Metric	Lower Bana	raiget		Metric Weight	Achieved	Achieved	Incentive	Incentive Available	Program Budget	othing opending	Variance	(TRC Benefit Cost Ratio)	(TRC Plus)		(m ³)	(CCM)
esource Acquisition		39,695,229	698,209,189						93.9%	\$2,120,130	\$7,025,881	\$39,488,708	\$40,290,430	\$801,722	2.63	\$104,016,000	31,025	67,186,971	1,126,355,6
ommercial & Industrial Custom	CCM Savings	24,517,940	406,957,161		See separate	e table below		86.6%	68.9%	\$2,120,130	\$7,025,881	\$7,157,145	\$7,240,134	\$82,989	3.62	\$66,292,000	823	50,031,101	795,451,8
ommercial & Industrial Direct Install	CCM Savings	3,734,401	56,016,021									\$5,060,872	\$1,807,641	-\$3,253,231	5.38	\$9,007,000	258	3,930,949	58,964,2
ommercial & Industrial Prescriptive	CCM Savings	2,437,180	41,009,936								ľ	\$2,241,134	\$1,113,533	-\$1,127,601	2.77	\$7,179,000	4,202	2,853,530	48,098,
omprehensive Energy Management	CCM Savings	-	-								1	\$80,184	\$0	-\$80184	-	-			
nergy Leaders Initiative	CCM Savings	137,553	1,375,530									\$400,000	\$78,613	-\$321,387	1.60	\$115,000	5	137,553	1,375,5
Residential Adaptive Thermostats	CCM Savings	2,537,549	38,063,232								Ī	\$1,525,000	\$1,479,319	-\$45,681	2.90	\$8,613,000	14,288	2,643,280	39,649,2
Run-it-Right	CCM Savings	173,891	869,455									\$1,434,480	\$872,005	-\$562,475	0.24	-\$668,000	59	347,365	1,736,
Small Commercial New Construction	CCM Savings	-	-									\$1,305,566	\$0	-\$1305566	-	-			
Iome Energy Conservation	CCM Savings	6,156,714	153,917,853									\$15,180,000	\$22,644,994	\$7,464,994	1.50	\$13,478,000		7,243,193	181,079,
	Participants	N/A	11,390					124.9%	25.0%						N/A	N/A	11,390		
Resource Acquisition Ov	rerhead		•						•			\$5,104,327	\$5,054,191	-\$50,136					
ow Income		4,321,445	88,962,125						50.3%	\$0	\$2,228,895	\$12,527,420	\$10,067,601	-\$2,459,819	2.20	\$10,811,000	2,907	4,313,092	89,084,8
	COM Cauda aa			20 517 (21	40 (00 174	(1.025.24)	1 450/	40.00(¢.0									
lome Winterproofing	CCM Savings	790,266	19,598,357	30,517,631	40,690,174	61,035,26 189,599,328		48.2%	21.7%	\$0	\$2,228,895	\$6,290,000 \$3,418,121	\$4,539,420 \$2,765,831	-\$1,750,580	0.89	-\$517,000	1,352	796,791	19,663,6
Aulti Residential	CCM Savings	3,531,178	69,363,767	94,799,664	126,399,552	189,399,320		54.9%	24.7%		-			-\$652,290		\$11,328,000	1,544	3,516,301	69,421,2
New Construction Low Income Ov	Applications	N/A	11	21	28	4.	2 10%	39.3%	3.9%			\$1,200,000 \$1,619,299	\$1,158,956 \$1,603,394	-\$41,044 -\$15,905	N/A	N/A	11		
Low meome of												\$1,019,299	\$1,003,394	-\$15,905					
Market Transformation									66.3%	\$0	\$1,195,224	\$6,717,716	\$7,463,036	\$745,320	N/A	N/A	2,723	N/A	N/A
School Energy Competition	Schools	N/A	65	43	57	80	6 10%	114.0%	11.4%	\$0	\$1,195,224	\$600,000	\$460,396	-\$139,604	N/A	N/A	65		
Run-it-Right	Participants		29	88	117	170	6 20%	24.1%	4.8%		-	\$285,520	\$421,777	\$136,257			29		
Comprehensive Energy Management	Participants		5	41	55	83	3 20%	10.7%	2.1%			\$763,861	\$234,085	-\$529,776		ľ	5		
Residential Savings by Design	Builders		24	24	32	48	3 10%	75.0%	7.5%			\$3,250,000	\$4,216,284	\$966,284			24		
	Homes		2,570	1,705	2,273	3,410	0 15%	113.1%	17.0%								2,570		
Commercial Savings by Design	Developments		30	24	32	48	8 25%	93.8%	23.5%		ľ	\$950,000	\$1,270,688	\$320,688		ľ	30		
Market Transformation Ov	rerhead								1			\$868,335	\$859,806	-\$8,529			1	1	
										\$2 120 130	\$10,450,000	\$58,733,844	\$57,821,067	-\$912,777	0.50				4.045.440.44
EGD Rate Zone Program Total		44,016,673	787,171,313							<i>φμ</i> ₁ <i>μ</i> ₂ <i>θ</i> ₁ <i>μ</i> ₂ <i>θ</i> ₁ <i>μ</i> ₃ <i>μ</i> ₃ <i>μ</i> ₁ <i>μ</i> ₃ <i>μ</i> ₃ <i>μ</i> ₃ <i>μ</i> ₁ <i>μ</i> ₁ <i>μ</i> ₁ <i>μ</i> ₃ <i>μ</i> ₁ <i>μ</i>					2.58	\$114,826,000	36,655	71,500,063	1,215,440,40
		44,016,673	787,171,313							<i>\$2,120,130</i>		\$4,200,000	\$5,085,923	\$885,923	2.58	\$114,826,000	36,655	71,500,063	1,215,440,40
Portfolio Overhead and Administrative Costs		44,016,673	787,171,313							\$2,120,100		\$4,200,000 \$62,933,844		\$885,923	2.58	\$114,826,000	36,655	71,500,063	1,215,440,4
EGD Rate Zone Program Total Portfolio Overhead and Administrative Costs EGD Rate Zone Portfolio Total *Not all values may compute exactly due to rounding tCCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas. **The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spendi	ng to differ from the approved budget.			etails for acceptable sp	ending differences.					12,120,100			\$5,085,923	\$885,923	2.58	\$114,826,000	36,655	71,500,063	1,215,440,4
ortfolio Overhead and Administrative Costs GD Rate Zone Portfolio Total Not all values may compute exactly due to rounding CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas. *The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spendi		Sections 6.6 and 11.2 of the F	Filing Guidelines provide de	etails for acceptable sp	ending differences.					42,120,100			\$5,085,923	\$885,923	2.58	\$114,826,000	36,655	71,500,063	1,215,440,4
Cortfolio Overhead and Administrative Costs COD Rate Zone Portfolio Total Not all values may compute exactly due to rounding CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas. *The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spendi EGD Rate Zone 2017 Resource Acc		Sections 6.6 and 11.2 of the F		etails for acceptable sp	ending differences.	Upper Band	Metric Weight	Percent of Target Metric Achieved	Weighted % of Scorecard Achieved				\$5,085,923	\$885,923	2.58	\$114,826,000	36,655	71,500,063	1,215,440,4
Cortfolio Overhead and Administrative Costs COD Rate Zone Portfolio Total Not all values may compute exactly due to rounding CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas. *The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spendi EGD Rate Zone 2017 Resource Acc Program/Offering	quisition Scorecard and A Metric Large Volume Customer -	Sections 6.6 and 11.2 of the <u>F</u> Achievement Program Level	illing Guidelines provide de Metric-Level			Upper Band 654,140,299		Target Metric	Scorecard				\$5,085,923	\$885,923	2.58	\$114,826,000	36,655	71,500,063	1,215,440,4
Portfolio Overhead and Administrative Costs EGD Rate Zone Portfolio Total Not all values may compute exactly due to rounding CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas. **The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spendi EGD Rate Zone 2017 Resource Acc Program/Offering Commercial & Industrial Custom	uisition Scorecard and A	Sections 6.6 and 11.2 of the F Achievement Program Level Savings (CCM)	iling <u>Guidelines</u> provide de Metric-Level Savings (CCM)	Lower Band	Target			Target Metric Achieved	Scorecard Achieved				\$5,085,923	\$885,923	2.58	\$114,826,000	36,655	71,500,063	1,215,440,4
Portfolio Overhead and Administrative Costs EGD Rate Zone Portfolio Total *Not all values may compute exactly due to rounding tCCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas.	quisition Scorecard and A Metric Large Volume Customer -	Sections 6.6 and 11.2 of the E Achievement Program Level Savings (CCM) 372,554,306	iling <u>Guidelines</u> provide de Metric-Level Savings (CCM)	Lower Band	Target			Target Metric Achieved	Scorecard Achieved				\$5,085,923	\$885,923	2.58	\$114,826,000	36,655	71,500,063	1,215,440,4
Portfolio Overhead and Administrative Costs EGD Rate Zone Portfolio Total Not all values may compute exactly due to rounding CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas. **The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spendi EGD Rate Zone 2017 Resource Acco Program/Offering Commercial & Industrial Custom Commercial & Industrial Direct Install	quisition Scorecard and A Metric Large Volume Customer -	Sections 6.6 and 11.2 of the E Achievement Program Level Savings (CCM) 372,554,306 9,352,973	iling <u>Guidelines</u> provide de Metric-Level Savings (CCM)	Lower Band	Target			Target Metric Achieved	Scorecard Achieved				\$5,085,923	\$885,923	2.58	\$114,826,000	36,655	71,500,063	1,215,440,4
Portfolio Overhead and Administrative Costs EGD Rate Zone Portfolio Total Not all values may compute exactly due to rounding rCCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas. **The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spendi EGD Rate Zone 2017 Resource Acc Program/Offering Commercial & Industrial Custom Commercial & Industrial Direct Install Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive	quisition Scorecard and A Metric Large Volume Customer -	Sections 6.6 and 11.2 of the E Achievement Program Level Savings (CCM) 372,554,306 9,352,973	iling <u>Guidelines</u> provide de Metric-Level Savings (CCM)	Lower Band	Target			Target Metric Achieved	Scorecard Achieved				\$5,085,923	\$885,923	2.58	\$114,826,000	36,655	71,500,063	1,215,440,4
Controlio Overhead and Administrative Costs CGD Rate Zone Portfolio Total Not all values may compute exactly due to rounding CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas. **The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spendi CGD Rate Zone 2017 Resource Acc Program/Offering Commercial & Industrial Custom Commercial & Industrial Direct Install Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive Comprehensive Energy Management Energy Leaders Initiative	quisition Scorecard and A Metric Large Volume Customer -	Sections 6.6 and 11.2 of the F Achievement Program Level Savings (CCM) 372,554,306 9,352,973 17,142,080	iling <u>Guidelines</u> provide de Metric-Level Savings (CCM)	Lower Band	Target			Target Metric Achieved	Scorecard Achieved				\$5,085,923	\$885,923	2.58	\$114,826,000	36,655	71,500,063	1,215,440,4
Controlio Overhead and Administrative Costs Controlio Overhead and Administrative Costs COR Rate Zone Portfolio Total Not all values may compute exactly due to rounding CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas. *The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spendi COR Rate Zone 2017 Resource Acco Program/Offering Commercial & Industrial Custom Commercial & Industrial Direct Install Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive Comprehensive Energy Management Comprehensive Energy Management Comprehensive Initiative Run-it-Right	quisition Scorecard and A Metric Large Volume Customer -	Sections 6.6 and 11.2 of the F Achievement Program Level Savings (CCM) 372,554,306 9,352,973 17,142,080 - 1,306,630	iling <u>Guidelines</u> provide de Metric-Level Savings (CCM)	Lower Band	Target			Target Metric Achieved	Scorecard Achieved				\$5,085,923	\$885,923	2.58	\$114,826,000	36,655	71,500,063	1,215,440,4
Portfolio Overhead and Administrative Costs EGD Rate Zone Portfolio Total INOT all values may compute exactly due to rounding ICCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas. INTHE OEB'S DSM Framework allows for utility spendi EGD Rate Zone 2017 Resource Acc Program/Offering Commercial & Industrial Custom Commercial & Industrial Direct Install Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive Comprehensive Energy Management	quisition Scorecard and A Metric Large Volume Customer -	Sections 6.6 and 11.2 of the F Achievement Program Level Savings (CCM) 372,554,306 9,352,973 17,142,080 - 1,306,630	iling <u>Guidelines</u> provide de Metric-Level Savings (CCM)	Lower Band	Target 436,093,532		8 40%	Target Metric Achieved	Scorecard Achieved				\$5,085,923	\$885,923	2.58	\$114,826,000	36,655	71,500,063	1,215,440,4
Portfolio Overhead and Administrative Costs EGD Rate Zone Portfolio Total INOT all values may compute exactly due to rounding INOT all values	Autisition Scorecard and A Metric Large Volume Customer - CCM Savings	Sections 6.6 and 11.2 of the E Achievement Program Level Savings (CCM) 372,554,306 9,352,973 17,142,080 - 1,306,630 869,455 -	<u>Metric-Level</u> Savings (CCM) 401,225,443	Lower Band 327,070,149	Target 436,093,532	654,140,29	8 40%	Target Metric Achieved 92.0%	Scorecard Achieved 36.8%				\$5,085,923	\$885,923	2.58	\$114,826,000	36,655	71,500,063	1,215,440,4
Controlio Overhead and Administrative Costs Controlio Overhead and Administrative Costs CD Rate Zone Portfolio Total Not all values may compute exactly due to rounding CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas. *The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spendi COMMERCIAL STATES STATES STATES STATES STATES STATES COMMERCIAL & Industrial Custom Commercial & Industrial Direct Install Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive Comprehensive Energy Management Inergy Leaders Initiative Run-it-Right Small Commercial New Construction Home Energy Conservation Residential Adaptive Thermostats	Autisition Scorecard and A Metric Large Volume Customer - CCM Savings	Sections 6.6 and 11.2 of the E Achievement Program Level Savings (CCM) 372,554,306 9,352,973 17,142,080 - 1,306,630 869,455 - 153,917,853	<u>Metric-Level</u> Savings (CCM) 401,225,443	Lower Band 327,070,149	Target 436,093,532	654,140,29	8 40%	Target Metric Achieved 92.0%	Scorecard Achieved 36.8%				\$5,085,923	\$885,923	2.58	\$114,826,000	36,655	71,500,063	1,215,440,4
Portfolio Overhead and Administrative Costs EGD Rate Zone Portfolio Total Not all values may compute exactly due to rounding CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas. **The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spendi EGD Rate Zone 2017 Resource Acc Program/Offering Commercial & Industrial Custom Commercial & Industrial Direct Install Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive Comprehensive Energy Management Energy Leaders Initiative Run-it-Right Small Commercial New Construction Home Energy Conservation	Autisition Scorecard and A Metric Large Volume Customer - CCM Savings	Sections 6.6 and 11.2 of the F Achievement Savings (CCM) 372,554,306 9,352,973 17,142,080 - 1,306,630 869,455 - 153,917,853 38,063,232	<u>Metric-Level</u> Savings (CCM) 401,225,443	Lower Band 327,070,149	Target 436,093,532	654,140,29	8 40%	Target Metric Achieved 92.0%	Scorecard Achieved 36.8%				\$5,085,923	\$885,923	2.58	\$114,826,000	36,655	71,500,063	1,215,440,4
ortfolio Overhead and Administrative Costs GD Rate Zone Portfolio Total Not all values may compute exactly due to rounding CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas. *The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spendi EGD Rate Zone 2017 Resource Acc rogram/Offering ommercial & Industrial Custom ommercial & Industrial Direct Install ommercial & Industrial Prescriptive omprehensive Energy Management nergy Leaders Initiative un-it-Right mall Commercial New Construction Iome Energy Conservation esidential Adaptive Thermostats ommercial & Industrial Direct Install	Autisition Scorecard and A Metric Large Volume Customer - CCM Savings	Sections 6.6 and 11.2 of the F Achievement Savings (CCM) 372,554,306 9,352,973 17,142,080 	<u>Metric-Level</u> Savings (CCM) 401,225,443	Lower Band 327,070,149	Target 436,093,532	654,140,29	8 40%	Target Metric Achieved 92.0%	Scorecard Achieved 36.8%				\$5,085,923	\$885,923	2.58	\$114,826,000	36,655	71,500,063	1,215,440,4
ortfolio Overhead and Administrative Costs GD Rate Zone Portfolio Total Not all values may compute exactly due to rounding CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas. *The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spendi CGD Rate Zone 2017 Resource Accorrogram/Offering ommercial & Industrial Custom ommercial & Industrial Direct Install ommercial & Industrial Prescriptive omprehensive Energy Management nergy Leaders Initiative un-it-Right mall Commercial New Construction ome Energy Conservation esidential Adaptive Thermostats ommercial & Industrial Custom	Autisition Scorecard and A Metric Large Volume Customer - CCM Savings	Sections 6.6 and 11.2 of the F Achievement 372,554,306 9,352,973 17,142,080 - 1,306,630 869,455 - 153,917,853 38,063,232 34,402,855	<u>Metric-Level</u> Savings (CCM) 401,225,443	Lower Band 327,070,149	Target 436,093,532	654,140,29	8 40%	Target Metric Achieved 92.0%	Scorecard Achieved 36.8%				\$5,085,923	\$885,923	2.58	\$114,826,000	36,655	71,500,063	1,215,440,4

Filed: 2020-04-06, EB-2019-0271, Exhibit I.SEC.12, Attachment 3, Page 2 of 2

Source: 2018 Natural Gas Demand-Side Management Annual Verification Report (DNV GL). Spend from Utility data. Table 1-3 is the basis but some columns have been re-ordered to accommodate additional data

Columns have been added from other tables in the Annual Verification Report. These are highighted orange.

Participants/units and Gross Savings are not entirely available in the Annual Verification Report. This data has been taken from the Utilities' data. This may vary from the Auditor results due to rounding and inability to completely reproduce results. Differences are not material.

Union Rate Zones (2017)

Table 1-3. Union Rate Zones achievement, spend, cost effectiveness, and incentive results*†

Program/Offering	Metric	Verified First-Year Savings (m ³)	Verified Cumulative Savings or Other Metric	Lower Band	Target	Upper Band	Metric Weight	Percent of Target Metric Achieved	Weighted % of Scorecard Achieved	DSM Shareholder Incentive	Maximum Shareholder Incentive Available	OEB- Approved Program Budget	Utility Spending**	Budget/ Spending Variance	Cost Effectiveness (TRC Benefit Cost Ratio)	Net Present Value (TRC Plus)	Participants/Units	Gross Annual Natural Gas Savings (m ³)	Gross Cumulative Natural Gas Saving (CCM)
Resource Acquisition		57,864,098	999,091,347						126.7%	\$4,753,191	\$6,595,243	\$33,404,162	\$44,240,315	\$10,836,153	2.00	\$101,711,000	19,078	118,538,183	2,005,294,37
Commercial & Industrial Custom	CCM Savings	37,907,520	579,288,646	732,348,080	976,464,106	1,464,696,159	75%	102.3%	76.7%	\$4,753,191	\$6,595,243	\$7,808,000	\$9,216,161	\$1,408,161	2.47	\$63,948,000	581	97,144,048	1,557,120,81
Commercial & Industrial Direct Install	CCM Savings	1,922,435	28,836,528									\$2,500,000	\$1,449,230	-\$1,050,770	4.93	\$4,756,000	228	2,023,616	30,354,24
Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive	CCM Savings	10,249,139	196,341,071									\$6,763,000	\$5,202,184	-\$1,560,816	2.70	\$25,630,000	4,540	11,175,778	212,950,79
Home Reno Rebate	CCM Savings	7,785,004	194,625,102									\$9,880,000	\$21,375,224	\$11,495,224	1.18	\$7,377,000		8,194,741	204,868,52
	Participants	N/A	13,729	5,144	6,859	10,289	25%	200.2%	50.0%						N/A	N/A	13,729		
Overhead and Administrative C	Costs											\$6,453,162	\$6,997,515	\$544,353					
Low Income		2,596,404	57,467,519						82.8%	\$304,325	\$2,436,943	\$12,342,841	\$10,882,721	-\$1,460,120	1.21	\$2,335,000	2,353	2,666,702	58,855,70
Home Weatherization	CCM Savings	1,197,217	29,828,405	33,770,520	45,027,360	67,541,040	60.00%	68.1%	40.9%	\$304,325	\$2,436,943	\$6,136,000	\$6,432,937	\$296,937	0.98	-\$104,000	1,611	1,197,301	29,829,46
Furnace End-of-Life	CCM Savings	24570	442260									\$784,000	\$168790	-\$615210	0.35	-181000	464	24570	44226
Indigenous	CCM Savings	16,675	406,272									\$419,000	\$212,185	-\$206,815	0.52	-\$84,000	68	16,683	406,36
Multi-Family - Social & Assisted	CCM Savings	1,180,238	22,426,926	14,512,897	19,350,529	29,025,794	35.00%	115.9%	40.6%			\$3,359,000	\$2,503,499	-\$419,814	1.74	\$2,704,000	169	1,241,091	23,584,28
Multi-Family - Market Rate	CCM Savings	177,703	4,363,656	11,851,283	15,801,711	23,702,567	5.00%	27.6%	1.4%				\$435,687				41	187,056	4,593,32
Overhead and Administrative C	Costs											\$1,644,841	\$1,129,624	-\$515,217					
Large Volume		9,474,468	125,804,115						27.2%	\$0	\$789,751	\$4,000,000	\$2,622,762	-\$1,377,238	1.80	\$10,086,000	48	61,884,178	821,712,050
Large Volume	CCM Savings	9,474,468	125,804,115	347,325,300	463,100,400	694,650,600	100%	27.2%	27.2%	\$0	\$789,751	\$3,150,000	\$2,127,205	-\$1,022,795	1.80	\$10,086,000	48	61,884,178	821,712,05
Overhead and Administrative C	Costs											\$850,000	\$495,557	-\$354,443					
Market Transformation									150.0%	\$461,623	\$461,623	\$2,338,070	\$1,698,246	-\$639,824	N/A	N/A	22	N/A	N/A
Optimum Home	Builders	N/A	10	8	10	15	20%	100.0%	20.0%	\$461,623	\$461,623	\$841,000	\$685,326	-\$155,674	N/A	N/A	10		
	Homes Built		60.00%	22.50%	30.00%	45.00%	30%	200.0%	60.0%										
Commercial New Construction	New Developments		12	6	8	12	50%	150.0%	75.0%			\$1,000,000	\$706,158				12		
Overhead and Administrative C	Costs											\$497,070	\$306,762	-\$190,308					
Performance Based									18.2%	\$0	\$166,440	\$843,000	\$532,776	-\$310,224	N/A	N/A	35	N/A	N/A
RunSmart	Participants	N/A	35	57	76	114	20%	46.1%	9.2%	\$0	\$166,440	\$200,000	\$162,052	-\$37,948	N/A	N/A	35		
	% Savings] (1.49%	7.50%	10.00%	15.00%	60%	14.9%	8.9%										
Strategic Energy Management	Participants		-	24	32	48	20%	-	0.0%			\$392,000	\$193,887	-\$198,113					
Overhead and Administrative C	Costs											\$251,000	\$176,837	-\$74,163					
Union Rate Zones Program Total		69,934,970	1,182,362,981							\$5,519,140	\$10,450,000	\$52,928,073	\$59,976,819	\$7,048,746	1.91	\$114,640,000	21,536	183,089,063	2,885,862,13
Portfolio Overhead and Administrativ	ve Costs											\$5,642,000	\$4,604,292	-\$1,037,708					
Union Rate Zones Portfolio Total												\$58,570,073	\$64,581,110	\$6,011,037					

39 *Not all values may compute exactly due to rounding.

40 †CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas.

41 ** The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spending to differ from the approved budget. Sections 6.6 and 11.2 of the Filing Guidelines provide details for acceptable spending differences.

Filed: 2020-04-06, EB-2019-0271, Exhibit I.SEC.12, Attachment 4, Page 1 of 2

Source: 2018 Natural Gas Demand-Side Management Annual Verification Report (DNV GL). Spend from Utility data Table 1-1 is the basis but some columns have been re-ordered to accommodate additional data

Columns have been added from other tables in the Annual Verification Report. These are highlighted orange.

Participants/units and Gross Savings are not entirely available in the Annual Verification Report. This data has been taken from the Utilities' data. This may vary from the Auditor results due to rounding and inability to completely reproduce results. Differences are not material.

EGD Rate Zone (2018)

Table 1-1. EGD Rate Zone savings, spend, cost effectiveness, and incentive results*†

Program/Offering		Verified First-Year	Verified Cumulative					Percent of	Weighted % of	DSM	Maximum Shareholder	OER Approved		Budget/ Spending	Cost Effectiveness	Net Present Value		Gross Annual	Gross Cum
	Metric	Savings (m3)	Savings or Other Metric	Lower Band	Target	Upper Band	Metric Weight	Target Metric Achieved	Scorecard Achieved	Shareholder Incentive	Incentive Available	OEB-Approved Program Budget	Utility Spending**	Variance	(TRC Benefit Cost Ratio)	(TRC Plus)	Participants/Units	Natural Gas Savings (m ³)	Natural Ga (CC
ource Acquisition		36,157,056	677,329,382						101.3%	\$2,955,435	\$7,119,472	\$43,162,456	\$41,427,686	-\$1,734,770	2.26	\$85,211,000	33,692	55,748,795	1,01
mercial & Industrial Custom	CCM Savings	19,799,976	352,950,627		See separate	table below		84.1%	70.0%	\$2,955,435	\$7,119,472	\$7,361,562	\$7,696,271	\$334,709	3.48	\$54,562,000	508	37,557,690	6
nmercial & Industrial Direct Install	CCM Savings	3,785,559	56,783,392		• • • •							\$4,758,344	\$1,726,487	-\$3,031,857	5.35	\$10,053,000	353	3,984,799	
mmercial & Industrial Prescriptive	CCM Savings	2,132,567	36,475,770									\$2,232,905	\$1,164,036	-\$1,068,869	2.39	\$5,220,000	2,131	2,506,079	
mprehensive Energy Management	CCM Savings	-	-									\$95,000	\$0	-\$95,000	-				
ergy Leaders Initiative	CCM Savings	1,206,466	29,708,535									\$400,000	\$324,138	-\$75,862	4.95	\$4,969,000	3	1,206,466	
esidential Adaptive Thermostats	CCM Savings	2,888,131	43,321,968									\$2,175,000	\$1,578,427	-\$596,573	2.92	\$10,113,000	16,262	3,008,470	4
ın-it-Right	CCM Savings	25,991	129,953									\$1,584,600	\$522,385	-\$1,062,215	0.07	-\$486,000	22	51,919	
nall Commercial New Construction	CCM Savings	-	-									\$1,305,566	\$0	-\$1,305,566	-	-			
ome Energy Conservation	CCM Savings	6,318,365	157,959,136									\$18,000,000	\$23,256,751	\$5,256,751	1.02	\$782,000	14,413	7,433,371	18
	Participants	N/A	14,413					156.1%	31.2%						N/A	N/A			
Resource Acquisition Overh	ead								1			\$5,249,479	\$5,159,191	-\$90,288					
w Income		6,069,722	130,147,292						87.0%	\$422,199	\$2,195,295	\$13,309,177	\$12,984,841	-\$324,336	2.32	\$16,074,000	2,779	6,042,260	130
ome Winterproofing	CCM Savings	697,146	15,978,390	21,392,823	28,523,764	42,785,646	45%	56.0%	25.2%	\$422,199	\$2,195,295	\$6,477,200	\$5,224,730	-\$1,252,470	0.73	-\$1,357,000	1,807	698,549	1!
ulti Residential	CCM Savings	5,372,576	114,168,901	73,159,199	97,545,599	146,318,399	45%	117.0%	52.7%		. ,,_,_,0	\$3,813,296	\$4,417,079	\$603,783	3.42	\$17,430,000	959	5,343,711	114
ew Construction	Applications	N/A	13	11	14	21	10%	92.9%	9.2%			\$1,400,000	\$1,752,191	\$352,191	N/A	N/A	13		
Low Income Overh				1			l					\$1,618,681	\$1,590,841	-\$27,840					
arket Transformation									111.1%	\$605,238	\$1,135,233	\$6,882,454	\$7,486,514	\$604,060	N/A	N/A	3,103	N/A	N/A
hool Energy Competition	Schools	N/A	14	59	78	117	10%	15.8%	1.6%	\$605,238	\$1,135,233	\$500,000	\$248,768	-\$251,232	N/A	N/A	14		
in-it-Right	Participants		62	18	24	36	20%	258.3%	40.0%	\$005,250	φ1,133,233	\$315,400	\$608,623	\$293,223	N/A	N/A	62		
mprehensive Energy Management	Participants	-	5	16	24	30	20%	20.0%	4.0%			\$905,000	\$314,424	-\$590,576			5		
esidential Savings by Design	Builders		35	15	20	30	10%	175.0%	17.5%			\$3,250,000	\$4,257,045	\$1,007,045			35		
	Homes		2,956	1,634	2,179	3,269		135.7%	20.3%			\$0,200,000	¢1,207,010	\$1,007,010			2,956		
ommercial Savings by Design	Developments		31	21	2,177	42	25%	110.7%	27.7%			\$1,075,000	\$1,234,997	\$159,997			31		
Market Transformation Overh												\$837,054	\$822,657	-\$14,397					
			807,476,673							\$3,982,872	\$10,450,000		\$61,899,041	-\$1,455,046	2.27	\$101,286,000	39,574	61,791,055	1,141,
GD Rate Zone Program Total		42,226,778										¢4,000,000	* 4 055 405						
GD Rate Zone Program Total	osts	42,226,778										84 200 000	\$4 255 425	\$55 425					
Portfolio Overhead and Administrative C	osts	42,226,778										\$4,200,000 \$67,554,087	\$4,255,425 \$66,154,466	\$55,425 - \$1,399,621			•		
Portfolio Overhead and Administrative C GD Rate Zone Portfolio Total		42,226,778					•					\$4,200,000 \$67,554,087	\$4,255,425 \$66,154,466	\$55,425 -\$1,399,621					
Portfolio Overhead and Administrative C GD Rate Zone Portfolio Total Not all values may compute exactly due to round CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas.	ling.				I														
Portfolio Overhead and Administrative C GD Rate Zone Portfolio Total Not all values may compute exactly due to round CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas.	ling.			provide details for acceptat	le spending differen	ces.										1			
Portfolio Overhead and Administrative C GD Rate Zone Portfolio Total Not all values may compute exactly due to round CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas. The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spo	ling. ending to differ from the approved b	udget. Sections 6.6 and 11	2 of the Filing Guidelines	provide details for acceptat	le spending differen	ces.										1			
Portfolio Overhead and Administrative C GD Rate Zone Portfolio Total Iot all values may compute exactly due to round CM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas. The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility sponder GD Rate Zone's 2018 Resource	ding. ending to differ from the approved b e Acquisition Scorecard	udget. Sections 6.6 and 11 and Achievement Program Level	2 of the <u>Filing Guidelines</u> Metric-Level		le spending differen			Percent of	Weighted % of										
Portfolio Overhead and Administrative C D Rate Zone Portfolio Total ot all values may compute exactly due to round CM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas. The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility sponder GD Rate Zone's 2018 Resource	ling. ending to differ from the approved b	udget. Sections 6.6 and 11 and Achievement	2 of the <u>Filing Guidelines</u>	provide details for acceptat	ile spending differen Target	ces. Upper Band	Metric Weight	Percent of Target Metric Achieved	Weighted % of Scorecard Achieved										
Portfolio Overhead and Administrative C GD Rate Zone Portfolio Total Not all values may compute exactly due to round CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas. The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spo GD Rate Zone's 2018 Resource	ding. ending to differ from the approved b e Acquisition Scorecard	udget. Sections 6.6 and 11 and Achievement Program Level	2 of the <u>Filing Guidelines</u> Metric-Level	Lower Band				Target Metric	Scorecard										
Portfolio Overhead and Administrative C GD Rate Zone Portfolio Total Not all values may compute exactly due to round CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas. The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spo GD Rate Zone's 2018 Resource rogram/Offering	ding. ending to differ from the approved b e Acquisition Scorecard Metric	udget. Sections 6.6 and 11 and Achievement Program Level Savings (CCM)	2 of the <u>Filing Guidelines</u> Metric-Level Savings (CCM)	Lower Band	Target	Upper Band		Target Metric Achieved	Scorecard Achieved										
Portfolio Overhead and Administrative C 5D Rate Zone Portfolio Total Iot all values may compute exactly due to round CM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas. The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spin 6D Rate Zone's 2018 Resource rogram/Offering pommercial & Industrial Custom pommercial & Industrial Direct Install	ding. ending to differ from the approved b e Acquisition Scorecard Metric Large Volume Customer -	udget. Sections 6.6 and 11 and Achievement Program Level Savings (CCM) 323,139,650	2 of the <u>Filing Guidelines</u> Metric-Level Savings (CCM)	Lower Band	Target	Upper Band		Target Metric Achieved	Scorecard Achieved										
Portfolio Overhead and Administrative C 5D Rate Zone Portfolio Total tot all values may compute exactly due to round CM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas. The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spin 6D Rate Zone's 2018 Resource ogram/Offering mmercial & Industrial Custom mmercial & Industrial Direct Install mmercial & Industrial Prescriptive	ding. ending to differ from the approved b e Acquisition Scorecard Metric Large Volume Customer -	udget. Sections 6.6 and 11 and Achievement Program Level Savings (CCM) 323,139,650 9,186,763	2 of the <u>Filing Guidelines</u> Metric-Level Savings (CCM)	Lower Band	Target	Upper Band		Target Metric Achieved	Scorecard Achieved										
Portfolio Overhead and Administrative C D Rate Zone Portfolio Total ot all values may compute exactly due to round CM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas. The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spe CD Rate Zone's 2018 Resource ogram/Offering mmercial & Industrial Custom mmercial & Industrial Direct Install mmercial & Industrial Prescriptive mprehensive Energy Management	ding. ending to differ from the approved b e Acquisition Scorecard Metric Large Volume Customer -	udget. Sections 6.6 and 11 and Achievement Program Level Savings (CCM) 323,139,650 9,186,763	2 of the <u>Filing Guidelines</u> Metric-Level Savings (CCM)	Lower Band	Target	Upper Band		Target Metric Achieved	Scorecard Achieved										
Portfolio Overhead and Administrative C GD Rate Zone Portfolio Total Iot all values may compute exactly due to round CM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas. The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility sponder GD Rate Zone's 2018 Resource rogram/Offering pommercial & Industrial Custom pommercial & Industrial Direct Install pommercial & Industrial Prescriptive pomprehensive Energy Management tergy Leaders Initiative	ding. ending to differ from the approved b e Acquisition Scorecard Metric Large Volume Customer -	udget. Sections 6.6 and 11 and Achievement Program Level Savings (CCM) 323,139,650 9,186,763 15,642,977	2 of the <u>Filing Guidelines</u> Metric-Level Savings (CCM)	Lower Band	Target	Upper Band		Target Metric Achieved	Scorecard Achieved										
Portfolio Overhead and Administrative C GD Rate Zone Portfolio Total Not all values may compute exactly due to round CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas.	ding. ending to differ from the approved b e Acquisition Scorecard Metric Large Volume Customer -	udget. Sections 6.6 and 11 and Achievement Program Level Savings (CCM) 323,139,650 9,186,763 15,642,977 - 29,688,655	2 of the <u>Filing Guidelines</u> Metric-Level Savings (CCM)	Lower Band	Target	Upper Band		Target Metric Achieved	Scorecard Achieved										
Portfolio Overhead and Administrative C 3D Rate Zone Portfolio Total Iot all values may compute exactly due to round CM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas. The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spin 3D Rate Zone's 2018 Resource ad Construction ad Construction b Construction c Construction c Construction c Construction c Construction c C Construction c C Construction c C C Construction c C C Construction c C C C C Construction c C C C C C C C C C C C C C C C C C C C	ding. ending to differ from the approved b e Acquisition Scorecard Metric Large Volume Customer -	udget. Sections 6.6 and 11 and Achievement Program Level Savings (CCM) 323,139,650 9,186,763 15,642,977 - 29,688,655	2 of the <u>Filing Guidelines</u> Metric-Level Savings (CCM)	Lower Band 381,344,718	Target	Upper Band		Target Metric Achieved	Scorecard Achieved										
Portfolio Overhead and Administrative C GD Rate Zone Portfolio Total Iot all values may compute exactly due to round CM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas. The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spec- GD Rate Zone's 2018 Resource rogram/Offering commercial & Industrial Custom commercial & Industrial Direct Install commercial & Industrial Prescriptive comprehensive Energy Management nergy Leaders Initiative un-it-Right nall Commercial New Construction come Energy Conservation	ding. ending to differ from the approved b e Acquisition Scorecard Metric Large Volume Customer - CCM Savings	udget. Sections 6.6 and 11. and Achievement Program Level Savings (CCM) 323,139,650 9,186,763 15,642,977 - 29,688,655 129,953 -	2 of the <u>Filing Guidelines</u> Metric-Level Savings (CCM) 377,787,998	Lower Band 381,344,718	Target 508,459,624	Upper Band 762,689,436	40%	Target Metric Achieved 74.3%	Scorecard Achieved 29.7%										
Portfolio Overhead and Administrative C GD Rate Zone Portfolio Total Not all values may compute exactly due to round CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas. The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spo GD Rate Zone's 2018 Resource rogram/Offering commercial & Industrial Custom commercial & Industrial Direct Install commercial & Industrial Prescriptive comprehensive Energy Management nergy Leaders Initiative un-it-Right	ding. ending to differ from the approved b e Acquisition Scorecard Metric Large Volume Customer - CCM Savings Small Volume Customer -	udget. Sections 6.6 and 11. and Achievement Program Level Savings (CCM) 323,139,650 9,186,763 15,642,977 - 29,688,655 129,953 - 157,959,136	2 of the <u>Filing Guidelines</u> Metric-Level Savings (CCM) 377,787,998	Lower Band 381,344,718	Target 508,459,624	Upper Band 762,689,436	40%	Target Metric Achieved 74.3%	Scorecard Achieved 29.7%										
Portfolio Overhead and Administrative C GD Rate Zone Portfolio Total Iot all values may compute exactly due to round CM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas. The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility sponder GD Rate Zone's 2018 Resource rogram/Offering ommercial & Industrial Custom ommercial & Industrial Direct Install ommercial & Industrial Prescriptive omprehensive Energy Management nergy Leaders Initiative un-it-Right nall Commercial New Construction ome Energy Conservation esidential Adaptive Thermostats	ding. ending to differ from the approved b e Acquisition Scorecard Metric Large Volume Customer - CCM Savings Small Volume Customer -	udget. Sections 6.6 and 11 and Achievement Program Level Savings (CCM) 323,139,650 9,186,763 15,642,977 - 29,688,655 129,953 - 157,959,136 43,321,968 29,810,977	2 of the <u>Filing Guidelines</u> Metric-Level Savings (CCM) 377,787,998	Lower Band 381,344,718	Target 508,459,624	Upper Band 762,689,436	40%	Target Metric Achieved 74.3%	Scorecard Achieved 29.7%										
Portfolio Overhead and Administrative C 5D Rate Zone Portfolio Total tot all values may compute exactly due to round CM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas. The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spin 6D Rate Zone's 2018 Resource 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 7000 70	ding. ending to differ from the approved b e Acquisition Scorecard Metric Large Volume Customer - CCM Savings Small Volume Customer -	udget. Sections 6.6 and 11 and Achievement Program Level Savings (CCM) 323,139,650 9,186,763 15,642,977 - 29,688,655 129,953 - 157,959,136 43,321,968 29,810,977 47,596,629	2 of the <u>Filing Guidelines</u> Metric-Level Savings (CCM) 377,787,998	Lower Band 381,344,718	Target 508,459,624	Upper Band 762,689,436	40%	Target Metric Achieved 74.3%	Scorecard Achieved 29.7%										
Portfolio Overhead and Administrative C 5D Rate Zone Portfolio Total Iot all values may compute exactly due to round CM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas. The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spin 5D Rate Zone's 2018 Resource 50 GD Rat	ding. ending to differ from the approved b e Acquisition Scorecard Metric Large Volume Customer - CCM Savings Small Volume Customer -	udget. Sections 6.6 and 11 and Achievement Program Level Savings (CCM) 323,139,650 9,186,763 15,642,977 - 29,688,655 129,953 - 157,959,136 43,321,968 29,810,977	2 of the <u>Filing Guidelines</u> Metric-Level Savings (CCM) 377,787,998	Lower Band 381,344,718	Target 508,459,624	Upper Band 762,689,436	40%	Target Metric Achieved 74.3%	Scorecard Achieved 29.7%										



Filed: 2020-04-06, EB-2019-0271, Exhibit I.SEC.12, Attachment 4, Page 2 of 2

Table 1-3 is the basis but some columns have been re-ordered to accommodate additional data Columns have been added from other tables in the Annual Verification Report. These are highighted orange.

Columns have been added from other tables in the Annual Verification Report. These are highlighted orange. Participants/units and Gross Savings are not entirely available in the Annual Verification Report. This data has been taken from the Utilities' data. This may vary from the Auditor results due to rounding and inability to completely reproduce results. Differences are not material.

Union Rate Zones (2018)

Table 1-3. Union Rate Zones achievement, spend, cost effectiveness, and incentive results*†

Resource Acquisition Commercial & Industrial Custom Commercial & Industrial Direct Install Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive Home Reno Rebate Overhead and Administrative Costs	CCM Savings CCM Savings CCM Savings CCM Savings CCM Savings Participants	55,433,375 33,512,717 3,396,747 10,318,033 8,205,877 N/A	976,937,929 515,872,191 50,951,203 204,967,607 205,146,928 16,118	613,759,123	818,345,497	1,227,518,246	75%		139.6%										
Commercial & Industrial Direct Install Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive Home Reno Rebate Overhead and Administrative Costs	CCM Savings CCM Savings CCM Savings Participants	3,396,747 10,318,033 8,205,877	50,951,203 204,967,607 205,146,928	613,759,123	818,345,497	1,227,518,246	75%			\$5,809,659	\$6,642,647	\$36,633,281	\$46,146,906	\$9,513,625	2.05	\$108,537,000	19,893	105,514,281	1,809,039,3
Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive Home Reno Rebate Overhead and Administrative Costs	CCM Savings CCM Savings Participants	10,318,033 8,205,877	204,967,607 205,146,928				1070	119.4%	89.6%	\$5,809,659	\$6,642,647	\$7,808,000	\$8,379,370	\$571,370	2.46	\$59,748,000	358	82,136,252	1,318,801,7
ome Reno Rebate Overhead and Administrative Costs	CCM Savings Participants	8,205,877	205,146,928									\$2,500,000	\$1,355,104	-\$1,144,896	7.02	\$8,699,000	222	3,575,523	53,632,8
Overhead and Administrative Costs	Participants											\$7,486,000	\$4,752,739	-\$2,733,261	2.64	\$26,555,000	3,195	11,164,741	220,660,6
		N/A	16.118									\$12,226,000	\$24,194,382	\$11,968,382	1.30	\$13,536,000		8,637,765	215,944,
	ts			6,008	8,010	12,015	25%	201.2%	50.0%						N/A	N/A	16,118		1
ow Income												\$6,613,281	\$7,465,311	\$852,030					
		2,678,832	58,343,698						83.9%	\$350,811	\$2,460,797	\$13,570,954	\$10,806,455	-\$2,764,500	1.30	\$3,090,000	2,249	2,752,139	59,729,0
Home Weatherization	CCM Savings	1,278,504	31,815,336	30,755,897	41,007,862	61,511,793	60%	78.2%	46.9%	\$350,811	\$2,460,797	\$7,495,000	\$6,872,283	-\$622,717	1.04	\$289,000	1,885	1,278,623	31,816,8
Furnace End-of-Life	CCM Savings	-	-									\$924,000	\$0	-\$924,000	-	-			í
ndigenous	CCM Savings	9,932	237,038									\$511,000	\$174,604	-\$336,396	0.30	-\$123,000	61	9,941	237,1
Aulti-Family - Social & Assisted	CCM Savings	1,127,472	19,718,214	17,418,187	23,224,249	34,836,374	35%	84.9%	29.7%			\$2,984,000	\$1,985,957	-\$372,226	1.94	\$2,925,000	262	1,186,813	20,756,0
/ulti-Family - Market Rate	CCM Savings	262,924	6,573,109	3,389,095	4,518,793	6,778,190	5%	145.5%	7.3%				\$625,818				41	276,763	6,919,0
Overhead and Administrative Costs	ts											\$1,656,954	\$1,147,793	-\$509,161					
arge Volume		8,055,743	89,196,896						45.6%	\$0	\$725,313	\$4,000,000	\$2,821,881	-\$1,178,119	2.47	\$9,955,000	43	52,604,257	582,379,8
Large Volume	CCM Savings	8,055,743	89,196,896	146,795,489	195,727,318	293,590,977	100%	45.6%	45.6%	\$0	\$725,313	\$3,150,000	\$2,341,061	-\$808,939	2.47	\$9,955,000			1
Overhead and Administrative Costs	ts	•			•			•		• •		\$850,000	\$480,819	-\$369,181		-			
Market Transformation									107.1%	\$205,755	\$423,958	\$2,338,070	\$2,156,909	-\$181,161	N/A	N/A	26	N/A	N/A
Optimum Home	Builders	N/A	8	6	8	12	10%	100.0%	10.0%	\$205,755	\$423,958	\$841,000	\$847,194	\$6,194	N/A	N/A	8		
	Homes Built	1 –	83.33%	45.00%	60.00%	90.00%	30%	138.9%	41.7%										i
	% of Homes Built	1 –	3.97%	3.75%	5.00%	7.50%	10%	79.4%	7.9%										i
Commercial New Construction	New Developments	1 –	18	14	19	29	50%	94.7%	47.5%			\$1,000,000	\$988,548	-\$11,452			18		í – – – – – – – – – – – – – – – – – – –
Overhead and Administrative Costs	ts	1		• • • • •	•			•	1			\$497,070	\$321,167	-\$175,903					-
Performance Based									61.3%	\$0	\$197,285	\$1,088,000	\$694,395	-\$393,605	N/A	N/A	47	N/A	N/A
RunSmart	Participants	N/A	44	33	44	66	10%	100.0%	10.0%	\$0	\$197,285	\$193,000	\$145,265	-\$47,735	N/A	N/A	44		
	% Savings		0.51%	1.47%	1.96%	2.94%	40%	26.0%	10.4%										í
Strategic Energy Management	Participants		3	2	3	5	10%	100.0%	10.0%			\$644,000	\$357,804	-\$286,196			3		í
	% Savings	┥ ┣╴	3.86%	3.75%	5.00%	7.50%		77.2%	30.9%				,,	,					í
Overhead and Administrative Costs	ts	1 1										\$251,000	\$191,326	-\$59,674					
Jnion Rate Zones Program Total		66,167,950	1,124,478,523							\$6,366,226	\$10,450,000	\$57,630,305	\$62,626,546	\$4,996,241	2.01	\$121,582,000	22,258	160,870,677	2,451,148,24
Portfolio Overhead and Administrative (Costs											\$5,642,000	\$6,496,375	\$854,375					
Inion Rate Zones Portfolio Total												\$63,272,305	\$69,122,921	\$5,850,616					

41 *Not all values may compute exactly due to rounding.
42 tCCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas.

43 ** The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spending to differ from the approved budget. Sections 6.6 and 11.2 of the <u>Filing Guidelines</u> provide details for acceptable spending differences.

UPDATED: 2020-05-25, EB-2019-0271, Exhibit I.SEC.12, Attachment 5, Page 1 of 2

EGD Rate Zone (DRAFT 2019)

EGD Rate Zone savings, spend, cost effectiveness, and incentive results*†

Program/Offering	Metric	Draft First-Year Savings (m3)	Draft Cumulative Savings or Other Metric	Lower Band	Target	Upper Band	Metric Weight	Percent of Target Metric Achieved	Weighted % of Scorecard Achieved	DSM Shareholder Incentive	Maximum Shareholder Incentive Available	OEB-Approved Program Budget	Utility Spending**	udget/ Spending Variance	Cost Effectiveness (TRC Benefit Cost Ratio)	Net Present Value (TRC Plus)	Participants/Units	Draft Gross Annual Natural Gas Savings (m ³)	Draft Gross Cumulative Natura Gas Savings (CCM
Resource Acquisition		44,153,192	819,806,566						116.2%	\$4,166,041	\$7,013,472	\$42,056,270	\$48,382,409	\$6,326,139	2.88	\$145,362,348	34,083	67,081,990	1,220,819,6
Commercial & Industrial Custom	CCM Savings	22,213,203	404,853,785	Please see EGD Rat	te Zone DRAFT 2	019 Resource Acq	uisition Scorecard	and Achievement	table below.	\$4,166,041	\$7,013,472	\$7,508,793	\$7,318,213	-\$190,580			703	43,611,364	781,199,5
Commercial & Industrial Direct Install	CCM Savings	7,695,663	115,434,947									\$4,853,510	\$3,887,196	-\$966,314			599	8,100,698	121,510,4
Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive	CCM Savings	2,869,041	45,049,504									\$2,277,564	\$1,381,605	-\$895,959			1,169	3,117,183	49,111,
comprehensive Energy Management	CCM Savings	-	-									\$96,900		-\$96,900			-	-	
Energy Leaders Initiative	CCM Savings	-	-										\$4,600	\$4,600			-	-	
Residential Adaptive Thermostats	CCM Savings	2,346,921	35,203,822									\$2,218,500	\$1,357,609	-\$860,891			15,077	2,444,710	36,670,6
Run-it-Right	CCM Savings	322,228	1,611,139									\$1,618,946	\$217,725	-\$1,401,221			49	643,683	3,218,4
mall Commercial New Construction	CCM Savings	-	-								Γ			\$0			-	-	
lome Efficiency Retrofit	CCM Savings	8,706,135	217,653,370									\$18,360,000	\$29,420,859	\$11,060,859				9,164,352	229,108,8
	Participants	N/A	16,486														16,486		
Resource Acquisition Ove	rhead	•										\$5,122,057	\$4,794,602	-\$327,455					
ow Income		5,035,441	102,089,461						104.0%	\$1,015,093	\$2,264,127	\$13,576,837	\$13,690,519	\$113,682	1.92	\$12,793,017	1,586	5,035,441	102,089,4
Iome Winterproofing	CCM Savings	1,266,550	28,152,997	15,454,405	20,605,874	30,908,811	45%	136.6%	61.5%	\$1,015,093	\$2,264,127	\$6,605,744	\$7,141,896	\$536,152			1,432	1,266,550	28,152,9
ulti Residential	CCM Savings	3,768,891	73,936,465	76,670,782	102,227,709	153,341,564	45%	72.3%	32.5%		F	\$3,889,562	\$3,278,499	-\$611,063			143	3,768,891	73,936,4
ew Construction	Applications	N/A	11	8	11	17	10%	100.0%	10.0%			\$1,428,000	\$1,722,304	\$294,304			11		
Low Income Ove	rhead		<u> </u>						L			\$1,653,531	\$1,547,820	-\$105,711					
larket Transformation									118.6%	\$730,586	\$1,172,401	\$7,030,304	\$7,479,856	\$449,552	N/A	N/A	3,186	N/A	N/A
chool Energy Competition	Schools	N/A	32	24	32	48	10%	100.0%	10.0%	\$730,586	\$1,172,401	\$510,000	\$255,413	-\$254,587			32		
un-it-Right	Participants	-	84	27	36	54	20%	200.0%	40.0%	,		\$322,236	\$528,343	\$206,107			84		
omprehensive Energy Management	Participants	-	7	12	16	24	20%	43.8%	8.8%			\$923,100	\$223,818	-\$699,282			7		
esidential Savings by Design	Builders		39	23	30	45	10%	130.0%	13.0%		F	\$3,320,443	\$4,178,404	\$857,961			39		
	Homes		2,989	1,902	2,536	3,804	15%	117.9%	17.7%								2,989		
Commercial Savings by Design	Developments		35	23	30	45	25%	116.7%	29.2%		F	\$1,098,300	\$1,492,392	\$394,092			35		
Market Transformation Ove			ļ						I			\$856,225	\$801,486	-\$54,739					
GD Rate Zone Program Total		49,188,633	921,896,028							\$5,911,720	\$10,450,000	\$62,663,411	\$69,552,784	\$6,889,373	2.70	\$156,801,666	38,855	72,117,431	1,322,909,0
Portfolio Overhead and Administrative	Costs											\$3,758,362	\$3,290,656	-\$467,706					
EGD Rate Zone Portfolio Total												\$66,421,773	\$72,843,440	\$6,421,667					
*Not all values may compute exactly due to rou	nung.																		
†CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural ga **The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility s	s. pending to differ from the approved l			provide details for acceptab	le spending differen	ices.													
CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural ga *The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility s EGD Rate Zone DRAFT 2019 Re	s. pending to differ from the approved l	ecard and Achieve	ement Metric-Level	provide details for acceptab	ble spending differen	ices.		Percent of	Weighted % of										
CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gates of the observation of	s. pending to differ from the approved l	ecard and Achiev	ement	provide details for acceptab	ole spending differen	uces. Upper Band	Metric Weight	Target Metric	Scorecard										
CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gates. The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility set of the DEB's DSM framework allows for utility set of the DEB's DSM framework allows for utility set of the DEB's DSM framework allows for utility set of the DEB's DSM framework allows for utility set of the DEB's DSM framework allows for utility set of the DEB's DSM framework allows for utility set of the DEB's DSM framework allows for utility set of the DEB's DSM framework allows for utility set of the DEB's DSM framework allows for utility set of the DEB's DSM framework allows for utility set of the DEB's DSM framework allows for utility set of the DEB's DSM framework allows for utility set of the DEB's DSM framework allows for utility set of the DEB's DSM framework allows for utility set of the DEB's DSM framework allows for utility set	s. pending to differ from the approved l esource Acquisition Scor Metric	recard and Achieve Program Level Savings (CCM)	ement Metric-Level Savings (CCM)	Lower Band	Target	Upper Band		Target Metric Achieved	Scorecard Achieved										
CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural ga **The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility s EGD Rate Zone DRAFT 2019 Re Program/Offering Commercial & Industrial Custom	s. pending to differ from the approved b esource Acquisition Scor Metric Large Volume Customer -	Program Level Savings (CCM) 393,850,734	ement Metric-Level	Lower Band				Target Metric	Scorecard										
CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural ga *The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility s EGD Rate Zone DRAFT 2019 Re Program/Offering Commercial & Industrial Custom Commercial & Industrial Direct Install	s. pending to differ from the approved l esource Acquisition Scor Metric	Program Level Savings (CCM) 393,850,734 42,896,376	ement Metric-Level Savings (CCM)	Lower Band	Target	Upper Band		Target Metric Achieved	Scorecard Achieved										
tCCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural ga **The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility s EGD Rate Zone DRAFT 2019 Re Program/Offering Commercial & Industrial Custom Commercial & Industrial Direct Install Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive	s. pending to differ from the approved b esource Acquisition Scor Metric Large Volume Customer -	Program Level Savings (CCM) 393,850,734	ement Metric-Level Savings (CCM)	Lower Band	Target	Upper Band		Target Metric Achieved	Scorecard Achieved										
CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural ga *The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility s EGD Rate Zone DRAFT 2019 Re Program/Offering Commercial & Industrial Custom Commercial & Industrial Direct Install Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive Comprehensive Energy Management	s. pending to differ from the approved b esource Acquisition Scor Metric Large Volume Customer -	Program Level Savings (CCM) 393,850,734 42,896,376	ement Metric-Level Savings (CCM)	Lower Band	Target	Upper Band		Target Metric Achieved	Scorecard Achieved										
CCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural ga **The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility s EGD Rate Zone DRAFT 2019 Re Program/Offering Commercial & Industrial Custom Commercial & Industrial Direct Install Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive Comprehensive Energy Management Energy Leaders Initiative	s. pending to differ from the approved b esource Acquisition Scor Metric Large Volume Customer -	Program Level Savings (CCM) 393,850,734 42,896,376 18,341,286 -	ement Metric-Level Savings (CCM)	Lower Band	Target	Upper Band		Target Metric Achieved	Scorecard Achieved										
tCCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural ga **The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility s EGD Rate Zone DRAFT 2019 Re Program/Offering Commercial & Industrial Custom Commercial & Industrial Direct Install Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive Comprehensive Energy Management Energy Leaders Initiative Run-it-Right	s. pending to differ from the approved b esource Acquisition Scor Metric Large Volume Customer -	Program Level Savings (CCM) 393,850,734 42,896,376	ement Metric-Level Savings (CCM)	Lower Band	Target	Upper Band		Target Metric Achieved	Scorecard Achieved										
tCCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural ga **The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility s EGD Rate Zone DRAFT 2019 Re Program/Offering Commercial & Industrial Custom Commercial & Industrial Direct Install Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive Comprehensive Energy Management Energy Leaders Initiative Run-it-Right	s. pending to differ from the approved b esource Acquisition Scor Metric Large Volume Customer -	Program Level Savings (CCM) 393,850,734 42,896,376 18,341,286 -	ement Metric-Level Savings (CCM)	Lower Band	Target	Upper Band		Target Metric Achieved	Scorecard Achieved										
tCCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural ga **The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility s EGD Rate Zone DRAFT 2019 Ref Program/Offering Commercial & Industrial Custom Commercial & Industrial Direct Install Commercial & Industrial Direct Install Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive Comprehensive Energy Management Energy Leaders Initiative Run-it-Right Small Commercial New Construction Home Efficiency Rebate	s. pending to differ from the approved I esource Acquisition Scor Metric Large Volume Customer - CCM Savings Small Volume Customer -	Program Level Savings (CCM) 393,850,734 42,896,376 18,341,286 - 1,611,139 217,653,370	ement Metric-Level Savings (CCM)	Lower Band 326,535,064	Target	Upper Band	40%	Target Metric Achieved	Scorecard Achieved										
tCCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural ga **The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility s EGD Rate Zone DRAFT 2019 Re Program/Offering Commercial & Industrial Custom Commercial & Industrial Direct Install Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive Comprehensive Energy Management Energy Leaders Initiative Run-it-Right Small Commercial New Construction Home Efficiency Rebate	s. pending to differ from the approved I esource Acquisition Scor Metric Large Volume Customer - CCM Savings	Program Level Savings (CCM) 393,850,734 42,896,376 18,341,286 - 1,611,139 -	ement Metric-Level Savings (CCM) 456,699,534	Lower Band 326,535,064	Target 435,380,086	Upper Band 653,070,128	40%	Target Metric Achieved 104.9%	Scorecard Achieved 42.0%										
tCCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural ga **The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility s EGD Rate Zone DRAFT 2019 Re Program/Offering Commercial & Industrial Custom Commercial & Industrial Direct Install Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive Comprehensive Energy Management Energy Leaders Initiative Run-it-Right Small Commercial New Construction Home Efficiency Rebate Residential Adaptive Thermostats	s. pending to differ from the approved I esource Acquisition Scor Metric Large Volume Customer - CCM Savings Small Volume Customer -	Program Level Savings (CCM) 393,850,734 42,896,376 18,341,286 - 1,611,139 217,653,370	ement Metric-Level Savings (CCM) 456,699,534	Lower Band 326,535,064	Target 435,380,086	Upper Band 653,070,128	40%	Target Metric Achieved 104.9%	Scorecard Achieved 42.0%										
tCCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural ga **The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility s EGD Rate Zone DRAFT 2019 Re Program/Offering Commercial & Industrial Custom Commercial & Industrial Direct Install Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive Comprehensive Energy Management Energy Leaders Initiative Run-it-Right Small Commercial New Construction Home Efficiency Rebate Residential Adaptive Thermostats Commercial & Industrial Custom	s. pending to differ from the approved I esource Acquisition Scor Metric Large Volume Customer - CCM Savings Small Volume Customer -	Program Level Savings (CCM) 393,850,734 42,896,376 18,341,286 - 1,611,139 217,653,370 35,203,822	ement Metric-Level Savings (CCM) 456,699,534	Lower Band 326,535,064	Target 435,380,086	Upper Band 653,070,128	40%	Target Metric Achieved 104.9%	Scorecard Achieved 42.0%										
Figure 2010 Figure 2010 Commercial & Industrial Custom Commercial & Industrial Custom Commercial & Industrial Direct Install Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive Comprehensive Energy Management Energy Leaders Initiative Run-it-Right Small Commercial & Industrial Custom Home Efficiency Rebate Residential Adaptive Thermostats Commercial & Industrial Custom	s. pending to differ from the approved I esource Acquisition Scor Metric Large Volume Customer - CCM Savings Small Volume Customer -	Program Level Savings (CCM) 393,850,734 42,896,376 18,341,286 - 1,611,139 - 217,653,370 35,203,822 11,003,051	ement Metric-Level Savings (CCM) 456,699,534	Lower Band 326,535,064	Target 435,380,086	Upper Band 653,070,128	40%	Target Metric Achieved 104.9%	Scorecard Achieved 42.0%										
tCCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural ga **The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility s EGD Rate Zone DRAFT 2019 Re Program/Offering Commercial & Industrial Custom Commercial & Industrial Direct Install Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive Comprehensive Energy Management Energy Leaders Initiative Run-it-Right Small Commercial New Construction Home Efficiency Rebate Residential Adaptive Thermostats Commercial & Industrial Custom Commercial & Industrial Custom Commercial & Industrial Custom Commercial & Industrial Custom	s. pending to differ from the approved I esource Acquisition Scor Metric Large Volume Customer - CCM Savings Small Volume Customer -	Program Level Savings (CCM) 393,850,734 42,896,376 18,341,286 - 1,611,139 217,653,370 35,203,822 11,003,051 72,538,571	ement Metric-Level Savings (CCM) 456,699,534	Lower Band 326,535,064	Target 435,380,086	Upper Band 653,070,128	40%	Target Metric Achieved 104.9%	Scorecard Achieved 42.0%										



UPDATED: 2020-05-25, EB-2019-0271, Exhibit I.SEC.12, Attachment 5, Page 2 of 2

Union Rate Zones (DRAFT 2019)

Union Rate Zones achievement, spend, cost effectiveness, and incentive results*†

Program/Offering	Metric	Draft First-Year Savings (m3)	Draft Cumulative Savings or Other Metric	Lower Band	Target	Upper Band	Metric Weight	Percent of Target Metric Achieved	Weighted % of Scorecard Achieved	DSM Shareholder Incentive	Maximum Shareholder Incentive Available	OEB- Approved Program Budget	Utility Spending**	Budget/ Spending Variance	Cost Effectiveness (TRC Benefit Cost Ratio)	Net Present Value (TRC Plus)	Participants/Units	Draft Gross Annual Natural Gas Savings (m ³)	Draft Gross Cumulative Natur Gas Savings (CCN
Resource Acquisition		55,337,645	967,385,296						130.0%	\$5,007,955	\$6,584,609	\$36,310,983	\$40,581,858	\$4,270,875	2.48	\$129,029,880	17,942	113,058,378	1,965,351,2
Commercial & Industrial Custom	CCM Savings	36,781,872	595,312,464	560,567,790	747,423,720	1,121,135,581	75%	129.4%	97.1%	\$5,007,955	\$6,584,609	\$7,808,000	\$8,865,926	\$1,057,926	3.10	\$115,906,064	399	93,328,715	1,570,477,9
Commercial & Industrial Direct Install	CCM Savings	4,852,657	72,789,855									\$2,500,000	\$2,011,911	-\$488,089			300	5,108,060	76,620,9
Commercial & Industrial Prescriptive	CCM Savings	6,952,335	136,124,416									\$7,149,000	\$3,242,754	-\$3,906,246			2,480	7,521,670	146,598,
esidential Adaptive Thermostats	CCM Savings	561,096	8,416,434									\$0	\$550,816	\$550,816	1.41	\$13,123,816	3,805	584,475	8,767,
ome Reno Rebate	CCM Savings	6,189,685	154,742,128									\$12,226,000	\$19,815,812	\$7,589,812				6,515,458	162,886,
	Participants	N/A	10,958	6,231	8,308	12,462	25%	131.9%	33.0%								10,958		
Overhead and Administrative C	osts											\$6,627,983	\$6,094,638	-\$533,345					
ow Income		3,641,030	80,501,296						116.2%	\$1,524,391	\$2,564,994	\$14,144,719	\$13,367,910	-\$776,809	1.62	\$7,700,884	7,957	3,713,052	81,911,3
Iome Weatherization	CCM Savings	2,305,558	53,928,316	32,841,561	43,788,748	65,683,123	60%	124.6%	74.7%	\$1,524,391	\$2,564,994	\$8,063,000	\$9,254,777	\$1,191,777			7,298	2,309,099	53,979,3
urnace End-of-Life	CCM Savings	5,922	106,596									\$919,000	\$36075	-\$882,925			111	5922	106
ndigenous	CCM Savings	22,111	514,326									\$456,000	\$327,899	-\$128,101			221	22,140	514,
lulti-Family - Social & Assisted	CCM Savings	1,137,876	21,754,896	14,988,030	19,984,040	29,976,060	35%	108.9%	38.1%			\$3,031,000	\$2,598,715	-\$432,285			262	1,197,675	22,898,
ulti-Family - Market Rate	CCM Savings	169,562	4,197,162	4,703,219	6,270,958	9,406,437	5%	66.9%	3.3%								65	178,216	4,412,
Overhead and Administrative C	osts											\$1,675,719	\$1,150,443	-\$525,276					
arge Volume		8,270,053	80,002,423						58.1%	\$0	\$725,357	\$4,000,000	\$3,088,606	-\$911,394	2.72	\$10,215,943	47	54,017,329	522,550,1
_arge Volume	CCM Savings	8,270,053	80,002,423	103,250,094	137,666,792	206,500,188	100%	58.1%	58.1%	\$0	\$725,357	\$3,150,000	\$2,684,610	-\$465,390			47	54,017,329	522,550,1
Overhead and Administrative C	osts											\$850,000	\$403,996	-\$446,004					
Market Transformation									137.7%	\$361,543	\$423,984	\$2,338,070	\$2,241,994	-\$96,076	N/A	N/A	26	N/A	N/A
Optimum Home	Builders	N/A	4	3	4	6	10%	100.0%	10.0%	\$361,543	\$423,984	\$841,000	\$817,193	-\$23,807			4		
	Homes Built		95.45%	68.00%	90.00%	100.00%	10%	127.3%	12.7%	,		,		, .,					
	% of Homes Built		28.12%	3.25%	4.34%	6.50%	30%	200.0%	60.0%										
Commercial New Construction	New Developments		22	15	20	30	50%	110.0%	55.0%			\$1,000,000	\$924,147	-\$75,853			22		
Overhead and Administrative C	osts		•	•				•				\$497,070	\$500,654	\$3,584					
Performance Based									30.8%	\$0	\$151,056	\$833,000	\$579,846	-\$253,154	0.01	-\$535,205	100	N/A	N/A
RunSmart	Participants	N/A	59	42	56	84	10%	105.4%	10.5%	\$0	\$151,056	\$582,000	\$153,632	-\$119,361			59		
	% Savings	_	0.35%	0.52%	0.70%	1.05%	40%	50.6%	20.2%		, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,			, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,			41		
Strategic Energy Management	% Savings		0.00%	3.56%	4.75%	7.12%	50%	0.0%	0.0%				\$309,007						
Overhead and Administrative C	osts	I		I					•	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		\$251,000	\$117,207	-\$133,793		•			
nion Rate Zones Program Total		67,248,728	1,127,889,015							\$6,893,889	\$10,450,000	\$57,626,772	\$59,860,214	\$2,233,442	2.27	\$141,376,182	26,072	170,788,759	2,569,812,7
ortfolio Overhead and Administrativ	ve Costs											\$5,642,000	\$5,744,092	\$102,092					
														\$2,335,534					

*Not all values may compute exactly due to rounding.
 tCCM are cumulative cubic meters of natural gas.
 ** The OEB's DSM Framework allows for utility spending to differ from the approved budget. Sections 6.6 and 11.2 of the <u>Filing Guidelines</u> provide details for acceptable spending differences.